



Board Direction

Ref: PA 0024

The submissions on this file and the Inspector's report were considered at a series of Board meetings, comprising all Board Members, held on the 7th, 8th, 9th and 16th of February, 2012.

At a further meeting on the 20th of February, 2012, the Board decided by a 3:1 majority, to refuse permission generally in accordance with the Inspector's recommendation, for the draft reasons and considerations as set out below.

DRAFT REASONS AND CONSIDERATIONS

The proposed Children's Hospital of Ireland, by its nature, requires a substantial floor area, in excess of 100,000 square metres, to accommodate the operational needs of the hospital. However the footprint afforded to the proposed development on the Mater Campus, (circa 2 hectares), has resulted in a proposal for a very significant building in terms of bulk and height, including a 164 metre long ward block, rising to 74 metres above ground. Notwithstanding the general acceptability of the proposal in terms of medical co-location on this inner city hospital site, it is considered that the proposed development, by reason of its height, scale, form and mass, located on this elevated site, would result in a dominant, visually incongruous structure and would have a profound negative impact on the appearance and visual amenity of the city skyline. The proposed development would contravene policy SC18 of the Dublin City Development Plan, 2011-2017, which seeks to protect and enhance the skyline of the inner city and to ensure that all proposals for mid-rise and taller buildings make a positive contribution to the urban character of the city.

Furthermore, the development as proposed, notwithstanding the quality of the design, would be inconsistent with and adversely affect the existing scale and character of the historic city and the established character of the local area and would seriously detract from the setting and character of protected structures, streetscapes and areas of conservation value, and in particular, the vistas of O'Connell Street and North Great George's Street.

Having regard to the site masterplan for the Mater Campus submitted with this application, it is also considered that the proposed development as configured, would constitute overdevelopment of the site.

The proposed development would, therefore, be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Note: The Board noted that the Inspector had recommended a number of additional reasons for refusal of the proposed development.

In respect of recommended reason No. 1, the Board had regard to the Phibsborough/Mountjoy Local Area Plan 2008, which provides for a children's hospital on the Mater Campus, and considered that the Local Area Plan was sufficiently flexible in relation to development options for this site and therefore did not agree with the Inspector that the proposed development would contravene this plan.

The Board's considerations in relation to recommended reasons Nos 2 and 3 are encapsulated in the reason for refusal.

In regard to recommended reason No. 4, the Board considered, given the central and accessible location of the site, that the quantum of car parking proposed, subject to operational management measures, would be acceptable.

COSTS

The Board determined that the costs to be paid by the applicant to ABP should be €101,691 and €12,894 to Dublin City County Council. The Board determined that a contribution of €13,852.50 be paid to third parties as set out in the following table, having regard to the contribution these parties made to the deliberations and considerations of the Board, as reflected generally in the decision, as set out above.

	Name of Person	
(1)	Tony Barry and others	€5,000.00
(2)	Mountjoy Square Society	€6,000.00
(3)	Aileen Morris	€62.50
(4)	Blend Residents Association	€192.00
(5)	Rita White and Terry Mallin	€61.00
(6)	New Children's Hospital Alliance	€2,500.00
(7)	Mary W. Gallagher	€37.00

Please issue a copy of this direction with the order.

Board Member: _____
Mary Mac Mahon

Date: 20th February, 2011