

Board Order ABP-300828-18

Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2018 Planning Authority: Dublin City Council Planning Register Reference Number: 4194/17

APPEAL by Deck Building Services DAC care of Thornton O'Connor Town Planning Limited of Number 1 Kilmacud Road Upper, Dundrum, Dublin against the decision made on the 9th day of January, 2018 by Dublin City Council to refuse permission to the said Deck Building Services DAC.

Proposed Development The change of use of the Protected Structure (562 square metres) from existing commercial use to use as an Aparthotel, addition of platform lift, demolition of existing 277 square metres single storey light industrial building at rear of site, and construction of 556 square metres two and three-storey extension with glazed link and lift, all to provide a total of 28 number aparthotel rooms, comprised of 10 number rooms in the existing structure and 18 number rooms in the proposed new structure, and ancillary guest and staff facilities, screened refuse enclosure and secure parking for six number bicycles; works to include the removal of miscellaneous non-original elements and redundant services, reinstatement and renovation of existing features, internal alterations and provision of mechanical and electrical services throughout; addition of mechanical plant at basement and ground floor levels; removal of existing wcs, the lowering of ground and first floor levels and the inclusion of additional opes to provide level access at rear return of the protected structures; connection to all existing foul and surface

water services; and all associated minor or ancillary site and development works to be carried out in accordance with conservation principles, all at 42 and 43 Blessington Street and rear of 42 and 43 Blessington Street, Dublin with frontage onto Blessington Lane, Dublin (Protected Structures).

Decision

REFUSE permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the reasons and considerations set out below.

Matters Considered

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

Reasons and Considerations

1. The proposed development provides for aparthotel units which are minimal in size, containing kitchens and bathrooms but no seating or dining space, with an inadequate mix of unit types and sizes, resulting in an over-intensive use in the two protected structures and a poor standard of amenity for occupants. The proposed works to facilitate aparthotel use would also have an adverse impact on the character of the protected structures on the site, by reason of the proposed alterations to the original plan form and the intensification of drainage, plumbing and ventilation services and associated fire safety services and structural upgrade works necessary to provide bathroom and kitchen accommodation for each aparthotel unit. The proposed development would, therefore, be detrimental to the character and structural integrity of the two protected structures and contrary to the provisions of the "Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities" issued by the Department of Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht in October 2011, the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 and to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

2. The proposed new two-storey and three-storey extension occupying the majority of the rear site would seriously compromise and adversely affect the architectural significance and setting of the protected structures and adjoining terrace, leaving almost no external space for the amenity of the buildings, contrary to Policy CHC2(d) of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 which states that 'the design, form, scale, height, proportions, siting and materials of new development should relate to and complement the special character of the protected structure'. The scale and bulk of the proposed extension would also adversely impact on the residential amenities and privacy of adjoining dwellings, and would set an undesirable precedent for extensions of a similar scale to protected structures in the vicinity which would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

In deciding not to accept the Inspector's recommendation to grant permission, the Board concurred with the planning authority.

> Michelle Fagan Member of An Bord Pleanála duly authorised to authenticate the seal of the Board.

Dated this day of 2018.