



Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2018

Planning Authority: Dublin City Council

Planning Register Reference Number: 4650/18

APPEAL by Capital Estate Management Limited care of BMA Planning of Taney Hall, Eglington Terrace, Dundrum, Dublin against the decision made on the 19th day of February, 2019 by Dublin City Council to refuse permission to Capital Estate Management Limited.

Proposed Development Permission for development on this site (0.0634 hectares) within the existing interlinked four-storey over basement properties at 6, 7, 8 and 9 College Street, 28, 29-30 and 31 Fleet Street, Dublin (premises comprising The Irish Yeast Company, Barbers Room and Times Hostel buildings on College Street, Bowes public house and adjoining vacant unit on Fleet Street and Doyles public house on the corner of College Street and Fleet Street). 6, 7 and 8 College Street and 28, 29-30 and 31 Fleet Street are all Protected Structures. The proposed development comprises demolition of existing two-storey return to the rear of 6 College Street and 29-30 Fleet Street and change of use and extension of the ground, first, second and third floors of 6 College Street and modifications to part of the permitted licensed cafe/bar (planning register reference number 3397/15) at ground floor and basement levels of 29-30 Fleet Street to provide for an extension of the public house use at ground floor and basement levels at 31 Fleet Street and an

extension of the first, second and third floor levels of the hostel use accessed from 8 College Street (Times Hostel). The development will consist of the following: Basement Level: - Reconfiguration and alterations to existing internal doors, walls and stairs and provision of partitions to facilitate installation of toilet facilities and associated stairs access within 29-30 Fleet Street to serve the adjoining Bowes public house at 31 Fleet Street. The residual basement area of 29-30 Fleet Street will remain within the demise of Doyle's public house. Ground Floor Level: - Reconfiguration and alterations to existing doors, walls and partitions to provide for an extension of existing public house at 31 Fleet Street into the adjoining 6 College Street and 29-30 Fleet Street to accommodate additional bar and accessible toilet areas and provision of stairs access to the basement level of 29-30 Fleet Street. First, Second and Third Floor Levels: - Reconfiguration and alterations to existing doors, walls and partitions within 6 College Street and 31 Fleet Street and extension into the existing internal courtyard area and to the rear of 31 Fleet Street to provide nine number hostel dormitories (three per floor) accessed from the existing first, second and third floor hostel accommodation within 31 Fleet Street. The proposed development will result in an increase in the gross floor area of the Bowes public house from 142 square metres to 336 square metres, an increase in the gross floor area of the Times Hostel premises from 1,016 square metres to 1,214 square metres, a decrease in the gross floor area of the permitted cafe/bar at ground floor level within 29-30 Fleet Street from 78 square metres to 68 square metres and a decrease in the gross floor area of Doyle's public house from 812 square metres to 743 square metres. Permission is also sought for cleaning and refurbishment of the existing building facade, shopfront and signage to 6 College Street and all associated site and development works, all at 6, 7, 8 and 9, College Street and 28, 29-30 and 31 Fleet Street, Dublin.

Decision

REFUSE permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the reasons and considerations set out below.

Matters Considered

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

Reasons and Considerations

1. It is the policy of Dublin City Council, as set out in Policy CHC2 of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022, to ensure that the special interests of protected structures are protected and that any proposals for redevelopment be highly sensitive to the historic fabric and special interest of the interior including its plan, form and hierarchy of spaces. It is considered that the proposed works to be undertaken, which would involve significant breaches through party walls, together with the demolition of internal walls, primarily between Number 6 College Street and Number 31 Fleet Street, would give rise to an unacceptable loss of historic fabric and legibility and would, therefore, contravene Policy CHC2(c) of the Development Plan. The proposed development would have an irreversible detrimental and seriously injurious impact on the historic fabric, plan, form, integrity and architectural character of these two important Protected Structures. The proposed development would, therefore, be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

2. Having regard to Section 11.1.5.1 and Policy CHC2 of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022, it is considered that the proposed development would seriously injure the special architectural and historic character and integrity of the adjacent significant Protected Structures. The proposed extension and lightwell to the rear of Number 31 Fleet Street would have an unacceptable and adverse impact on the setting and architectural character of that Protected Structure (Number 31). Furthermore, the proposed extensions above and to the east of the existing rear return to Number 6 College Street, would have an unacceptable and adverse impact on the setting and architectural character of the Protected Structures at Numbers 29 and 30 Fleet Street and Number 7 College Street. The proposed development would, therefore, be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Terry Prendergast
Member of An Bord Pleanála
duly authorised to authenticate
the seal of the Board.

Dated this day of 2019.