

# Board Order ABP-305905-19

# Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2019 Planning Authority: Kildare County Council

**Application** for permission under section 4 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, in accordance with plans and particulars, lodged with An Bord Pleanála on the 14<sup>th</sup> day of November 2019 by Westar Investments Limited care of Hughes Planning and Development Consultants, 70 Pearse Street, Dublin.

#### Proposed Development

A planning permission for a strategic housing development on lands at Capdoo and Abbeylands, Clane, Co. Kildare, located west of the River Liffey, east of the Brooklands Housing Estate and north of the Abbey Park and Alexandra Walk Housing Estates.

The proposed development will consist of the following:

- (i) construction of 305 number residential dwellings, comprising 112 number houses, 20 number maisonette units, 139 number apartments in four number blocks varying from three to four storeys in height (Block C being four storeys, Block D being three storeys, Block F being four storeys and Block L being four storeys) and 34 number duplex units in eight number three-storey blocks;
- (ii) construction of a 340 square metres childcare facility (part of the ground floor of Apartment Block D) adjacent to the site's westernmost entrance (off the Brooklands Residential Estate) with capacity for up to 50 number children. The

childcare facility is provided with 18 number car parking spaces and eight number bicycle parking spaces for drop-off and staff parking;

- (iii) construction of a 1.88-hectare linear park adjacent to the River Liffey;
- (iv) provision of three number vehicular/pedestrian accesses (with associated works to footpaths and verges), two number off the Brooklands Housing Estate Road and one number off Alexandra Walk, and provision of one number pedestrian only access (with associated works to footpaths and verges) off the Brooklands Housing Estate Road; and
- (v) all associated site, landscaping and infrastructural works, including foul and surface water drainage, lighting, attenuation areas, bin storage, open space areas, boundary walls and fences, internal roads and cycle paths/footpaths.

The 305 number residential dwellings consist of the following:

- 1 number one-bedroom apartments (Block C);
- 12 number one-bedroom own door maisonette (Types J, K, L & M);
- 103 number two-bedroom apartments (Block C, D, F & L);
- 8 number two-bedroom maisonette (Types N, ND, O & OD);
- 34 number two-bedroom own door apartments (Types G & GD);
- 1 number three-bedroom apartments (Block C);
- 34 number three-bedroom own door duplex apartments (Types H & HD);
- 20 number two-bedroom mid-terrace houses (Types F);
- 34 number three-bedroom semi-detached houses (Types B, BD, D & DD);
- 14 number three-bedroom end of terrace houses (Types E & ED); and
- 44 number four-bedroom semi-detached houses (Types A & AD).

A total of 553 number car parking spaces are proposed, including 224 number spaces (two number on curtilage spaces per dwelling) serving the proposed dwellings, 256 number spaces serving the proposed apartments/maisonette units/duplex units; 55 number spaces serving visitors to the development; and 18 number spaces serving the proposed childcare facility. The primary access to the proposed development will be via the Brooklands Residential Estate and a secondary access is provided via Alexandra Walk.

A total of 508 number bicycle parking spaces are proposed, including 500 number spaces serving the proposed apartments/maisonette units/duplex units and eight number spaces serving the proposed childcare facility.

The development also features 3.15 hectares of public open space, including 14 number public open space areas throughout the development and a 1.88-hectare linear park provided adjacent to the River Liffey. The proposed public open space features existing established hedgerows, landscaping and tree planting, public seating, play spaces and pocket parks and a fitness trail.

#### Decision

Refuse permission for the above proposed development based on the reasons and considerations set out below.

## **Matters Considered**

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

## **Reasons and Considerations**

The "Urban Design Manual – a Best Practice Guide" issued by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in 2009, to accompany the Guidelines for Planning Authorities on Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas includes key criteria such as context, connections, inclusivity, variety and distinctiveness. It is considered that the proposed development is dominated by roads and surface car parking and results in a poor design concept for the site that is substandard in its form and layout, fails to establish a sense of place, would result in

a substandard form of development that lacks variety and distinctiveness and includes a poor quality of urban and architectural design, all of which would be seriously injurious to the residential amenities of future occupants and contrary to the provisions of the Urban Design Manual – a Best Practice Guide in particular criteria number 6 Distinctiveness and number 7 Layout and to Policy HD 1 and Objective HDO 2 of the Kildare County Development Plan 2017-2023.

In addition, the development fails to respond satisfactorily to the requirements of the Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets issued by the Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport, and the Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government in 2013 as it does not promote a high quality street layout that priorities people rather than vehicular movement.

It is also considered that the development fails to integrate existing hedgerows satisfactorily into the layout of the development and, as such, would be contrary to objective GIO1.4 of the Clane Local Area Plan 2017-2023 which seeks to integrate hedgerows and trees into the design of new development.

The proposed development would, therefore, seriously injure the residential amenities of future occupants, would be contrary to these Ministerial Guidelines and would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Terry Prendergast Member of An Bord Pleanála duly authorised to authenticate the seal of the Board.

Dated this day of 2020