



Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2019

Planning Authority: Dublin City Council

Planning Register Reference Number: 3164/19

APPEAL by Frank McDonald of 4 The Granary, 20 Temple Lane, Dublin on behalf of Temple Bar Residents against the decision made on the 24th day of October, 2019 by Dublin City Council to grant subject to conditions a permission to Sandra Doone care of Manahan Planners of 38 Dawson Street, Dublin.

Proposed Development: Demolition of the existing two-storey over basement building, currently in use for retail with ancillary storage and construction of a new four-storey over ground floor and basement building (six storeys in all). The ground floor and basement will be in retail use while the upper floors will be in use as boutique hotel. Part of the ground floor will provide a reception for the proposed hotel on the upper floors. An ATM is proposed at ground floor facing into Temple Bar Square, all at 1-4 Merchant's Arch/15 Temple Bar, Dublin.

Decision

REFUSE permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the reasons and considerations set out below.

Matters Considered

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

Reasons and Considerations

- 1 It is considered that the proposed development, by reason of its height relative to surrounding buildings, scale, massing and bulk at this prominent site, would constitute overdevelopment of the site and would be out of character with the pattern of development in the vicinity. The proposed development would, therefore, seriously injure the visual amenities of the area and be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

- 2 The proposed development of a part four, part five storey over basement building on a narrow plot, adjoining and bounding a narrow busy laneway, does not integrate well into Temple Bar Square where the prevailing height is three-storey. The subject plot is insufficiently wide to accommodate a building greater than three storeys. The subject site does not read as a traditional corner plot wherein a higher building can create a landmark feature. The proposed largely blank elevation onto Temple Bar Square, with a lack of fenestration on the first and second floors and the use of a double height window from the fourth and fifth floors, at the end of the vista leading from the Central Bank down Crown Alley is visually discordant. It is considered, therefore, that the proposed development is contrary to the policy (Policy CHC4) of the current development plan for the area to protect Conservation Areas.

- 3 It is considered that the proposed development of a single large retail unit at ground floor level, to replace a series of smaller retail premises fronting onto Merchants Arch, would have a detrimental impact on the scale, urban grain and vibrancy of the area. In considering this issue, the Board had regard to the Z5 zoning objective for the area as provided for in the Dublin City Development Plan, 2016-2022, which is to consolidate and facilitate the development of the central area, and to identify, reinforce, strengthen and protect its civic design character and dignity, and considered that the loss of the existing mix of small-scale commercial units which contribute to the existing vibrancy and character of the Temple Bar area would not be in accordance with the zoning provisions for the area. The proposed development would, therefore, be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Maria FitzGerald

Member of An Bord Pleanála

**duly authorised to authenticate
the seal of the Board.**

Dated this day of 2020.