

# Board Order ABP-306837-20

# Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2019

**Planning Authority: Dublin City Council** 

**Application** for permission under section 4 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, in accordance with plans and particulars, lodged with An Bord Pleanála on the 9<sup>th</sup> day of March 2020 by Trinity College Dublin care of Reddy Architecture and Urbanism, Dartry Mills, Dartry Road, Dublin 6.

## **Proposed Development**

A planning permission for a strategic housing development at Cunningham House, Trinity Hall, Dartry, Dublin 6.

The application site includes Cunningham House and existing sports hall (abutting Oldham House, a protected structure) and is generally bound to the west and north by the existing Trinity Hall Campus, to the east by the boundary with the Temple Square development and to the south by Temple Road. The site excludes Greenane House (a protected structure) but includes the area immediately adjoining the House. The application site also includes a small parcel of land located adjacent to the existing vehicular access from Dartry Road and the existing electrical substation located to the north-east of Purser House (a protected structure) all within the main Trinity Hall campus.

The proposed development will consist of an extension to existing purpose-built student accommodation at Trinity Hall with an overall gross floor area of approximately 10,982 square metres (over a part lower ground floor level plant area

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 1 of 15

of 55 square metres gross floor area) providing a total of 358 number purpose-built student bed spaces together with complementary and ancillary uses. The proposed development consists of:

- Demolition of Cunningham House, the sports hall (including the removal of existing part basement of 104 square metres), the eastern section of the existing rear boundary wall and associated single storey ancillary sheds within the curtilage of Greenane House (a protected structure) (circa 2,864 square metres total gross floor area to be demolished).
- Provision of four number connected blocks arranged in a quadrangle form:
   Block A ranges in height from four to eight storeys; Block B is four storeys in height; Block C is three storeys in height while the Forum Block is single storey in height (partially double height space rising to a maximum height of 9.6 metres above adjoining ground level).
- 358 number purpose-built student bed spaces comprising of 11 number five-bedroom units; four number six-bedroom units; one number sevenbedroom unit and 34 number eight-bedroom units together with ancillary student amenity spaces.
- Four number staff apartments (three number two-bedroom apartments and one number three-bedroom apartment) with winter-gardens/balconies on south elevation of Block A and north and west elevation of Block C.
- Two number study spaces/classrooms providing a total of 68 square metres gross floor area.
- A replacement multi-use sports hall, together with the adjoining forum amenity space, resulting in a total area of 1,033 square metres.
- Outdoor amenity spaces within the central courtyard together with enhanced public realm and landscaping works within the curtilage of Oldham and Greenane House (both protected structures) and a restricted access outdoor space at podium level above the forum block.
- 188 number bicycle parking spaces within the application site.

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 2 of 15

- Single storey security hut at the main vehicular entrance to Trinity Hall from Dartry Road (10 square metres gross floor area).
- Minor repositioning of the existing access gate onto Temple Road, moving it
   4.2 metres westward, to facilitate maintenance and emergency access only,
   together with associated repair works to existing boundary wall.
- Works to Oldham House (a protected structure) to include works necessary for the demolition and replacement of late 20th century sports hall (directly abutting Oldham House); replacement of late 20th century existing doors and window at ground floor level (all on the east elevation only) to facilitate connections to the new forum amenity space; reinstatement of two number original, historic first floor rear window openings (east elevation only) to match existing adjacent, sash windows and one number new door to provide access to proposed roof terrace; removal of existing sand/cement and gypsum plaster finish to east façade and replacement with lime render; and renovation of porch structure, stairs and first floor door on southern elevation.
- Provision of a screen wall to the south of Greenane House (a protected structure).
- All associated and ancillary landscaping works; site lighting; refuse storage; boundary treatments; plant; solar photovoltaic panels; water, wastewater and surface water works; upgrade works to existing electrical substation and all other site and development works.

### **Decision**

Grant permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the said plans and particulars based on the reasons and considerations under and subject to the conditions set out below.

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 3 of 15

#### **Matters Considered**

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

#### **Reasons and Considerations**

In coming to its decision, the Board had regard to the following:

- the site's location close to Dublin City Centre, on lands currently accommodating high quality, purpose-built student accommodation;
- (b) the provisions of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022, including the zoning Objective Z1, which aims to 'protect, provide and improve residential amenities';
- (c) the policies and objectives set out in the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022;
- (d) The Rebuilding Ireland Action Plan for Housing and Homelessness; (Government of Ireland, 2016);
- (e) the National Student Accommodation Strategy 2017;
- (f) the Guidelines for Planning Authorities on Sustainable Residential
   Development in Urban Areas and the accompanying Urban Design Manual;
- (g) the Sustainable Urban Housing: Design Standards for New Apartments
  Guidelines for Planning Authorities 2018;
- (h) the Planning System and Flood Risk Management (including the associated Technical Appendices), 2009;
- (i) the Urban Development and Building Heights, Guidelines for Planning Authorities, 2018;
- (j) the Architectural Heritage Protection, Guidelines for Planning Authorities, 2011;
- (k) the Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS) issued by the Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport and the Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government in March 2013;
- (l) the nature, scale and design of the proposed development;

- (m) the availability in the area of a wide range of social, community and transport infrastructure;
- (n) the pattern of existing and permitted development in the area;
- (o) the planning history within the area;
- (p) the report of the Chief Executive of the planning authority;
- (q) the submissions and observations received, and
- (r) the report of the Inspector.

# **Appropriate Assessment Screening**

The Board completed an Appropriate Assessment screening exercise in relation to the potential effects of the proposed development on designated European sites, taking into account the nature, scale and location of the proposed development within a zoned and serviced urban area, the information submitted with the application, the Inspector's report, and submissions on file. In completing the screening exercise, the Board adopted the report of the Inspector and concluded that, by itself or in combination with other development in the vicinity, the proposed development would not be likely to have a significant effect on any European site in view of the conservation objectives of such sites, and that a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment is not, therefore, required.

# **Environmental Impact Assessment Screening**

The Board completed an environmental impact assessment screening of the proposed development and considered that the Environmental Report submitted by the applicant, identifies and describes adequately the direct, indirect, secondary and cumulative effects of the proposed development on the environment.

#### Having regard to:

- (a) the nature and scale of the proposed development on an urban site served by public infrastructure,
- (b) the absence of any significant environmental sensitivities in the area, and
- (c) the location of the development outside of any sensitive location specified in article 109(3) of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001 (as amended),

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 5 of 15

the Board concluded that, by reason of the nature, scale and location of the subject site, the proposed development would not be likely to have significant effects on the environment. The Board decided, therefore, that an environmental impact assessment report for the proposed development was not required in this case.

## **Conclusions on Proper Planning and Sustainable Development**

The Board considered that, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the proposed development would constitute an acceptable scale of development in this urban location, would not seriously injure the residential or visual amenities of the area or of property in the area, would respect the existing character of the area, would not detract from the character and setting of any protected structure or conservation area, would be acceptable in terms of urban design, height and quantum of development, would be acceptable in terms of pedestrian and traffic safety, and would not have any adverse impacts in terms of biodiversity. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

The Board considered that a grant of permission that could materially contravene section 16.7.2 of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 in terms of height would be justified in accordance with sections 37(2)(b)(i) and (iii) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, having regard to:

- (a) Definition of strategic housing development, pursuant to section 3 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016 (as amended).
- (b) The Government's policy to ramp up delivery of housing from its current under-supply set out in Rebuilding Ireland Action Plan for Housing and Homelessness issued in July 2016, in particular Pillar 4 which encourages the facilitation of additional student accommodation as a key in addressing the housing crisis by reducing the pressure students place on the rental market.
- (c) The provisions in favour of higher buildings set out in the Guidelines for Planning Authorities on Urban Development and Building Heights issued by the Minister under section 28 of the 2000 Act in December 2018, in particular Specific Planning Policy Requirement 3A of these guidelines

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 6 of 15

(d) Objectives 13 and 35 of the National Planning Framework- Project Ireland 2040.

#### **Conditions**

1. The proposed development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development, or as otherwise stipulated by conditions hereunder, and the proposed development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars. In default of agreement the matter(s) in dispute shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

2. Revised cycle parking design with improved security measures shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority within six months.

**Reason**: In the interests of proper planning and sustainable development, to safeguard the amenities of the area and to enhance permeability.

3. Drainage arrangements including the disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services.

Reason: In the interests of public health and surface water management.

4. The developer shall enter into water and/or wastewater connection

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 7 of 15

agreement(s) with Irish Water, prior to commencement of development.

**Reason**: In the interest of public health.

5. The proposed development hereby permitted shall only be occupied as student accommodation, in accordance with the definition of student accommodation provided under section 13(d) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, and shall not be used for any other purpose without a prior grant of planning permission for change of use.

**Reason**: In the interest of residential amenity and to limit the scope of the proposed development to that for which the application was made.

- 6. The proposed development shall be implemented as follows:
  - (a) The student accommodation and complex shall be operated and managed in accordance with the measures indicated in the Student Accommodation Management Plan submitted with the application
  - (b) Student house units shall not be amalgamated or combined.

**Reason**: In the interests of the amenities of occupiers of the units and surrounding properties.

7. The internal road network serving the proposed development, including entrances, junctions, parking areas, footpaths and kerbs shall be in accordance with the detailed construction standards of the planning authority for such works and design standards outlined in Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets. In default of agreement the matter(s) in dispute shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 8 of 15

**Reason**: In the interest of amenity and of traffic and pedestrian safety.

8. The landscaping scheme as submitted to An Bord Pleanála shall be carried out within the first planting season following substantial completion of external construction works. All planting shall be adequately protected from damage until established. Any plants which die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased, within a period of five years from the completion of the development shall be replaced within the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the planning authority.

The developer shall retain the services of a suitably qualified Landscape Architect throughout the duration of the site development works. The developer's Landscape Architect shall certify to the planning authority by letter his/her opinion on compliance of the completed landscape scheme with the approved landscape proposal within six months of substantial completion of the development hereby permitted.

**Reason**: In the interests of residential and visual amenity.

9. Prior to commencement of development, all trees, groups of trees, hedging and shrubs which are to be retained shall be enclosed within stout fences not less than 1.5 metres in height. This protective fencing shall enclose an area covered by the crown spread of the branches, or at minimum a radius of two metres from the trunk of the tree or the centre of the shrub, and to a distance of two metres on each side of the hedge for its full length, and shall be maintained until the development has been completed. No construction equipment, machinery or materials shall be brought onto the site for the purpose of the development until all the trees which are to be retained have been protected by this fencing. No work is shall be carried out within the area

enclosed by the fencing and, in particular, there shall be no parking of vehicles, placing of site huts, storage compounds or topsoil heaps, storage of oil, chemicals or other substances, and no lighting of fires, over the root spread of any tree to be retained.

**Reason**: To protect trees and planting during the construction period in the interest of visual amenity.

- 10. (a) All trees proposed to be felled shall be checked pre-construction for the presence of bats and a derogation licence shall be sought from the National Parks and Wildlife Service should evidence of bat activity be found. No works are to take place prior to the granting of such licences.
  - (b) The provision of bat boxes on trees shall be made in accordance with the Landscape Plan and further bat housing within the building fabric of proposed Blocks A, B and C. Their installation and maintenance plan shall be confirmed in writing with photographic evidence of same to the planning authority.
  - (c) All demolition works shall take place outside of the bird nesting season (March 1st to August 31st).

**Reason**: in the interest of protection of biodiversity.

11. Details of the materials, colours and textures of all the external finishes to the proposed buildings and public areas shall be as submitted with the application, unless otherwise agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. In addition, details of a maintenance strategy for materials within the proposal shall also be submitted for the written agreement of the planning authority, prior to the commencement of any works on site. In default of agreement the matter(s) in dispute shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason**: In the interests of visual amenity and durability.

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 10 of 15

12. No additional development shall take place above roof parapet level, including lift motor enclosures, air handling equipment, storage tanks, ducts or other external plant, telecommunication aerials, antennas or equipment, unless authorised by a further grant of planning permission.

**Reason**: To protect the residential amenities of property in the vicinity and the visual amenities of the area.

- 13. All works to protected structures shall be carried out under the supervision and in accordance with the requirements of a qualified professional with specialised conservation expertise (RIAI Grade 2 or higher). The following shall also be complied with:
  - (a) All works to protected structures shall be carried out in accordance with best conservation practice and the Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities (2011) and Advice Series issued by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government. Any repair works shall retain the maximum amount of surviving historic fabric in situ. Items to be removed for repair off-site shall be recorded prior to removal, catalogued and numbered to allow for authentic reinstatement.
  - (b) All existing original features, in the vicinity of the works shall be protected during the course of the refurbishment works.
  - (c) All repair of original fabric shall be scheduled and carried out by appropriately experienced conservators of historic fabric.
  - (d) The architectural detailing and materials in the new work shall be executed to the highest standards so as to complement the setting of the protected structure and the historic area.
  - (e) Provide detailed survey drawings and photographs of all historic buildings and fragments of buildings to be demolished as part of the works to the planning authority prior to the commencement of any works on site.

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 11 of 15

(f) Details of the proposed manner in which the cultural significance of the site and its known artefacts and historic details are to be presented shall be agreed with the planning authority, prior to the commencement of any works on site

**Reason**: To secure the authentic preservation of the protected structure and to ensure that the proposed works are carried out in accordance with best conservation practice

14. Site development and building works shall be carried only out between 07.00 to 18.00 hours Mondays to Saturdays inclusive, and not at all on Sundays and public holidays. Deviation from these times will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances where prior written approval has been received from the planning authority.

**Reason**: In order to safeguard the amenities of property in the vicinity.

15. All service cables associated with the proposed development (such as electrical, telecommunications and communal television) shall be located underground. Ducting shall be provided by the developer to facilitate the provision of broadband infrastructure within the proposed development.

**Reason**: In the interests of visual and residential amenity.

- 16. The developer shall facilitate the preservation, recording and protection of archaeological materials or features that may exist within the site. In this regard, the developer shall:
  - (a) notify the planning authority in writing at least four weeks prior to the commencement of any site operation (including hydrological and geotechnical investigations) relating to the proposed development,
  - (b) employ a suitably qualified archaeologist who shall carry out site testing

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 12 of 15

and monitor all site investigations and other excavation works,

- (c) provide arrangements, acceptable to the planning authority, for the recording and the removal of any archaeological material which the authority considers appropriate to remove, and
- (d) agree in writing the archaeological method statements for mitigation with the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage prior to commencement of any works on site.

In default of agreement on any of these requirements, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason**: In order to conserve the archaeological heritage of the site and to secure the preservation and protection (in situ or by record) of any remains that may exist within the site.

17. A plan containing details for the management of waste within the development, including the provision of facilities for the storage, separation and collection of the waste and, in particular, recyclable materials shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. Thereafter, the waste shall be managed in accordance with the agreed plan.

**Reason**: To provide for the appropriate management of waste and, in particular recyclable materials, in the interest of protecting the environment.

18. The construction of the development shall be managed in accordance with a Construction Management Plan, which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall provide details of intended construction practice for the development, including hours of working, noise management measures and off-site disposal of construction/demolition waste.

**Reason**: In the interests of public safety and residential amenity.

19. Construction and demolition waste shall be managed in accordance with a construction waste and demolition management plan, which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall be prepared in accordance with the "Best Practice Guidelines on the Preparation of Waste Management Plans for Construction and Demolition Projects", published by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in July 2006.

**Reason**: In the interest of sustainable waste management.

20. Prior to commencement of development, the developer shall lodge with the planning authority a cash deposit, a bond of an insurance company or such other security as may be accepted in writing by the planning authority, to secure the protection of the trees on site and to make good any damage caused during the construction period, coupled with an agreement empowering the planning authority to apply such security, or part thereof, to the satisfactory protection of any tree or trees on the site or the replacement of any such trees which die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased within a period of three years from the substantial completion of the development with others of similar size and species. The form and amount of the security shall be as agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of agreement, shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason**: To secure the protection of the trees on the site.

21. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 14 of 15

Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

**Reason**: It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission

Paul Hyde

Member of An Bord Pleanála

duly authorised to authenticate
the seal of the Board.

Dated this day of 2020

ABP-306837-20 Board Order Page 15 of 15