

Board Order ABP-307267-20

Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2019 Planning Authority: Dublin City Council

Application for permission under section 4 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, in accordance with plans and particulars, lodged with An Bord Pleanála on the 2nd day of June 2020 by The Donnybrook Partnership care of John Spain Associates, 39 Fitzwilliam Place, Dublin 2.

Proposed Development

A planning permission for a strategic housing development at numbers 1, 3, 5, 7, 9, and 11 Eglinton Road, Donnybrook, Dublin 4.

The subject site is bound by a commercial site to the north (bound by Brookvale Road and Donnybrook Road), Eglinton Road to the south, Donnybrook Road to the east and Brookvale Road to the west. The site comprises of 0.38 hectares and the proposed development will consist of the demolition of six number houses and ancillary structures on site, and the construction of a residential development of two connected apartment blocks of 148 number apartments, rising in height from three storeys to 12 storeys over basement.

The proposed development will consist of:

1) Demolition of existing six number two storey dwellings and ancillary structures at Number 1, 3, 5, 7, 9 and 11 Eglinton Road;

- 2) Construction of a residential development of 148 number apartment units comprising:
 - 71 number one-bedroom units,
 - 58 number two-bedroom units,
 - nine number two-bedroom duplex units, and
 - 10 number three-bedroom units:
- 3) The height of the proposed development ranges from three to four storeys along Brookvale Road, five to twelve storeys along Donnybrook Road, four to twelve storeys along Eglinton Road, including a double height feature at twelfth storey level at the junction of Eglinton Road and Donnybrook Road, with a maximum overall height of 43.1 metres over existing ground level;
- Provision of private open space to serve all residential units in the form of balconies or terraces;
- 5) Provision of ancillary residential communal areas including external central landscaped courtyard, internal resident amenities spaces at ground floor level including residents lounge, co-working space, gym, management area and bicycle store with 28 number spaces and at seventh floor level including cinema room, reading room, and two number rooftop terraces located on the north and south elevations;
- Provision of basement including 75 number car parking spaces, four number motorcycle spaces and 172 number cycle spaces and all ancillary areas such as plant, storage and attenuation;
- 7) Vehicular access will be provided from Brookvale Road;
- 8) The development includes all associated site development works, hard and soft landscaping (to include four number cycle spaces at street level), sustainable drainage system drainage, photovoltaic panels on roof of twelfth storey, provision of hoarding around site boundary (with scheme advertisement zone circa 302.25 square metres along Eglinton Road and Donnybrook Road) during construction phase, Electricity Supply Board substation and all other ancillary works necessary to facilitate the development.

Decision

Grant permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the said plans and particulars based on the reasons and considerations under and subject to the conditions set out below.

Matters Considered

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

Reasons and Considerations

In coming to its decision, the Board had regard to the following:

- (a) the location of the site in the established urban area of Dublin City in an area zoned for residential;
- (b) the policies and objectives of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022;
- (c) the Rebuilding Ireland Action Plan for Housing and Homelessness 2016;
- (d) the Guidelines for Sustainable Residential Developments in Urban Areas and the accompanying Urban Design Manual – a Best Practice Guide, issued by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in May 2009;
- (e) the Urban Development and Building Heights Guidelines for Planning Authorities, prepared by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government in December 2018 and particularly Specific Planning Policy Requirement 3;
- (f) the Sustainable Urban Housing: Design Standards for New Apartments issued by the Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government in March 2018 and particularly Specific Planning Policy Requirement 7 and 8;

- (g) the Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS) issued by the Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport and the Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government in March 2013;
- (h) the Architectural Heritage Protection- Guidelines for Planning Authorities 2011;
- the nature, scale and design of the proposed development and the availability in the area of a wide range of social, transport and water services infrastructure;
- (j) the pattern of existing and permitted development in the area;
- (k) the planning history of the site (including extant permission) and within the area;
- (I) the submissions and observations received;
- (m) the Chief Executive Report from the planning authority; and
- (n) the report of the inspector.

Appropriate Assessment Screening

The Board completed an Appropriate Assessment screening exercise in relation to the potential effects of the proposed development on designated European sites, taking into account the nature, scale and location of the proposed development within a zoned and serviced urban area, the Screening Report for Appropriate Assessment submitted with the application, the Inspector's report, and submissions on file. In completing the screening exercise, the Board adopted the report of the Inspector and concluded that, by itself or in combination with other development in the vicinity, the proposed development would not be likely to have a significant effect on any European site in view of the conservation objectives of such sites, and that a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment is not, therefore, required.

Environmental Impact Assessment Screening

The Board completed an environmental impact assessment screening of the proposed development and considered that the Environmental Impact Assessment Screening Report submitted by the applicant, identifies and describes adequately the direct, indirect, secondary, and cumulative effects of the proposed development on the environment.

Having regard to:

- (a) the nature and scale of the proposed development on an urban site served by public infrastructure,
- (b) the absence of any significant environmental sensitivities in the area, and
- (c) the location of the development outside of any sensitive location specified in article 109(3) of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001 (as amended),

the Board concluded that, by reason of the nature, scale and location of the subject site, the proposed development would not be likely to have significant effects on the environment. The Board decided, therefore, that an environmental impact assessment report for the proposed development was not necessary in this case.

Conclusions on Proper Planning and Sustainable Development:

The Board considered that, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the proposed development would constitute an acceptable quantum and density of development in this accessible urban location, would not seriously injure the residential or visual amenities of the area or of property in the vicinity, would be acceptable in terms of urban design, height and quantum of development and would be acceptable in terms of pedestrian and traffic safety and convenience. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area. In coming to this conclusion, specific regard was had to the Chief Executive Report from the planning authority.

The Board considered that, while a grant of permission for the proposed Strategic Housing Development would not materially contravene a zoning objective of the statutory plans for the area, a grant of permission could materially contravene the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 in relation to building height. The Board considers that, having regard to the provisions of section 37(2) of the Planning and

Development Act 2000, as amended, the grant of permission in material contravention of the City Development Plan would be justified for the following reasons and consideration.

In relation to section 37(2)(b) (i) of the Planning and Development Act 2000 (as amended):

The proposed development is considered to be of strategic and national importance having regard to the definition of 'strategic housing development' pursuant to section 3 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016 (as amended) and its potential to contribute to the achievement of the Government's policy to increase delivery of housing from its current under supply set out in Rebuilding Ireland – Action Plan for Housing an Homelessness issued in July 2016.

In relation to section 37(2)(b) (iii) of the Planning and Development Act 2000 (as amended):

Permission for the development should be granted having regard to guidelines under section 28 of the Act, specifically Specific Planning Policy Requirement 3 of the Building Height Guidelines which states that where a development complies with the Development Management Criteria in section 3.2, it may be approved even where specific objectives of the relevant development plan or local area plan may indicate otherwise, and also having regard to National policy in Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework (in particular objectives 13 and 35). An assessment of the proposed development was carried out to determine that the proposed development conforms with the development management criteria in section 3.2 of those guidelines.

Conditions

1. The proposed development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development, or as otherwise stipulated by conditions hereunder, and the proposed development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars. In default of agreement the matter(s) in dispute shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

- 2. The proposed development shall be amended as follows:
 - (a) Block A, apartment L00-11 at ground floor shall be redesigned to incorporate a buffer between its windows and the street edge. The buffer shall be in the form of planting and balcony area. The apartment should subsequently be reduced in size to a one-bedroom unit to accommodate the changes.
 - (b) Block A, apartments: L02-22, L02-23, L03-22, L03-23, L04-21 and L04-20, shall include obscure glazing to the secondary windows of bedrooms overlooking north west / south east.
 - Windows in the courtyard façade of duplexes L01-19-DPX and L01-20-DPX shall incorporate measures to prevent overlooking of apartments in Block A to the north east of the proposed development.

As a consequence of the above amendments the total number of units permitted is 148 number residential units comprising 72 number one-bedroom units, 57 number two-bedroom units, nine number two-bedroom duplex units and 10 number three-bedroom units. Revised drawings showing compliance with these requirements shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. **Reason**: In the interests of visual and residential amenity. 3. Details of the materials, colours and textures of all the external finishes to the proposed buildings shall be as submitted with the application, unless otherwise agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. In default of agreement the matter(s) in dispute shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: In the interest of visual amenity.

4. The boundary planting and areas of communal open space shown on the lodged plans shall be landscaped in accordance with the landscape scheme submitted to An Bord Pleanála with this application, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the planning authority. The landscape scheme shall be implemented fully in the first planting season following completion of the development, and any trees or shrubs which die or are removed within three years of planting shall be replaced in the first planting season thereafter. This work shall be completed before any of the dwellings are made available for occupation. Access to green roof areas shall be strictly prohibited unless for maintenance purposes.

Reason: In order to ensure the satisfactory development of the public open space areas, and their continued use for this purpose.

5. Comprehensive details of the proposed telecommunications mitigation required as a result of the development shall be submitted to and agreed in writing with the planning authority, prior to commencement of development. In the event that installation of a hop site or any other equipment on the roof of the development is required as part of telecommunications mitigation, provision of screening shall be required to mitigate the visual impact of this. Full details of the appearance, material finish and size of screens shall be provided to the planning authority for approval prior to installation of the any roof level telecommunications mitigation (if required). The agreed telecommunication mitigation measure(s) (along with any associated screening) shall be fully implemented and operational, before the proposed development is made available for occupation.

Reason: In the interests of public safety and visual amenity.

- 6. (a) A plan containing details for the management of waste (and, in particular, recyclable materials) within the development, including the provision of facilities for the storage, separation and collection of the waste and, in particular, recyclable materials and for the ongoing operation of these facilities for each apartment unit shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority not later than six months from the date of commencement of the development. Thereafter, the waste shall be managed in accordance with the agreed plan.
 - (b) This plan shall provide for use of the screened communal bin collection point on Brookvale Road for collection only, with details of the responsible personnel and arrangement for the movement of bins between storage and collection points on collection days only.

Reason: In the interest of residential amenity, and to ensure the provision of adequate refuse storage.

7. No additional development shall take place above roof parapet level, including lift motor enclosures, air handling equipment, storage tanks, ducts or other external plant, telecommunication aerials, antennas or equipment, unless authorised by a further grant of planning permission. With the exception of any telecommunications mitigation measure(s) and associated screening required in conjunction with condition 6 of this consent.

Reason: To protect the residential amenities of property in the vicinity and the visual amenities of the area.

8. Public lighting shall be provided in accordance with a final scheme to reflect the indicative details in the submitted Public Lighting Strategy, details of which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development/installation of lighting. Such lighting shall be provided prior to the making available for occupation of any house.

Reason: In the interests of amenity and public safety.

9. 204 number bicycle parking spaces shall be provided within the site. Details of the layout, marking demarcation and security provisions for these spaces shall be as submitted to An Bord Pleanála with this application, unless otherwise agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: To ensure that adequate bicycle parking provision is available to serve the proposed development, in the interest of sustainable transportation.

10. The Mobility Management Strategy submitted with the application shall implemented by the management company for all units within the development.

Reason: In the interest of encouraging the use of sustainable modes of transport.

11. The car parking facilities hereby permitted shall be reserved solely to serve the proposed development. The spaces shall not be utilised for any other purpose, including for use in association with any other uses of the development hereby permitted, unless the subject of a separate grant of planning permission.

Reason: To ensure that adequate parking facilities are permanently available to serve the proposed residential units.

12. The management and maintenance of the proposed development following its completion shall be the responsibility of a legally constituted management company. A management scheme providing adequate measures for the future maintenance of public open spaces, roads and communal areas shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to occupation of the development.

Reason: To provide for the satisfactory future maintenance of this development in the interest of residential amenity.

13. A minimum of 10% of all communal car parking spaces shall be provided with functioning electric vehicle charging stations/points, and ducting shall be provided for all remaining car parking spaces, including in-curtilage spaces, facilitating the installation of electric vehicle charging points/stations at a later date. Where proposals relating to the installation of electric vehicle ducting and charging stations/points has not been submitted with the application, in accordance with the above noted requirements, such proposals shall be submitted and agreed in writing with the planning authority prior to the occupation of the development.

Reason: To provide for and/or future proof the development such as would facilitate the use of electric vehicles.

14. Prior to commencement of development, a drawing illustrating compatibility with the implementation of the BusConnects project with final footpath details on Donneybrook Road and allowance for the Dodder Greenway proposal to the boundary of the site, shall be submitted to the planning authority in consultation with the National Transport Authority, for approval.

Reason: In the interest of traffic safety and to prevent the development of this area prior to its use for future road improvements.

15. Details of any alterations to the road and pedestrian network serving the proposed development, including loading areas, footpaths, kerbs and access road to the underground car park shall be in accordance with the detailed construction standards of the planning authority for such works and design standards outlined in the Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets. In default of agreement the matter(s) in dispute shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: In the interest of amenity and of traffic and pedestrian safety.

16. Drainage arrangements including the attenuation and disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services.

Prior to commencement of development the developer shall submit to the Planning Authority for written agreement a Stage 2 - Detailed Design Stage Storm Water Audit. Upon Completion of the development, a Stage 3 Completion Stormwater Audit to demonstrate Sustainable Urban Drainage System measures have been installed, and are working as designed and that there has been no misconnections or damage to storm water drainage infrastructure during construction, shall be submitted to the planning authority for written agreement.

Reason: In the interest of public health and surface water management

17. The developer shall enter into water and waste water connection agreements with Irish Water, prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of public health.

18. Prior to commencement of the development, an addendum to the Site Specific Flood Risk Assessment shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with the Planning Authority. The addendum to the Site Specific Flood Risk Assessment shall consider the 0.1% Annual Exceedance Probability flood event as part of residual flood risk associated with the site and the findings shall inform the final finished floor level for the development.

Reason: In the interests of public health and flood risk mitigation.

- 19. (a) Prior to commencement of development, all trees which are to be retained shall be enclosed within stout fences not less than 1.5 metres in height. This protective fencing shall enclose an area covered by the crown spread of the branches, or at minimum a radius of two metres from the trunk of the tree or the centre of the shrub, and to a distance of two metres on each side of the hedge for its full length, and shall be maintained until the development has been completed.
 - (b) No construction equipment, machinery or materials shall be brought onto the site for the purpose of the development until all the trees which are to be retained have been protected by this fencing. No work is shall be carried out within the area enclosed by the fencing and, in particular, there shall be no parking of vehicles, placing of site huts, storage compounds or topsoil heaps, storage of oil, chemicals or other substances, and no lighting of fires, over the root spread of any tree to be retained.
 - (c) Excavations in preparation for foundations and drainage, and all works above ground level in the immediate vicinity of street trees on Eglinton Road and Brookvale Road, shall be carried out under the supervision of a specialist arborist, in a manner that will ensure that all major roots are

protected and all branches are retained.

(d) No trench, embankment or pipe run shall be located within three metres of any trees which are to be retained adjacent to the site unless otherwise agreed with the planning authority.

Reason: To protect trees and planting during the construction period in the interest of visual amenity.

20. Construction and demolition waste shall be managed in accordance with a final construction waste and demolition management plan, which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall be prepared in accordance with the "Best Practice Guidelines on the Preparation of Waste Management Plans for Construction and Demolition Projects", published by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in July 2006. The plan shall include details of waste to be generated during site clearance and construction phases, and details of the methods and locations to be employed for the prevention, minimisation, recovery and disposal of this material in accordance with the provision of the Waste Management Plan for the Region in which the site is situated.

Reason: In the interest of sustainable waste management.

- 21. The construction of the development shall be managed in accordance with a final Construction Management Plan, which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall provide details of intended construction practice for the development, including:
 - (a) Works to remove trees and structures from the site shall take place outside of bird nesting season;
 - (b) Location of the site and materials compound(s) including area(s) identified for the storage of construction refuse;
 - (c) Location of areas for construction site offices and staff facilities;
 - (d) Details of site security fencing and hoardings. Hoardings shall include a

one square metre area on each road frontage detailing site management contact details;

- (e) Details of on-site car parking facilities for site workers during the course of construction;
- (f) Details of the timing and routing of construction traffic to and from the construction site and associated directional signage, to include proposals to facilitate the delivery of abnormal loads to the site;
- (g) Measures to obviate queuing of construction traffic on the adjoining road network;
- (h) Measures to prevent the spillage or deposit of clay, rubble or other debris on the public road network;
- Alternative arrangements to be put in place for pedestrians and vehicles in the case of the closure of any public road or footpath during the course of site development works;
- (j) Details of appropriate mitigation measures for noise, dust and vibration, and monitoring of such levels;
- (k) Containment of all construction-related fuel and oil within specially constructed bunds to ensure that fuel spillages are fully contained. Such bunds shall be roofed to exclude rainwater;
- Off-site disposal of construction/demolition waste and details of how it is proposed to manage excavated soil;
- (m) Details of dewatering arrangements for construction of the basement to be determined in consultation with the Drainage Division at Dublin City Council and Inland Fisheries Ireland;
- (n) Means to ensure that surface water run-off is controlled such that no silt or other pollutants enter local surface water sewers or drains.
- (o) A record of daily checks that the works are being undertaken in accordance with the Construction Management Plan shall be kept for inspection by the planning authority.

Reason: In the interest of amenities, public health and safety.

22. Site development and building works shall be carried out only between 0700 to 1900 hours Mondays to Saturdays inclusive, and not at all on Sundays and public holidays. Deviation from these times will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances where prior written approval has been received from the planning authority.

Reason: In order to safeguard the residential amenities of property in the vicinity.

- 23. The developer shall facilitate the archaeological appraisal of the site and shall provide for the preservation, recording and protection of archaeological materials or features which may exist within the site. In this regard, the developer shall:
 - (a) notify the planning authority in writing at least four weeks prior to the commencement of any site operation (including hydrological and geotechnical investigations) relating to the proposed development, and
 - (b) employ a suitably qualified archaeologist prior to the commencement of development. The archaeologist shall assess the site and monitor all site development works. The assessment shall address the following issues:
 - (i) the nature and location of archaeological material on the site, and
 - (ii) the impact of the proposed development on such archaeological material.

A report, containing the results of the assessment, shall be submitted to the planning authority and, arising from this assessment, the developer shall agree in writing with the planning authority details regarding any further archaeological requirements (including, if necessary, archaeological excavation) prior to commencement of construction works.

In default of agreement on any of these requirements, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: In order to conserve the archaeological heritage of the area and to secure the preservation (in-situ or by record) and protection of any archaeological remains that may exist within the site.

24. Proposals for an estate name and associated signage shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. Thereafter, all estate and street signs, and apartment numbers, shall be provided in accordance with the agreed scheme. The proposed name(s) shall be based on local historical or topographical features, or other alternatives acceptable to the planning authority. No advertisements/marketing signage relating to the name(s) of the development shall be erected until the developer has obtained the planning authority's written agreement to the proposed name(s).

Reason: In the interest of urban legibility and to ensure the use of locally appropriate place names for new residential areas.

25. All service cables associated with the proposed development (such as electrical, telecommunications and communal television) shall be located underground. Any relocation of utility infrastructure shall be agreed with the relevant utility provider. Ducting shall be provided by the developer to facilitate the provision of broadband infrastructure within the proposed development.

Reason: In the interests of visual and residential amenity.

26. Prior to commencement of development, the developer or other person with an interest in the land to which the application relates shall enter into an agreement in writing with the planning authority in relation to the provision of housing in accordance with the requirements of section 94(4) and section 96(2) and (3) (Part V) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, unless an exemption certificate shall have been applied for and been granted under section 97 of the Act, as amended. Where such an agreement is not reached within eight weeks from the date of this order, the matter in dispute (other than a matter to which section 96(7) applies) may be referred by the planning authority or any other prospective party to the agreement to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: To comply with the requirements of Part V of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, and of the housing strategy in the development plan of the area.

27. Prior to commencement of development, the developer shall lodge with the planning authority a cash deposit, a bond of an insurance company, or other security to secure the provision and satisfactory completion and maintenance until taken in charge by the local authority of roads, footpaths, watermains, drains, public open space and other services required in connection with the development, coupled with an agreement empowering the local authority to apply such security or part thereof to the satisfactory completion or maintenance of any part of the development. The form and amount of the security shall be as agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of agreement, shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: To ensure the satisfactory completion and maintenance of the development until taken in charge.

28. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions for Dublin City Council of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

Reason: It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission.

Paul Hyde Member of An Bord Pleanála duly authorised to authenticate the seal of the Board.

Dated this day of 2020