

Board Order ABP-309400-21

Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2020

Planning Authority: Dublin City Council

Planning Register Reference Number: 2421/20

Appeal by Frank McDonald of The Granary, 20 Temple Lane, Dublin and by An Taisce of Tailor's Hall, Back Lane, Dublin against the decision made on the 22nd day of January 2021 by Dublin City Council to grant subject to conditions a permission to Bashview Limited care of Avison Young of 4th Floor, 2-4 Merrion Row, Dublin in accordance with plans and particulars lodged with the said Council.Dublin City Council to grant subject to conditions a permission to Bashview Limited care of Avison Young of 4th Floor, 2-4 Merrion Row, Dublin in accordance with plans and particulars lodged with the said Council.

Proposed Development: The development will consist of the following: the demolition of the existing six storey mixed use structure (circa 6,108 square metres) known as 'Moira House' and 'Trinity Street Car Park', currently comprising a 171 number space multi storey car park, three number retail units at ground floor (circa 508 square metres) and five number self-contained offices suites (circa 292 square metres) and the provision of a nine storey over basement office building with a restaurant at ground floor.

The proposed building has a total height of circa 36.218 metres above ground (43.7 metres ODM, including lift overrun), stepping back at seventh and eighth

floor levels with a gross floor area of circa 7,460 square metres (including basement of circa 318 square metres).

The proposed building will accommodate office space at first to ninth floor levels with a reception lobby at ground floor accessed from Saint Andrew's Lane and a ground floor restaurant unit (circa 540 square metres) accessed from both Trinity Street and Saint Andrew's Lane.

The proposed building is set back from Trinity Street at ground and first floor levels providing for a pedestrian plaza/seating area (circa 53 square metres) while the building is also set back from Saint Andrew's Lane to the south providing for a second entrance plaza (circa 32 square metres).

The proposed development includes terraces at seventh and eighth floor levels to the north elevation, PV panels at roof level, plant at roof level (including lift overrun) and at basement level, substation/switch room at basement level, two number stair cores, three number lift cores, a separate stairs from the restaurant to the basement, bicycle storage at basement level (circa 76 number spaces), bike lift, ancillary facilities (including shower block) and all other ancillary site development works, all at 14-15 Trinity Street and 1-4A Dame Lane and fronting onto Saint Andrew's Lane, Dublin.

Decision

GRANT permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the said plans and particulars based on the reasons and considerations under and subject to the conditions set out below.

Matters Considered

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

Reasons and Considerations

In coming to its decision, the Board had regard to the following:

- (a) the site's location in Dublin city centre, with the zoning objective Z5: "To consolidate and facilitate the development of the central area, and to identify, reinforce and strengthen and protect is civic design character and dignity" in the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022,
- (b) the policies set out in the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022,
- (c) the Urban Development and Building Heights Guidelines for Planning Authorities issued by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government in December 2018,
- (d) the decision of the planning authority,
- (e) the nature, scale and design of the proposed development,
- (f) the availability in the area of a wide range of social, community and transport infrastructure,
- (g) the pattern of existing and permitted development in the area,
- (h) the report of the Inspector, and

(i) the submissions and observations received,

it is considered that, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the proposed development would not seriously injure the visual amenities of the area or views towards the established historic and sensitive architectural character of the built environment, would integrate into the surrounding streetscape, would be acceptable in terms of vehicular and pedestrian safety and convenience and amenity and would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Furthermore, the Board considered that a grant of permission that could materially contravene the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 in terms of height would be justified in accordance with Section 37(2)(b)(iii) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The Board considered that permission for the proposed development should be granted having regard to Government Policies as set out in the Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework in particular Objective 13 and the Urban Development and Building Height - Guidelines for Planning Authorities, prepared by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government in December, 2018, in particular Specific Planning Policy Requirement 1 and Specific Planning Policy Requirement 3. The Board considered that the criteria in section 37(2)(b)(iii) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, was satisfied.

Appropriate Assessment Screening

The Bord completed an Appropriate Assessment screening exercise in relation to the potential effects of the proposed development on designated European Sites, taking into account the nature, scale and location of the proposed development within a zoned and serviced urban site, the information for Screening for Appropriate Assessment document submitted with the application, the Inspector's report, and submissions on file. In completing the screening exercise, the Board adopted the report of the Inspector and concluded that, by itself or in combination with other development in the vicinity, the proposed development would not be likely to have a significant effect on any European Site in view of the conservation objectives of such sites, and that a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment is not, therefore, required.

Conditions

The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, as amended by the further plans and particulars submitted on the 2nd day of November, 2020 and on the 18th day of December, 2020, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development and the development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

Details, including samples of the materials, colours and textures of all
the external finishes to the proposed building shall be submitted to, and
agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of
development.

Reason: In the interest of the visual amenities of the area.

3. Water supply and drainage arrangements, including the attenuation and disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services.

Reason: In the interest of public health.

 The developer shall enter into water and wastewater connection agreements with Irish Water, prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of public health.

- 5. The developer shall facilitate the archaeological appraisal of the site and shall provide for the preservation, recording and protection of archaeological materials or features which may exist within the site. In this regard, the developer shall:
 - (a) notify the planning authority in writing at least four weeks prior to the commencement of any site operation (including hydrological and geotechnical investigations) relating to the proposed development, and

(b) employ a suitably qualified archaeologist prior to the commencement of development. The archaeologist shall assess the site and monitor all site development works.

The assessment shall address the following issues:

- (ii) the nature and location of archaeological material on the site, and
- (ii) the impact of the proposed development on such material.

A report, containing the results of the assessment, shall be submitted to the planning authority and, arising from this assessment, the developer shall agree in writing with the planning authority details regarding any further archaeological requirements (including, if necessary, archaeological excavation) prior to commencement of construction works. In default of agreement on any of these requirements, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: In order to conserve the archaeological heritage of the area and to secure the preservation (in-situ or by record) and protection of any archaeological remains that may exist within the site.

- 6. The construction of the development shall be managed in accordance with a Construction Management Plan, which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall provide details of intended construction practice for the development, including:
 - (a) location of the site and materials compound(s) including area(s) identified for the storage of construction waste storage,
 - (b) location of areas for construction site offices and staff facilities,
 - (c) details of site security fencing and hoardings,

- (d) details of on-site car parking facilities for site workers during the course of construction,
- (e) details of the timing and routing of construction traffic to and from the construction site and associated directional signage, to include proposals to facilitate the delivery of abnormal loads to the site,
- (f) measures to obviate queuing of construction traffic on the adjoining road network,
- (g) measures to prevent the spillage or deposit of clay, rubble or other debris on the public road network,
- (h) alternative arrangements to be put in place for pedestrians and vehicles in the case of the closure of any public road or footpath during the course of site development works. Where a road closure is in operation, suitable diversionary signage to existing uses on Saint Andrew's Lane shall be provided on the public road. Such signage will indicate the duration of the road closure,
- (j) provision of parking for existing properties during the construction period,
- (j) details of appropriate mitigation measures for noise, dust and vibration, and monitoring of such levels,
- (k) containment of all construction-related fuel and oil within specially constructed bunds to ensure that fuel spillages are fully contained. Such bunds shall be roofed to exclude rainwater,
- off-site disposal of construction/demolition waste and details of how it is proposed to manage excavated soil, and
- (m) means to ensure that surface water run-off is controlled such that no silt or other pollutants enter local surface water sewers or drains.

A record of daily checks that the works are being undertaken in accordance with the Construction Management Plan shall be kept for inspection by the planning authority.

Reason: In the interests of amenities, public health, and safety.

7. Construction and demolition waste shall be managed in accordance with a construction waste and demolition management plan, which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall be prepared in accordance with the "Best Practice Guidelines on the Preparation of Waste Management Plans for Construction and Demolition Projects", published by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in July, 2006. The plan shall include details of waste to be generated during site clearance and construction phases, and details of the methods and locations to be employed for the prevention, minimisation, recovery and disposal of this material in accordance with the provision of the Waste Management Plan for the Region in which the site is situated

Reason: In the interest of sustainable waste management.

8. Site clearance and development works shall be carried only out during the construction phase between the hours of 0700 to 1800 Mondays to Fridays excluding bank holidays and 0800 to 1400 hours Saturdays unless otherwise agreed in writing with the planning authority.

Reason: In the interest of clarity and to ensure the full implementation of the Mobility Management Plan.

9. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001, or any statutory provision amending or replacing them, no advertisement signs (including any signs installed to be visible through the windows), advertisement structures, banners, canopies, flags, or other projecting elements shall be displayed or erected on the building or within the curtilage of the site or attached to the glazing unless authorised by a further grant of planning permission.

Reason: To protect the visual amenities of the area.

10. Prior to the occupation of the development, a Mobility Management Plan which shall be prepared, coordinated and implemented under the direction of a Mobility Manager, shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority. Details which shall include provision for centralised facilities within the development for bicycle parking, shower and changing facilities associated with the policies set out in the strategy shall be agreed with the planning authority in writing prior to the commencement of the development.

Reason: In the interests of clarity and orderly development.

11. Proposals for a name and associated signage for the proposed block shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and orderly development.

12. The sound levels from any loudspeaker announcements, music or other material projected in or from the premises shall be controlled so as to ensure the sound is not audible in adjoining premises or at two metres from the frontage.

Reason: In the interest of environmental amenity.

13. No additional development shall take place above roof parapet level, including lift motor enclosures, air handling equipment, storage tanks, ducts or other external plant, telecommunication aerials, antennas or equipment, unless authorised by a further grant of planning permission.

Reason: To protect the residential amenities of property in the vicinity and the visual amenities of the area.

14. Prior to commencement of development, the developer shall lodge with the planning authority, a cash deposit, a bond of an insurance company, or other security to secure the provision and satisfactory completion of roads, footpaths, watermains, drains, open space and other services required in connection with the development, coupled with an agreement empowering the local authority to apply such security or part thereof to the satisfactory completion of any part of the development. The form and amount of the security shall be as agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of agreement, shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

Reason: To ensure the satisfactory completion of the development.

15. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to the commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

Reason: It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission.

16. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of Luas Cross City in accordance with the terms of the Supplementary Development Contribution Scheme made by the planning authority under section 49 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to the commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

Reason: It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Supplementary Development Contribution Scheme made under section 49 of the Act be applied to the permission.

Paul Hyde

Member of An Bord Pleanála duly authorised to authenticate

the seal of the Board.

Dated this At day of June