

An  
Bord  
Pleanála

**Board Order**  
**ABP-314120-22**

---

**Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2022**

**Planning Authority: Roscommon County Council**

**Planning Register Reference Number: PD/21/595**

**Appeal** by Curlew Energy Limited, Eddie Sheehan and David McDonnell care of Malachy Walsh and Partners of Reen Point, Blennerville, Tralee, County Kerry against the decision made on the 23<sup>rd</sup> day of June, 2022 by Roscommon County Council to refuse permission for the proposed development.

**Proposed Development:** Five year planning permission for development consisting of the construction of two number wind turbines (turbine tip height of 150 metres and rotor diameter of 138 metres) with associated foundations and crane hardstand areas and all associated development including one number substation control building, one number permanent meteorological mast (80 metres height) and associated foundation, hardstand area and ancillary main crane hardstand area, 1,304 metres of new internal site service roads, underground electric cabling systems between turbines within the wind farm site, 3.75 kilometres of overground electric cabling system and 1.53 kilometres of underground electric cabling system between the wind farm site and connection point at existing 38 kV ESNB substation in Boyle, one number new site access/entrance off the L-1248 local road at the western boundary to facilitate construction and access, one number temporary construction site

compound (750 square metres), four number peat/spoil deposition areas for storage of excess excavated peat materials, associated surface water management system, tree felling to facilitate site development, temporary works on sections of the public road network along the turbine delivery route (including hedge or tree cutting, relocation of powerlines/poles, lampposts, signage and local road widening) and all associated site works, all in the townlands of Leam, Ballybaun, Harepark, Ardcorcoran, Grange Beg, Knockadoobrusna and Ballytrasna, Cashelfinoge and Grangemeadow, Boyle, County Roscommon. Further public notices were received by the planning authority on the 29<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2022.

## **Decision**

**GRANT permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the said plans and particulars based on the reasons and considerations under and subject to the conditions set out below.**

## **Reasons and Considerations**

Having regard to:

- (a) the National Planning Framework – Ireland 2040,
- (b) the Climate Action Plan 2023,
- (c) the Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy for the North and West Region 2020,
- (d) the “Wind Energy Development Guidelines - Guidelines for Planning Authorities”, issued by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in June, 2006 (Draft Amendments, 2019),

- (e) the policies of the planning authority as set out in the Roscommon County Development Plan 2022 to 2028,
- (f) the distance to dwellings or other sensitive receptors,
- (g) the submissions made in connection with the planning application,
- (h) the likely consequences for the environment and the proper planning and sustainable development of the area in which it is proposed to carry out the proposed development and the likely significant effects of the proposed development on European Sites, and
- (i) the report and recommendation of the Inspector.

### **Appropriate Assessment Screening**

The Board agreed with the screening assessment and conclusion carried out in the Inspector's report that the Lough Gara Special Protection Area (site code 004048) is the only European site for which there is a possibility of significant effects and must therefore be subject to Appropriate Assessment.

### **Appropriate Assessment**

The Board considered the Natura Impact Statement and all other relevant submissions and carried out an appropriate assessment of the implications of the proposed development for European Sites in view of the site's conservation objectives for the Lough Gara Special Protection Area (site code 004048). The Board considered that the information before it was sufficient to undertake a complete assessment of all aspects of the proposed development in relation to the site's conservation objectives using the best available scientific knowledge in the field.

In completing the assessment, the Board considered, in particular, the following:

- (i) the site specific conservation objectives for this European Site,
- (ii) the current conservation status, threats and pressures on the qualifying interest/special conservation interest features,
- (iii) the likely direct and indirect impacts arising from the proposed development both individually or in combination with other plans or projects,
- (iv) the view of the Department of Housing, Local Government, and Heritage, and
- (v) the mitigation measures which are included as part of the current proposal.

In completing the Appropriate Assessment, the Board accepted and adopted the Appropriate Assessment carried out in the Inspector's report in respect of the implications of the proposed development on the integrity of the aforementioned European Site, having regard to the site's conservation objectives.

In overall conclusion, the Board was satisfied that the proposed development would not adversely affect the integrity of European sites in view of the site's conservation objectives and there is no reasonable scientific doubt as to the absence of such effects.

## **Environmental Impact Assessment**

The Board completed an Environmental Impact Assessment of the proposed development taking account of:

- (a) the nature, scale, location and extent of the proposed development on a site,
- (b) the Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) and associated documentation submitted in support of the application,
- (c) the report of the planning authority,
- (d) the submissions received from the prescribed bodies, and
- (e) the Inspector's report.

The Board considered that the Environmental Impact Assessment Report, supported by the documentation submitted by the applicant, adequately considers alternatives to the proposed development and identifies and describes adequately the direct, indirect, secondary and cumulative effects of the proposed development on the environment. The Board agreed with the examination, set out in the Inspector's report, of the information contained in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report and associated documentation submitted by the applicant and submissions made in the course of the application. The Board considered that the main significant direct and indirect effects of the proposed development on the environment are, and would be mitigated, as follows:

- Noise, vibration, dust and shadow flicker during the construction and/or the operational phases would be avoided by the implementation of the measures set out in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) and the Construction and Environment Management Plan

(CEMP) which include specific provisions relating to the control of dust, noise and shadow flicker.

- The risk of soil instability and soil erosion during the construction and operational phases which would be mitigated by the implementation of measures set out in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) and the Construction and Environment Management Plan (CEMP) which include specific provisions relating to spoil management.
- The risk of pollution of ground and surface waters during the construction phase which would be mitigated by the implementation of measures set out in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) and the Construction and Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) which include specific provisions relating to groundwater, surface water and soil erosion.
- Biodiversity impacts, including on habitats, mammals, birds, bats, fisheries and invertebrates, would be mitigated by the implementation of specific mitigation to protect mammals, birds, bats, fisheries and invertebrates, during the construction and/or operational phases.
- The increase in vehicle movements and resulting traffic during the construction phase would be mitigated by the upgraded site access, the preparation of a Construction Traffic Management Plan.
- Landscape and visual impacts would arise during the operational phase from the insertion of the turbines and met mast into an afforested rural setting, the location and siting of which would assist in assimilating the works into the landscape.



- The impact on cultural heritage would be mitigated by archaeological monitoring with provision made for resolution of any archaeological features or deposits that may be identified.
- Positive environmental impacts would arise during the operational phase from the generation of renewable energy.

The Board completed an Environmental Impact Assessment in relation to the proposed development and concluded that, subject to the implementation of the mitigation measures proposed as set out in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report, and subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the effects of the proposed development on the environment, by itself and in combination with other plans and projects in the vicinity, would be acceptable. In doing so, the Board adopted the report and conclusions of the Inspector.

### **Proper Planning and Sustainable Development**

It is considered that, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the proposed development would be in accordance with European, national, regional and local planning, renewable energy, other and related policy, would not have an unacceptable impact on the landscape or ecology, would not seriously injure the visual or residential amenities of the area or of property in the vicinity and would be acceptable in terms of traffic safety and convenience. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

## Conditions

1. The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, including the further information received by the planning authority on the 7<sup>th</sup> day of April 2022, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development and the development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.

**Reason:** In the interest of clarity.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be constructed within five years from the date of this Order.

**Reason:** In the interest of clarity.

3. This permission shall be for a period of 30 years from the date of the first commissioning of the wind farm.

**Reason:** To enable the planning authority to review its operation in light of the circumstances then prevailing.



4. The developer shall ensure that all construction methods and environmental mitigation measures set out in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report, Natura Impact Statement, further information response submission and all associated documentation are implemented in full, save as may be required by conditions set out below.

**Reason:** In the interest of protection of the environment.

5. The developer shall ensure that all soil and water quality related mitigation measures are implemented in full and monitored throughout the life cycle of the construction works and monitored throughout the operational phase, and that excavation of the on-site peat depositories does not extend below winter water table levels.

**Reason:** In the interest of the protection of the environment.

6. The operation of the proposed development, by itself or in combination with any other permitted wind energy development, shall not result in noise levels, when measured externally at nearby noise sensitive locations, which exceed:

(a) Between the hours of 0700 and 2300:

(i) the greater of 5 dB(A)  $L_{90,10\text{min}}$  above background noise levels, or 45 dB(A)  $L_{90,10\text{min}}$ , at wind speeds of 5m/s or greater

(ii) 40 dB(A)  $L_{90,10\text{min}}$  at all other wind speeds

(b) 43 dB(A)  $L_{90,10\text{min}}$  at all other times where wind speeds are measured at 10m above ground level.

Prior to commencement of development, the developer shall submit to and agree in writing with the planning authority a noise compliance monitoring programme for the subject development, including any mitigation measures such as the de-rating of particular turbines. All noise measurements shall be carried out in accordance with ISO Recommendation R 1996 "Assessment of Noise with Respect to Community Response," as amended by ISO Recommendations R 1996-1. The results of the initial noise compliance monitoring shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority within six months of commissioning of the wind farm.

**Reason:** In the interest of residential amenity.

7. The following shadow flicker requirements shall be complied with:
- (a) Cumulative shadow flicker arising from the proposed development shall not exceed 30 minutes in any day or 30 hours in any year at any dwelling.
  - (b) The proposed turbines shall be fitted with appropriate equipment and software to control shadow flicker at dwellings.
  - (c) Prior to commencement of construction, a wind farm shadow flicker monitoring programme shall be prepared by a consultant with experience of similar monitoring work, in accordance with details to be submitted to the planning authority for written agreement. Details of a monitoring programme shall include the proposed monitoring equipment and methodology to be used, and the reporting schedule.

**Reason:** In the interest of residential amenity.

8. The following design requirements shall be complied with:
- (a) The wind turbines will have a tip height of 150 metres and a rotor diameter of 138 metres.
  - (b) Cables within the site shall be laid underground.
  - (c) The wind turbines shall be geared to ensure that the blades rotate in the same direction.
  - (d) No advertising material shall be placed on or otherwise be affixed to any structure on the site without a prior grant of planning permission.

**Reason:** In the interest of visual amenity.

9. In the event that the proposed development causes interference with telecommunications signals, effective measures shall be introduced to minimise interference with telecommunications signals in the area. Details of these measures, which shall be at the developer's expense, shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commissioning of the turbines and following consultation with the relevant authorities.

**Reason:** In the interests of protecting telecommunications signals and of residential amenity.

10. Details of aeronautical requirements shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. Prior to commissioning of the turbines, the developer shall inform the planning authority and the Irish Aviation Authority of the 'as constructed' tip heights and co-ordinates of the turbines and wind monitoring masts.

**Reason:** In the interest of air traffic safety.

11. Prior to commencement of development, a Transport Management Plan for the construction stage shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority. The traffic management plan shall incorporate details of the road network to be used by construction traffic, including over-sized loads, and detailed arrangements for the protection of roads, bridges, culverts or other structures to be traversed, as may be required. The plan should also contain details of how the developer intends to engage with and notify the local community in advance of the delivery of oversized loads. Any works, including reinstatement works, works to existing junctions on the national road network, and grid connection cable excavations under the national road network shall comply with Transport Infrastructure Ireland (TII) standards as outlined in TII Publications, County Council roads requirements, and shall be subject to the Road Safety Audit as appropriate.

**Reason:** In the interests of traffic safety and the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.



12. The developer shall retain the services of a suitably qualified and experienced Ecologist to undertake pre-construction surveys at the various project elements, immediately prior to commencing work in order to check for the presence of protected species in the vicinity including badgers, otters, deer, nesting birds and bats. A 500 metre buffer should be placed around any protected bird species nest sites and maintained free from construction works until the nest is vacated. Derogation licences shall be obtained as required.

**Reason:** In the interests of protecting ecology and wildlife in the area.

13. The developer shall retain the services of a suitably qualified and experienced bird specialist to undertake appropriate annual bird surveys of this site. Details of the surveys to be undertaken and associated reporting requirements shall be developed following consultation with, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. These reports shall be submitted on an agreed date annually for five years, with the prior written agreement of the planning authority. Copies of the reports shall be sent to the Department of Housing, Local Government, and Heritage.

**Reason:** To ensure appropriate monitoring of the impact of the development on the avifauna of the area.

A faint circular stamp is visible in the bottom right corner of the page, partially overlapping the signature. The stamp contains text that is mostly illegible but appears to include 'PLANNING AUTHORITY'. A blue ink signature is written over the stamp.

14. The developer shall implement mitigation measures to lessen the potential for bat fatalities arising from collision with rotating turbine blades which shall include feathering or pitching the blades out of the wind, and curtailment between mid-April to mid-October, between sunset and sunrise, at certain windspeeds and temperatures. Details of the curtailment shall be developed following consultation with, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development, and post construction monitoring and reporting to the planning authority shall be agreed and undertaken.

**Reason:** To ensure appropriate monitoring of the impact of the development on the bat species of the area.

15. The developer shall prepare an Invasive Species Management Plan to be agreed in writing with the planning authority and all plant and machinery used during the works should be thoroughly cleaned and washed before delivery to the site to prevent the spread of hazardous invasive species and pathogens.

**Reason:** In the interest of the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

16. Site development and building works shall be carried out only between the hours of 0700 to 1900 Mondays to Fridays inclusive, between 0800 to 1400 hours on Saturdays and not at all on Sundays and public holidays. Deviation from these times will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances where prior written approval has been received from the planning authority.

**Reason:** In order to safeguard the residential amenities of property in the vicinity.

17. The developer shall facilitate the preservation, recording and protection of archaeological materials or features that may exist within the site. In this regard, the developer shall –

- (a) notify the planning authority in writing at least four weeks prior to the commencement of any site operation (including hydrological and geotechnical investigations) relating to the proposed development,
- (b) employ a suitably-qualified archaeologist who shall monitor all site investigations and other excavation works, and
- (c) provide arrangements, acceptable to the planning authority, for the recording and for the removal of any archaeological material which the authority considers appropriate to remove.

In default of agreement on any of these requirements, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason:** In order to conserve the archaeological heritage of the site and to secure the preservation and protection of any remains that may exist within the site.

18. On full or partial decommissioning of the wind farm, or if the wind farm ceases operation for a period of more than one year, the wind monitoring mast, the turbines concerned and all decommissioned structures shall be removed, and foundations covered with soil to facilitate re-vegetation, all to be completed to the written satisfaction of the planning authority within three months of decommissioning or cessation of operation.

**Reason:** To ensure satisfactory reinstatement of the site upon full or partial cessation of the project.




19. Prior to commencement of development, the developer shall lodge with the planning authority a cash deposit, a bond of an insurance company, or such other security as may be acceptable to the planning authority, to secure the satisfactory reinstatement of the site and delivery route upon cessation of the project, coupled with an agreement empowering the planning authority to apply such security or part thereof to such reinstatement. The form and amount of the security shall be as agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of agreement, shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason:** To ensure satisfactory reinstatement of the site.



20. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to the commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authorities may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authorities and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

**Reason:** It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission.



**Stephen Bohan**  
**Member of An Bord Pleanála**  
**duly authorised to authenticate**  
**the seal of the Board.**

Dated this 15<sup>th</sup> day of October 2023.