

# Board Order ABP-317921-23

Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2022

Planning Authority: Dublin City Council

Planning Register Reference Number: LRD6026/23-S3

**Appeal** by Norwood Park Residents Association care of Armstrong Planning of 12 Clarinda Park North, Dún Laoghaire, Dublin, and by others, against the decision made on the 4<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2023 by Dublin City Council to grant subject to conditions a permission to Sandford Living Limited care of Thornton O'Connor Town Planning of 1 Kilmacud Road Upper, Dundrum, Dublin in accordance with plans and particulars lodged with the said Council.

Proposed Development: The development will principally consist of: the demolition of circa 4,883.9 square metres of existing structures on site including Milltown Park House (880 square metres); Milltown Park House rear extension (2,031 square metres); the Finlay Wing (622 square metres); the Archive (1,240 square metres); the link building between Tabor House and Milltown Park House rear extension to the front of the Chapel (74.5 square metres); and 36.4 square metres of the 'red brick link building' (single storey over basement) towards the south-western boundary; the refurbishment and reuse of Tabor House (1,575 square metres) and the Chapel (767.84 square metres), and the provision of a single storey glass entrance lobby to the front and side of the Chapel (51.9 square metres); and the provision of 636 number apartment and duplex units (87 number studios, 227 number one-bed units,



296 number two-bed units and 26 number three-bed units).

Block A1 will range in height from part five number storeys to part 10 number storeys and will comprise 96 number apartments;

Block A2 will range in height from part six number storeys to part eight number storeys (including part double height at ground floor level) and will comprise 128 number apartments;

Block B will range in height from part three to part seven number storeys and will comprise 93 number apartments;

Block C will range in height from part two number storeys to part eight number storeys (including part double height at ground floor level) and will comprise 163 number apartments;

Block D will range in height from three number storeys to five number storeys and will comprise 39 number apartments;

Block E will be three number storeys in height and will comprise 24 number duplex units and apartments; and

Block F will range in height from five number storeys to part seven number storeys and will comprise 93 number apartments.

The development also includes the refurbishment of Tabor House (four number storeys including lower ground floor level) and the Chapel to provide cultural/community space; the provision of ancillary residents' amenities and facilities and the provision of a crèche within Block F (380 square metres) with an outdoor play area.

The proposed works also include a new 2.4 metre high boundary wall across the site from east to west (towards the southern boundary) requiring the demolition of a portion of the red brick link building that lies within the subject site towards the south-western boundary (36.4 square metres) and the making good of the façade at the boundary.

The existing Link Building is the subject of a separate planning application (granted permission under DCC Reg. Ref. No. 3866/20 and ABP Reg. Ref. ABP-311552-21) that included a request for permission to demolish that Link

UC

Building, including the part of the building on the lands the subject of this application for LRD permission. If that application is first implemented, no demolition works to the Link Building will be required under this application for LRD permission. If that application is not first implemented, permission is here sought to demolish only that part of the Link Building now existing on the lands the subject of this application for permission and to make good the balance at the red line with a blank wall.

The development also provides a new access from Milltown Road (which will be the principal vehicular entrance to the site) in addition to utilising and upgrading the existing access from Sandford Road as a secondary access principally for deliveries, emergencies and taxis; new pedestrian access points; pedestrian/bicycle connections through the site; 337 number car parking spaces (288 number at basement level and 49 number at surface level); set down area for deliveries; bicycle parking; 18 number motorcycle spaces; bin storage; boundary treatments; private balconies and terraces facing all directions; external gantry access in sections of Blocks A1, A2 and C; hard and soft landscaping including public open space and communal open space; sedum roofs; PV panels; substations; lighting; plant; lift cores and all other associated site works above and below ground.

The proposed development has a gross floor space of circa 54,507 square metres above ground level over a partial basement (under part of Block A1 and under Blocks A2, B and C) measuring circa 10,607 square metres, which includes parking spaces, bin storage, bike storage and plant.

This is a large-scale residential development at this c. 4.26-hectare site at Milltown Park, Sandford Road, Dublin. Works are also proposed on Milltown Road and Sandford Road to facilitate access to the development including improvements to pedestrian facilities on an area of circa 0.16 hectares. The development's surface water drainage network shall discharge from the site via a proposed 300 millimetre diameter pipe along Milltown Road through the junction of Milltown Road / Sandford Road prior to outfalling to the existing

UC.

drainage network on Eglinton Road (approximately 200 metres from the Sandford Road / Eglinton Road junction), with these works incorporating an area of circa 0.32 hectares. The development site area, road works and drainage works areas will provide a total application site area of circa 4.74 hectares.

### **Decision**

GRANT permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the said plans and particulars based on the reasons and considerations under and subject to the conditions set out below.

#### **Reasons and Considerations**

The Board had regard to:

- (a) the location of the site on lands zoned objective Z12 in the Dublin City County Development Plan 2022 - 2028 and the policies and provisions set out in respect of residential development,
- (b) the policies and objectives of the Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028;
- (c) the nature, scale and design of the proposed development and the availability in the area of infrastructure to facilitate the development of the site;
- (d) the pattern of existing and permitted development in the area;
- (e) the provisions of Housing for All, A New Housing Plan for Ireland 2021;

W

- (f) the Guidelines for Sustainable Residential Developments in Urban Areas and the accompanying Urban Design Manual – a Best Practice Guide, issued by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in May 2009;
- (g) the Urban Development and Building Heights Guidelines for Planning Authorities, prepared by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government in December 2018;
- h) the Sustainable Urban Housing: Design Standards for New Apartments issued by the Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government 2022:
- the Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS), issued by the Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport and the Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government in March 2013;
- (j) the Planning System and Flood Risk Management' (including the associated 'Technical Appendices') 2009;
- (k) the Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities 2011.
- (I) the provisions of the Climate Action Plan 2023;
- (m) the policies and objectives set out in the National Planning Framework;
- (n) the policies and objectives of the Regional and Spatial Economic Strategy for the Eastern and Midland Regional Assembly;
- (o) the Environmental Impact Assessment Report submitted with the application; and
- (p) the grounds of appeal and observations received.

### **Appropriate Assessment Screening**

The Board completed an Appropriate Assessment screening exercise in relation to the potential effects of the proposed development on European Sites, taking into account the nature and scale of the proposed development on serviced lands, the nature of the receiving environment located in a built-up urban area, the distances to the nearest European sites and the hydrological pathway considerations, submissions and observations on file, the information and reports submitted as part of the subject application, and the Planning Inspector's report. In completing the screening exercise, the Board agreed with, and adopted the report of, the Planning Inspector and considered that, by itself or in combination with other development, plans and projects in the vicinity, the proposed development would not be likely to have a significant effect on any European Site in view of the Conservation Objectives of such sites, and that a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment is not, therefore, required.



### **Environmental Impact Assessment**

The Board completed in compliance with Section 172 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, an Environmental Impact Assessment of the proposed development, taking into account:

- (a) the nature, scale, location and extent of the proposed development in an urban area served by foul and surface water sewerage systems,
- (b) the Environmental Impact Assessment Report and associated documentation submitted with the application,
- (c) the grounds of appeal and observations, and reports and submissions from the planning authority and prescribed bodies during the course of the application and appeal; and
- (d) the Inspector's report and addendum to same.

The Board considered that the Environmental Impact Assessment Report, supported by the documentation submitted by the applicant, provided information which is reasonable and sufficient to allow the Board to reach a reasoned conclusion on the significant effects of the proposed development on the environment, taking into account current knowledge and methods of assessment and the results of the examination set out in the Inspector's Report and addendum to same.

The Board is satisfied that the information contained in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report is up to date and complies with the provisions of EU Directive 2014/52/EU amending Directive 2011/92/EU. The Board considered that the main significant direct and indirect effects of the proposed development on the environment are those arising from the impacts listed below.

### **Reasoned Conclusions on the Significant Effects**

The Board considered that the main significant direct and indirect effects of the proposed development on the environment are, and will be mitigated as follows:

- Significant direct positive effects with regard to population and material assets due to the increase in the housing stock that it would make available in the urban area.
- A significant direct effect on land by the change in the use and appearance of a relatively large area of underutilised institutional lands to residential use. Given the location of the site within the built-up area and the public need for housing in the region, this effect would not have a significant negative impact on the environment.
- Potential significant effects on soil during construction, which will be
  mitigated by the re-use of material on the site and the removal of
  potentially hazardous material from the site, and the implementation of
  measures to control emissions of sediment to water and dust to air
  during construction.
- Potential effects arising from noise and vibration during construction which will be mitigated by appropriate management measures including implementation of Construction and Environmental Management Plans.
- Potential effects on air during construction which will be mitigated by a dust management plan including a monitoring programme.
- Biodiversity impacts mitigated by retention of trees, additional planting/landscaping/woodland management, bat, bird box and swift brick schemes, additional surveys and monitoring pre and during construction, and appropriate work practices.



- Potential indirect effects on water which will be mitigated during the
  occupation of the development by the proposed system for surface water
  management and attenuation with respect to stormwater runoff and the
  drainage of foul effluent to the public foul sewerage system, and which
  will be mitigated during construction by appropriate management
  measures to control the emissions of sediment to water.
- Construction traffic impacts mitigated by the management of construction traffic by way of Construction and Environmental Management Plans and operational traffic impacts by way of a Mobility Management Plan and Parking Strategy.
- Archaeology and Architectural Heritage would be mitigated by archaeological monitoring during construction. Given the location of the site within the urban area no significant adverse direct, indirect or cumulative effects are likely to arise.
- A positive effect on the streetscape as the proposed development would improve the amenity of the land through the provision of dedicated public open spaces and improved public realm.

The Environmental Impact Assessment Report has considered that the main significant direct and indirect effects of the proposed development on the environment would be primarily mitigated by environmental management measures, as appropriate. The likely significant environmental effects arising as a consequence of the proposed development have therefore been satisfactorily identified, described and assessed.

The Board completed an Environmental Impact Assessment in relation to the proposed development and concluded that, subject to the implementation of the mitigation measures proposed in each chapter of the Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR), and, subject to compliance with the conditions set out herein, the effects on the environment of the proposed development by itself and cumulatively with other development in the vicinity would be acceptable. In doing so, the Board adopted the report and conclusions of the reporting inspector including addendum to same.

### **Conclusions on Proper Planning and Sustainable Development**

The Board considered, having regard to the zoning objectives for the site as set out in the Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028, the pattern of existing development in the immediate vicinity of the site, the Environmental Impact Assessment Report submitted with the application to Dublin City Council and subsequent Environmental Impact Assessment and Appropriate Assessment Screening in the Inspectors Report and addendum to same, within a reasonable walking distance of services and amenities, and access to public transport, it is considered that the proposed development would not seriously injure the residential or visual amenities of the area or of property in the vicinity, would be consistent with national and local planning policy and would be acceptable in terms of design, scale, height, mix and quantum of development, and in terms of pedestrian and traffic safety and that the development would not subject future occupiers to flood risk or increase the risk of flood elsewhere. It is considered that the proposed development would constitute an acceptable residential density having regard to the size and disposition of the site, the location of the site proximate to a range of public transport options and cycle and pedestrian pathways and the separation distances available to adjoining properties. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

## **Conditions**

The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development, or as otherwise stipulated by conditions hereunder, and the development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

 The mitigation and monitoring measures outlined in Chapter 20 of the Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) submitted with this application, shall be carried out in full, except where otherwise required by conditions attached to this permission.

**Reason**: To protect the environment.

Details of the materials, colours and textures of all the external finishes
to the proposed building shall be as submitted with the application,
unless otherwise agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to
commencement of development.

**Reason:** In the interest of visual amenity.

4. An agreement shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to the occupation of the development which provides details of the uses and groups to avail of the sites provision of 5% community, arts and culture spaces within the development.

**Reason:** In order to comply with the requirements set out in the development plan.

5. Proposals for a development name and numbering scheme and associated signage shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. Thereafter, all such names and numbering shall be provided in accordance with the agreed scheme.

**Reason:** In the interest of urban legibility.

6. Public lighting shall be provided in accordance with a scheme, which shall include lighting along pedestrian routes through the communal open spaces, details of which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development/installation of lighting. Such lighting shall be provided prior to the making available for occupation of any apartment unit and shall have regard to impact in terms of biodiversity including bats.

Reason: In the interests of amenity and public safety.

7. All service cables associated with the proposed development (such as electrical, telecommunications and communal television) shall be located underground. Ducting shall be provided by the developer to facilitate the provision of broadband infrastructure within the proposed development.

**Reason:** In the interests of visual and residential amenity.

8. No additional development shall take place above roof level, including lift motors, air handling equipment, storage tanks, ducts or other external plant other than those shown on the drawings hereby approved, unless authorised by a prior grant of planning permission.

**Reason:** To safeguard the amenities of surrounding occupiers and the visual amenities of the area in general.

9. The streets that are constructed and/or completed on foot of this permission shall comply with the standards and specifications set out in of the Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS) issued in 2019. All streets shall be local streets as set out in section 3.2.1 of DMURS whose carriageway shall not exceed 5.5 metres in width. Where perpendicular parking is provided on those streets the additional width required for vehicles to manoeuvre shall be incorporated into the spaces in accordance with figure 4.82 of DMURS.

**Reason:** In the interests of road safety and to ensure that the streets in the authorised development facilitate movement by sustainable transport modes in accordance with the applicable standards set out in DMURS.

10. The road network serving the proposed development, including turning bays, junction with the public road, parking areas, footpaths and kerbs, access road to service areas shall be in accordance with the detailed construction standards of the planning authority for such works.

Reason: In the interest of amenity and of traffic and pedestrian safety.

11. A minimum of 10% of all car parking spaces should be provided with functioning EV charging stations/ points, and ducting shall be provided for all remaining car parking spaces, including in-curtilage spaces, facilitating the installation of EV charging points/stations at a later date. Where proposals relating to the installation of EV ducting and charging stations/points has not been submitted with the application, in accordance with the above noted requirements, such proposals shall be submitted and agreed in writing with the planning authority prior to the occupation of the development. The car parking spaces for sole use of the car sharing club shall also be provided with functioning EV charging stations/ points.

**Reason:** To provide for and/or future proof the development such as would facilitate the use of Electric Vehicles.

12. (a) Prior to the opening/occupation of the development, a Mobility
Management Strategy shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing
with, the planning authority. This shall provide for incentives to
encourage the use of public transport, cycling, walking and
carpooling by residents/occupants/staff employed in the
development and to reduce and regulate the extent of parking. The
mobility strategy shall be prepared and implemented by the
management company for all units within the development.

(b) The Mobility Management Strategy shall incorporate a Car Parking Management Strategy for the overall development, which shall address the management and assignment of car spaces to residents and uses over time and shall include a strategy for any car-share parking. Car parking spaces shall not be sold with units but shall be assigned and managed in a separate capacity via leasing or permit arrangements.

**Reason:** In the interest of encouraging the use of sustainable modes of transport, traffic and pedestrian safety.

13. The level of bicycle parking spaces specified (1391) shall be provided within the site. Details of the layout, marking demarcation and security provisions for these spaces shall be as submitted with this application, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

**Reason:** To ensure that adequate bicycle parking provision is available to serve the proposed development, in the interest of sustainable transportation.

14. The developer shall enter into water and wastewater connection agreement(s) with Uisce Eireann, prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of public health.

15. Drainage arrangements including the attenuation and disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services. Prior to commencement of development the developer shall submit to the planning authority for written agreement a Stage 2 - Detailed Design Stage Storm Water Audit. Upon Completion of the development, a Stage 3 Completion Stormwater Audit to demonstrate Sustainable Urban Drainage System measures have been installed and are working as designed, and that there has been no misconnections or damage to storm water drainage infrastructure during construction, shall be submitted to the planning authority for written agreement.

Reason: In the interest of public health and surface water management.

16. The site shall be landscaped (and earthworks carried out) in accordance with the detailed comprehensive scheme of landscaping which accompanied the application submitted, unless otherwise agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of residential and visual amenity.

17. Site development and building works shall be carried out only between the hours of 0700 to 1900 Mondays to Fridays inclusive, between the hours of 0800 and 1400 hours on Saturdays, and not at all on Sundays and public holidays. Deviation from these times will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances where prior written approval has been received from the planning authority.

**Reason:** In order to safeguard the residential amenities of property in the vicinity.

- 18. The developer shall facilitate the preservation, recording and protection of archaeological materials or features that may exist within the site. In this regard, the developer shall
  - (a) notify the planning authority in writing at least four weeks prior to the commencement of any site operation (including hydrological and geotechnical investigations) relating to the proposed development,
  - (b) employ a suitably-qualified archaeologist who shall monitor all site investigations and other excavation works, and
  - (c) provide arrangements, acceptable to the planning authority, for the recording and for the removal of any archaeological material which the authority considers appropriate to remove.

In default of agreement on any of these requirements, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason:** In order to conserve the archaeological heritage of the site and to secure the preservation and protection of any remains that may exist within the site.

19. A plan containing details for the management of waste (and, in particular, recyclable materials) within the development, including the provision of facilities for the storage, separation and collection of the waste and, in particular, recyclable materials and for the ongoing operation of these facilities for each apartment unit shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority not later than six months from the date of commencement of the development. Thereafter, the waste shall be managed in accordance with the agreed plan.

**Reason:** In the interest of residential amenity, and to ensure the provision of adequate refuse storage.

20. Prior to the commencement of development, the developer or any agent acting on its behalf, shall prepare a Resource Waste Management Plan (RWMP) as set out in the EPA's Best Practice Guidelines for the Preparation of Resource and Waste Management Plans for Construction and Demolition Projects (2021) including demonstration of proposals to adhere to best practice and protocols. The RWMP shall include specific proposals as to how the RWMP will be measured and monitored for effectiveness; these details shall be placed on the file and retained as part of the public record. The RWMP must be submitted to the planning authority for written agreement prior to the commencement of development. All records (including for waste and all resources) pursuant to the agreed RWMP shall be made available for inspection at the site office at all times.

Reason: In the interest of sustainable waste management.

- 21. The construction of the development shall be managed in accordance with a Construction Management Plan, which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall provide details of intended construction practice for the development, including:
  - (a) Location of the site and materials compound(s) including area(s)identified for the storage of construction refuse;
  - (b) Location of areas for construction site offices and staff facilities;
  - (c) Details of site security fencing and hoardings;
  - (d) Details of on-site car parking facilities for site workers during the course of construction;
  - (e) Details of the timing and routing of construction traffic to and from the construction site and associated directional signage, to include proposals to facilitate the delivery of abnormal loads to the site;

- (f) Measures to obviate queuing of construction traffic on the adjoining road network;
- (g) Measures to prevent the spillage or deposit of clay, rubble or other debris on the public road network;
- (h) Alternative arrangements to be put in place for pedestrians and vehicles in the case of the closure of any public road or footpath during the course of site development works;
- (i) Details of appropriate mitigation measures for noise, dust and vibration, and monitoring of such levels;
- (j) Containment of all construction-related fuel and oil within specially constructed bunds to ensure that fuel spillages are fully contained.
   Such bunds shall be roofed to exclude rainwater;
- (k) Off-site disposal of construction/demolition waste and details of how it is proposed to manage excavated soil;
- (I) Means to ensure that surface water run-off is controlled such that no silt or other pollutants enter local surface water sewers or drains.
- (m) A record of daily checks that the works are being undertaken in accordance with the Construction Management Plan shall be kept for inspection by the planning authority.
- (n) Alternative arrangements to be put in place for pedestrians, cyclists and vehicles in the case of the closure of any public road or footpath during the course of site development works.

**Reason:** In the interest of amenities, public health and safety.



22. Prior to commencement of development, the applicant or other person with an interest in the land to which the application relates shall enter into an agreement in writing with the planning authority in relation to the provision of housing in accordance with the requirements of section 94(4) and section 96(2) and (3) (Part V) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, unless an exemption certificate shall have been applied for and been granted under section 97 of the Act, as amended. Where such an agreement is not reached within eight weeks from the date of this order, the matter in dispute (other than a matter to which section 96(7) applies) may be referred by the planning authority or any other prospective party to the agreement to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason:** To comply with the requirements of Part V of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, and of the housing strategy in the development plan of the area.

23. The management and maintenance of the proposed development following its completion shall be the responsibility of a legally constituted management company. Detailed proposals in this regard shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to occupation of the development.

**Reason:** To ensure the satisfactory completion and maintenance of this development.

- 24. The public open space areas of the development shall operate as a public park with public access and use of the associated facilities provided. In this regard:
  - (a) a management agreement shall be submitted to the planning authority and agreed in writing prior to the occupation of the development;
  - (b) management and maintenance of the public open space areas shall be the responsibility of the developer; and
  - (c) all required landscaping, upgrading works and public access arrangements shall be provided to the satisfaction of the planning authority prior to the completion of the development.

**Reason**: In the interest of amenity and to secure the satisfactory completion and operation of the public open spaces of the development.

25. Prior to the commencement of any duplex unit in the development as permitted, the applicant or any person with an interest in the land shall enter into an agreement with the planning authority (such agreement must specify the number and location of each duplex unit), pursuant to Section 47 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that restricts duplex units permitted, to first occupation by individual purchasers i.e. those not being a corporate entity, and/or by those eligible for the occupation of social and/or affordable housing, including cost rental housing.

**Reason:** To restrict new housing development to use by persons of a particular class or description in order to ensure an adequate choice and supply of housing, including affordable housing, in the common good.

26. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

**Reason:** It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission.

27. Prior to commencement of development, the developer shall lodge with the planning authority a cash deposit, a bond of an insurance company, or other security to secure the reinstatement of public roads which may be damaged by the transport of materials to the site, to secure the provision and satisfactory completion of roads, footpaths, watermains, drains, open space and other services required in connection with the development, coupled with an agreement empowering the local authority to apply such security or part thereof to the satisfactory completion of any part of the development. The form and amount of the security shall be as agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of agreement, shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála for determination.

**Reason:** To ensure the satisfactory completion of the development.

Member of An Bord Pleanála duly authorised to authenticate the seal of the Board.

Dated this 19th day of Jecember 2023.