

# Commission Order ABP-319532-24

Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2022

Planning Authority: Dublin City Council

Planning Register Reference Number: 4900/23

**Appeal** by David O'Sullivan of 59 Crumlin Road, Dublin against the decision made on the 21<sup>st</sup> day of March 2024 by Dublin City Council to grant, subject to conditions, a permission to Templeogue Synge Street GAA Club, care of Thornton O'Connor Town Planning of 1 Kilmacud Road Upper, Dundrum, Dublin in accordance with plans and particulars lodged with the said Council:

Proposed Development: The development principally consists of: the demolition and removal of the existing storey clubhouse (190.1 square metres) and hard-surfacing; the realignment and resurfacing of the northern senior pitch (pitch number 1), which is to be partially enclosed by a 990 millimetre high spectator railing on its western and northern sides and the construction of a new two-storey clubhouse (approximately 745.6 square metres). The clubhouse notably includes changing rooms; gym; south-east facing, first-floor terrace; rooftop solar panels; a digital score Commission and 2 number logos (signage). In addition, the development proposes the provision of a shed building (approximately 185.6 square metres) with an immediate, meanwhile use as a gym, to be changed to maintenance and storage use upon completion of the clubhouse; 61 number car parking spaces

(including mobility impaired and EV charging spaces); coach and mini bus parking; 103 number cycle parking spaces; eight number new floodlights ranging in height from 18 metres to 20 metres; public lighting; generator; new goal posts and 12 metre high retractable ball-stop netting in two number locations; hard and soft landscaping and all associated site and development works above and below ground, Dolphin Park, Crumlin Road, Dublin.

#### Decision

GRANT permission for the above proposed development in accordance with the said plans and particulars based on the reasons and considerations under and subject to the conditions set out below.

#### **Reasons and Considerations**

Having regard to the location of the application site in an area zoned Z9 (Amenity/ Open Space Lands/Green Network), the relevant zoning objective for which is 'to preserve, provide and improve recreational amenity, open space and ecosystem services' in the Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028 where a 'club house associated with the primary Z9 objective' is identified as a use which is permitted in principle, to the existing sport and recreational use of the site and the design and scale of the proposed development, it is considered that the proposed development, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, would not detract from the visual or established amenities of properties in the area, would not give rise to traffic hazard, and would, therefore, be in accordance with the development plan and the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

MAI

## **Appropriate Assessment Stage 1**

While noting there is no direct ecological connection with or to the site; that there is only a weak indirect hydrological connection with the Special Areas of Conservation; and the significant distance from the site to the South Dublin Bay Special Areas of Conservation, the Commission, in an abundance of caution, agreed with and adopted the screening assessment and conclusion carried out in the Inspector's report which outlined that the North Dublin Bay Special Area of Conservation (Site Code 000206), South Dublin Bay Special Area of Conservation (Site Code 000210), South Dublin Bay and River Tolka Estuary Special Protection Area (Site Code 004024), North Bull Island Special Protection Area (Site Code 004006), and Baldoyle Bay Special Protection Area (Site Code 004016), are the only European Sites in respect of which the proposed development has the potential to have a significant effect, in view of the Conservation Objectives for those sites, and that Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment is, therefore, required.

## **Appropriate Assessment Stage 2**

The Commission considered the Appropriate Assessment Screening and Natura Impact Statement, and associated documentation submitted with the planning application and appeal, the mitigation measures contained therein, the submissions on file, and the Inspector's assessment, and completed an Appropriate Assessment of the implications of the proposed development for the aforementioned European sites, in view of the sites' conservation objectives. In completing the Appropriate Assessment, the Commission considered, in particular, the following:

 the likely direct and indirect impacts arising from the proposed development both individually or in combination with other plans or projects,

Mal

- (ii) the mitigation measures which are included as part of the current proposal, and
- (iii) the conservation objectives for the European sites.

In completing the Appropriate Assessment, the Commission accepted and adopted the Appropriate Assessment carried out in the Inspector's report in respect of the potential effects of the proposed development on the integrity of the aforementioned European sites, having regard to the sites' conservation objectives.

In overall conclusion, the Commission was satisfied that the proposed development, by itself or in combination with other plans or projects, would not adversely affect the integrity of the European sites, in view of the sites' conservation objectives and there is no reasonable scientific doubt as to the absence of such effects.

### **Conditions**

1. The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, as amended by the further plans and particulars received by the planning authority on the 28<sup>th</sup> day of February 2024, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development and the development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

2. The mitigation measures contained in the submitted Natura Impact Statement (NIS), shall be implemented.

Reason: To protect the integrity of European Sites.

3. The disposal of surface water shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services. Prior to the commencement of development, the developer shall submit details for the disposal of surface water from the site for the written agreement of the planning authority.

**Reason:** To prevent flooding and in the interest of sustainable drainage.

- 4. (a) All foul sewage and soiled water shall be discharged to the public foul sewer.
  - (b) Only clean, uncontaminated storm water shall be discharged to the surface water drainage system.

**Reason:** In the interest of public health.

5. Car and cycle parking shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such facilities. Emergency access to the pitch shall be kept free at all times. The measures outlined in the Mobility Management Framework, as per the submitted Traffic and Transportation Assessment shall be implemented to the satisfaction of the planning authority. Prior to the commencement of development, the developer shall submit details for the written agreement of the planning authority, in relation to the following matters:

- (a) A revised laneway drawing detailing a demarcated footway along the access road and internal roads along with proposed materials and surface finish. The footway shall be suitably higher than the access road and a section drawing to this effect shall be submitted. The footway shall be implemented prior to the completion of the development.
- (b) Proposal to modify the existing inner gate to ensure there is no permanent height restriction for taller vehicles, such as a rigid bus, where access to the overall site is required.

**Reason:** In the interests of road safety and the sustainable development of the area.

- 6. The landscaping scheme, as submitted to the planning authority on the 1<sup>st</sup> day of December, 2023 shall be carried out within the first planting season following substantial completion of external construction works. In addition to the proposals in the submitted scheme, the following shall be carried out:
  - (a) A gated boundary rail/fence between the clubhouse/carpark area and the playing field areas.
  - (b) Additional large canopy tree species to the northern boundary of the car park area.

Reason: In the interests of residential and visual amenity.

- 7. (a) Proposed lighting must comply with the Guidance Note GN08/23 Bats and Artificial Lighting at Night, published by Bat Conservation Trust and the Institution of Lighting Professionals (2023). Lighting shall be directional and avoid areas of hedgerows and trees that could be used by commuting and foraging bats, and nesting birds.
  - (b) All lighting shall be switched off at the site by 2200 hours (10 pm) and no lighting shall be left on overnight or lit during daylight hours when not required. Any security lighting shall be fitted with motion sensors and automatic timers to ensure that lighting is on for brief periods and does not disturb wildlife.
  - (c) A pre-demolition bat survey shall be carried out prior to the demolition of the existing clubhouse building. The pre-demolition survey shall be submitted to the planning authority, for written agreement, prior to the demolition of the clubhouse.
  - (d) A bat and bird nest monitoring survey to be completed at the appropriate time of year by a suitably qualified ecologist following installation of the sports lighting on the site. If the lighting is found to be causing an impact to commuting or foraging bats or nesting birds, additional mitigation must be put in place by the applicant. The post monitoring report and mitigation measures shall be submitted to the planning authority for review and written agreement.
  - (e) A post monitoring bat survey shall be conducted at the appropriate time of year to see whether the screening mitigation is effective, or if further screening is required. The post monitoring report and mitigation measures shall be submitted to the planning authority for review and written agreement.

MH

**Reason:** To conserve bats and to comply with the European Communities (Birds and Natural Habitats Regulations 2011 (S. I. No. 477 of 2011) and the Wildlife Acts (1976-2021).

8. All mitigation and monitoring measures outlined in the Ecology Note shall be implemented in full to the satisfaction of the planning authority.

Reason: in the interests of biodiversity and sustainable development.

9. A Construction and Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to the commencement of development. The CEMP shall include but not be limited to proposed access arrangements for construction vehicles, swept path analysis for such vehicles, hours of working, construction phase controls for dust, noise and vibration, waste management, protection of soils, groundwaters, and surface waters, site housekeeping, emergency response planning, site environmental policy, and project roles and responsibilities.

**Reason:** In the interest of the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

10. Prior to the commencement of development, the developer or any agent acting on its behalf, shall prepare a Resource Waste Management Plan (RWMP) as set out in the Environmental Protection Agency's Best Practice Guidelines for the Preparation of Resource and Waste Management Plans for Construction and Demolition Projects (2021) including demonstration of proposals to adhere to best practice and protocols. The RWMP shall include specific proposals as to how the RWMP will be measured and monitored for effectiveness, these details shall be placed on the file and retained as part of the public record. The RWMP must be submitted to the planning authority for written

MH

agreement prior to the commencement of development. All records (including for waste and all resources) pursuant to the agreed RWMP shall be made available for inspection at the site office at all times.

**Reason:** In the interest of the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

- During the operational phase of the proposed development the noise level shall not exceed;
  - (a) 55 dB(A) rated sound level between the hours of 0700 to 2300, and
  - (b) 45 dB(A) 15 min and 60 dB LAfmax, 15 min at all other times, (corrected for a tonal or impulsive component) as measured at the nearest noise sensitive location or at any point along the boundary of the site.

Procedures for the purpose of determining compliance with this limit shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: To protect the amenities of property in the vicinity of the site.

12. All plant, including any generator units, shall be sited in a manner so as not to cause nuisance at sensitive locations due to noise or odour. All mechanical plant and ventilation inlets and outlets shall be sound insulated and/or fitted with sound attenuators to ensure that noise levels do not pose a nuisance at noise sensitive locations.

Reason: To protect the amenities of property in the vicinity of the site.

Map

13. All public service cables for the development, including electrical and telecommunications cables, shall be located underground throughout the site.

Reason: In the interest of visual amenity.

14. The floodlights or any equivalent replacement floodlights shall be as specified in the application. The floodlights shall be directed onto the playing surface of the pitch and away from adjacent housing, gardens and roads. The floodlights shall be directed and cowled such as to reduce, as far as possible, the light scatter over adjacent houses, gardens and roads The floodlights shall fully comply with recommendations contained in the Lighting Design Summary Report to the satisfaction of the planning authority.

Reason: In the interests of residential amenity and traffic safety.

15. The floodlighting shall be used only during periods when training or matches are taking place, and at all other times the floodlighting shall remain off. The operational hours of the floodlighting shall not extend beyond 2200 hours.

Reason: To protect the amenities of property in the vicinity.

**Mary Henchy** 

Planning Commissioner of An Coimisiún Pleanála duly authorised to authenticate the seal of the Commission.

Dated this H day of Tale

2025.