



An
Bord
Pleanála

Board Order 29S.PA0049

Planning and Development Acts, 2000 to 2017

Planning Authority: Dublin City Council

Application for permission under section 37E of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, in accordance with plans and particulars, including an environmental impact statement and a Natura impact statement, lodged with An Bord Pleanála on the 10th day of March, 2017 by the Health Service Executive care of GVA Planning of 2nd Floor, Seagrave House, 19 – 20 Earlsfort Terrace, Dublin.

Proposed Development: Permission for a period of 10 years for the development of the new National Maternity Hospital, comprising a 244-number bed maternity hospital; developments for St. Vincent's University Hospital (including 38-number in-patient beds) to replace existing facilities on site; new campus wide shared non-clinical support services; a shared service yard, an extension to the existing multi-storey car park and all ancillary site development, site services, utilities and landscaping works. The proposed development will consist of a series of developments on a 10.55-hectare site on the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus comprising the following:

- The construction of a new 50,776 square metre gross floor area building to be developed on a site at the eastern end of the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus adjacent to and connected with the St. Vincent's Clinical Services Building. The proposed building will rise to five and six storeys plus additional plant areas at roof level over the prevailing ground level and a proposed basement to an overall height to parapet level of 41.285 metres ODM (to top of lift shaft plantroom; 47.335 metres ODM to top of boiler flues). The new structure provides for the new National Maternity Hospital (to be relocated from Holles Street, Dublin 2) including the following medical and surgical specialities – maternity, gynaecology, paediatrics, neonatology, pathology,

genetics, anaesthesia, emergency medicine, endocrinology/diabetes, pain management, oncology, colposcopy, urodynamics, foetal medicine, haematology, and 244-number beds; replacement facilities for St. Vincent's University Hospital including a new dermatology unit, two number SVUH wards (38 number beds), SVUH medical records department, finance department offices and shared facilities including a new waste marshalling yard, deliveries yard, purchasing and stores department, catering department and canteen, clinical engineering and hospital sterile services department. Bridge/corridor links are proposed to the existing clinical services building and existing ward block at levels 0, 2, 3 and 4 and will include modifications to the existing laboratories within the existing St. Vincent's Hospital.

- The construction of temporary buildings (903 square metres in total) including a single storey catering staff changing facilities, a single storey household services store, a single storey carpenter's workshop and a single storey temporary canteen and access corridor.
- The expansion of the existing multi-storey car park facility (11,884 square metres gross floor area; two levels vertically and a five level extension at its western end adjacent to Nutley Lane to an overall height of 18.84 metres ODM to top of lift shaft) to accommodate the additional parking demand associated with the National Maternity Hospital and the re-provision of existing campus spaces that are displaced due to the works. The enhanced facility will provide a net increase of 277 number spaces on the campus in addition to 149 number displaced spaces to accommodate a total of 922 number spaces over five levels.
- Two new entrances to the multi-storey car park including a new access to the lowest level (Level 0) through the existing St. Rita's surface car park and a new high level access (Level 5) adjacent to the current access. The new low level access will be under the existing pedestrian link through the campus from the Merrion Road. The provision of the new access arrangements will necessitate the displacement of a number of spaces in both the multi-storey car park and the adjacent St. Rita's surface car park. The existing vehicular access point will be closed and a new taxi holding area will be provided adjacent to the western end of the extended car park close to Nutley Lane.

- The demolition of existing buildings comprising 8,765 square metres of space including the existing canteen, catering staff changing facilities, transitional care unit, neurology unit pharmacy, energy centre including existing chimney stack, carpenter's workshop, electrical switch room, kitchens, purchasing stores, dermatology unit, waste marshalling yard and the nissen hut adjacent to the existing car park.
- The construction of a new single storey ESB substation, switch room (119 square metres) and oil tank enclosure (236 square metres) adjacent to the existing breast check building, two new single storey bicycle store enclosures (170 square metres and 158 square metres) located to the south of the existing nurse education centre for 192 number bicycle spaces which in conjunction with new covered and convenience cycle spaces dispersed across the campus will provide a net increase of 235 number bicycle spaces, providing a total of 485 bicycle spaces on the campus, a new single story VIE enclosure to the south of the campus adjacent to the existing campus service road (91 square metres) and a new single storey storage building adjacent to the multi-storey car park (110 square metres). Modifications to existing Herbert Wing car park including access ramp and steps to the new building and an ambulance set-down area to the southern elevation.
- Proposed modifications to the existing road network within the campus to accommodate the new hospital building and car parking facilities, hard and soft landscaping elements to the perimeter of the proposed building including modification of ground levels, modifications to existing road junctions at Nutley Lane and Merrion Road (subject to the approval of the roads authority), a temporary construction access from Nutley Lane and general landscaping modifications to campus access routes.
- The proposed development also includes all ancillary site clearance, construction, site development and landscaping works, which include, but are not limited to, the relocation of medical and surgical gasses, the diversion of existing hospital campus site services, new and replacement cycle spaces, new services, water mains and communications networks and all required phasing, sequencing and site development works, all at the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, Dublin.

Decision

Grant permission under section 37G of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, for the above proposed development in accordance with the said plans and particulars based on the reasons and considerations under and subject to the conditions set out below.

Determine under section 37H(2)(c) the sum to be paid by the applicant in respect of costs associated with the application as set out in the Schedule of Costs below.

Matters Considered

In making its decision, the Board had regard to those matters to which, by virtue of the Planning and Development Acts and Regulations made thereunder, it was required to have regard. Such matters included any submissions and observations received by it in accordance with statutory provisions.

Reasons and Considerations

In coming to its decision, the Board had regard to the following:

- (a) the provisions of the *National Maternity Strategy 2016 – 2026*, which seeks to co-locate all maternity hospitals and refers to the proposal to redevelop the National Maternity Hospital within the St. Vincent's Campus,
- (b) the provisions of *Building a Recovery: Infrastructure and Capital Investment, 2016 – 2021* which supports a reorganisation of national maternity services including the relocation of the National Maternity Hospital to the St. Vincent's Campus,

- (c) the provisions of the *National Spatial Strategy 2002 – 2020*,
- (d) the provisions of *Smarter Travel – A Sustainable Transport Future 2009 – 2020*,
- (e) the provisions of the *Regional Planning Guidelines for the Greater Dublin Area 2010 – 2022*,
- (f) the provisions of the *Transport Strategy for the Greater Dublin Area, 2016 – 2035*,
- (g) the provisions of the *Dublin City Development Plan 2016 – 2022*,
- (h) the community need, public interest served and the overall benefits to be achieved from the proposed development,
- (i) the documentation submitted with the application include the environmental impact statement and the Natura impact statement and the draft Construction Management Plan,
- (j) the submissions and observations made in connection with the planning application, including at the oral hearing, and
- (k) the report of the Inspector.

Appropriate Assessment Screening:

The Board completed an Appropriate Assessment Screening exercise in relation to the potential effects of the proposed development on designated European Sites, taking into account the nature, scale and location of the proposed development (being a redevelopment of land within a zoned and serviced hospital campus in an urban area), the Appropriate Assessment Screening Report submitted with the

application and the Inspector's report and submissions on file. In completing the screening exercise, the Board adopted the report of the Inspector and concluded that, by itself or in combination with other development in the vicinity, the proposed development would not be likely to have a significant effect on the North Dublin Bay candidate Special Area of Conservation (site code: 000206), the South Dublin Bay candidate Special Area of Conservation (site code: 000210), the South Dublin Bay and River Tolka Estuary Special Protection Area (site code: 004024) and the North Bull Island Special Protection Area (site code: 004006), or on any other European Site in view of the sites' conservation objectives, and that a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment is not, therefore, required.

Environmental Impact Assessment:

The Board completed an environmental impact assessment of the proposed development, taking into account:

- (a) the nature, scale and extent of the proposed development,
- (b) the environmental impact statement and associated documentation submitted in support of the application,
- (c) the submissions from the applicant, the planning authority, the observers and the prescribed bodies in the course of the application, including submissions made to the oral hearing,
- (d) the applicant's response to the observations received as presented at the oral hearing, and
- (e) the Inspector's report.

It is considered that the environmental impact statement, supported by the documentation submitted by the applicant, identifies and describes adequately the direct, indirect, secondary and cumulative effects of the proposed development on the environment. The Board completed an environmental impact assessment in

relation to the proposed development and concluded that, by itself and in combination with other development in the vicinity, and, subject to the implementation of the mitigation measures proposed, the effects of the proposed development on the environment would be acceptable. In doing so, the Board adopted the report and conclusions of the Inspector.

Conclusions on Proper Planning and Sustainable Development:

It is considered that, subject to compliance with the conditions set out:

- The proposed development would support the implementation of the National Maternity Strategy 2016 – 2026 which seeks to co-locate maternity hospitals within the state with adult acute hospitals.
- The proposed development would meet the stated policies and objectives of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016 – 2022 particularly in respect of healthcare and movement and transport.
- The proposed development would significantly improve maternal healthcare provision at local and national level.
- Owing to its scale, height and design, including the use of high quality materials and finishes for the building and public realm, the proposed development would integrate in a successful manner with the existing hospital campus and the surrounding area.
- The proposed development would not unduly impinge on residential amenity of property in the vicinity, and would not be prejudicial to public health.
- While creating some additional traffic and parking demand, the proposed development follows an acceptable approach in relation to access and mobility management in the context of wider improvements in public transport, walking and cycling facilities, and would be acceptable in terms of traffic safety and convenience of road users, including availability of parking.

The Board concluded that the proposed development would be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

CONDITIONS

1. The proposed development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application and the further particulars submitted by the applicant at the oral hearing, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the applicant shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development and the proposed development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

2. The period during which the proposed development hereby permitted may be carried out shall be ten years from the date of this order.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

3. The mitigation measures and commitments identified in the environmental impact statement and other plans and particulars submitted with the planning application, and the further particulars submitted by the applicant at the oral hearing, shall be implemented in full by the applicant, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions.

Reason: In the interest of clarity and the protection of the environment during construction and operational phases of development.

4. Prior to commencement of development, and following consultation with the National Transport Authority, the applicant shall submit for the written agreement of the planning authority details in relation to cycle lane provision along both Nutley Lane and the Merrion Road as it relates to the proposed junction improvements.

Reason: In the interest of traffic and cycle safety and convenience.

5. Prior to commencement of development, details of all works proposed on the public road network and, in particular, at the Nutley Lane and Merrion Road junctions into the hospital campus shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority. The works shall be completed prior to commencement of development (Phase 1). All works to the public road, including removal of car parking and provision of right-turning lanes, shall be carried out at the applicant's expense and at no cost to the planning authority.

Reason: In the interest of sustainable development, traffic safety and to ensure an appropriate standard of development.

6. Prior to commencement of development, the following shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority:
 - (a) A Mobility Management Plan which shall be implemented on the first occupation of the National Maternity Hospital at St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus. The MMP shall indicate details regarding a Mobility Manager for the site.
 - (b) A Car Park Management Plan for the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus which shall include details regarding signage for car parks within and in the environs of the campus and the manner and frequency of monitoring of the use of car parks, in particular the use by staff and visitors.
 - (c) The location of signage which may be proposed on public roads as part of any wayfinding strategy, including wayfinding to and from Sydney Parade Dart Station.

The agreed Mobility Management Plan, Car Park Management Plan and wayfinding signage shall be implemented prior to the first occupation of the National Maternity Hospital, unless otherwise agreed with the planning authority.

Reason: In the interest of sustainable development, traffic safety and to avoid traffic congestion on the adjacent road network.

7. Prior to commencement of development, a detailed Construction Management Plan (generally based on the information submitted in support of the planning application), including a Construction Traffic Management Plan, shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority. This shall include details of monitoring and reporting in accordance with the requirements of the planning authority.

Reason: In the interest of environmental protection, to protect the amenities of neighbouring properties and in the interest of traffic safety.

8. The proposed temporary construction access on Nutley Lane shall be used for construction access only and shall be closed outside of the permitted hours of construction. The use shall cease on completion of the proposed development and the existing boundary shall be reinstated. The details of the proposed access, arrangements for daily closure and for final reinstatement shall be incorporated into the proposed Construction Management Plan and submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of clarity, traffic safety and residential amenity.

9. Prior to commencement of development, details of landscaping to be proposed along the eastern boundary of the campus, as it bounds with Herbert Avenue, shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority. All planting/landscaping proposed shall be maintained and, if any tree or plant dies or is otherwise lost, it shall be replaced by a plant of the same species, variety and size within the planting season following such loss.

Reason: In the interest of residential and visual amenity.

10. Details of:

- (a) the materials, colours and textures of all the external finishes to the proposed National Maternity Hospital and associated landscaped areas,
- (b) signage proposed to the elevations, and
- (c) screening measures for roof plant,

shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of visual amenity.

11. Water supply and drainage arrangements, including the disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services and shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of public health and environmental protection.

12. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

Reason: It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission.

Schedule of Costs

In accordance with the provisions of section 37H(2)(c) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, the Board also determined the costs to be paid in relation to the case, in accordance with the summary form on the costs file, as follows:

Name	Amount	Reasons and Considerations
Health Service Executive	€28,129 to be refunded	In accordance with schedule of costs
Declan and Gemma Lyons	Nil	See below

Reasons and Considerations (Costs)

In relation to the claim for costs made by the observer (Declan and Gemma Lyons) having regard to the submissions made on the case by the observers, the detailed and reasoned reports of the Board's inspector, and the Board's decision in the case, it is considered that the Strategic Infrastructure Development application process has enabled full participation by the observers in the case both in writing and at the oral hearing and there are no particular circumstances arising that would justify the developer having to make a contribution towards the costs of the observers in this case.

A breakdown of the Board's costs is set out in the attached Appendix 1.

**Member of An Bord Pleanála
duly authorised to authenticate
the seal of the Board.**

Dated this day of 2017