

29S.PC0185 - Proposed National Maternity Hospital at St. Vincent's University Hospital, Elm Park, Dublin 4.		
Section 37B of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended		
1 <sup>st</sup> Meeting		
1 <sup>st</sup> December 2014	Start Time:	2.30 p.m.
Conference Room	End Time:	3.40 p.m.
Anne Marie O'Connor Assistant Director of Planning		
	University Hospital, Elm Park, Dublin 4 Section 37B of the Planning and Devel 1 <sup>st</sup> Meeting 1 <sup>st</sup> December 2014 Conference Room Anne Marie O'Connor	University Hospital, Elm Park, Dublin 4. Section 37B of the Planning and Development Act 20 1 <sup>st</sup> Meeting 1 <sup>st</sup> December 2014 Start Time: Conference Room End Time: Anne Marie O'Connor

Attendees:

### Representing An Bord Pleanála

Anne Marie O'Connor, Assistant Director of Planning

Kevin Moore, Senior Planning Inspector

Marcella Doyle, Senior Executive Officer

Sinéad McInerney, Executive Officer

### Representing Prospective Applicant

Eleanor Masterson, Deputy Chief Architectural Advisor, HSE Estates

Clare Healy, Project Manager, National Maternity Hospital Redevelopment, HSE Estates

Dr. Rhona Mahony, Master of the National Maternity Hospital

Kilian McGrane, CEO, St. Vincent's University Hospital

Sean Mahon, Project Director, O'Connell Mahon Architects – Project Architects

Clare White Dip Arch, Project Manager, O'Connell Mahon Architects - Project Architects

Paul O'Neill, Project Manager, GVA – Planning Consultants

Jane Doyle, SID Advisor, Doyle Kent

Fergus Monaghan, Director, ARUP – Project Engineers (Transportation, Mechanical and Electrical and Civil and Structural)



### Introduction

The prospective applicant was welcomed and the teams were introduced (Appendix 1).

The Board's representatives acknowledged receipt of the prospective applicant's request by letter dated 7<sup>th</sup> October 2014 to enter into pre-application consultations in relation to the proposed development under section 37B of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, in order to determine if the proposed development constitutes strategic infrastructure development (SID). In this regard, the Board's representatives noted the prospective applicant's preliminary view that the proposed development is SID.

As set out in the Board's letter of 10<sup>th</sup> November 2014, this meeting is considered by the Board to be a preliminary meeting, the purpose of which is to obtain information in relation to the project to facilitate the Board's consideration of the matter. Further information in relation to the proposed development may be required and a further meeting or meetings may be held to give advice on procedural matters involved in making an application and to advise on matters relating to proper planning and sustainable development or the environment, which may have a bearing on the Board's decision in respect of a future application.

The Board's representatives stated that it will keep a record of this meeting, a copy of which will be forwarded to the prospective applicant. The record forms the Board's record of the meeting and an opportunity will be afforded to the prospective applicant at the following meeting if it wishes to comment on same. The records and the pre-application consultation file will become available to the public following formal closure of the pre-application consultation process.

The Board's representatives may consult with other persons or bodies in respect of the proposed development and the Board may require the prospective applicant to give notice to the public or to carry out consultations with other persons or bodies prior to lodgement of any application.

When the pre-application consultation has concluded the Board will issue notice to the prospective applicant on whether the proposed development constitutes SID, having regard to the provisions of section 37A of the Act. The prospective applicant was advised that the holding of consultations does not prejudice the Board in any way and cannot be relied upon in the formal planning process or in legal proceedings.



# **Proposed Development**

The prospective applicant gave a presentation in relation to the proposed development (Appendix 2).

The proposed development comprises the relocation of the National Maternity Hospital from Holles Street to St. Vincent's University Hospital campus. The proposal comprises a health facility of not fewer than 100 beds and therefore falls within a class of development listed in the Seventh Schedule of the Act. Having regard to the strategic national importance and the size and scale of the proposed development, the prospective applicant considers that the proposed development complies with the criteria set out under section 37A of the Act and constitutes SID. The prospective applicant has requested consultations with the Board to determine whether the proposed development is or is not SID, and to discuss planning and design issues and seek advice on matters relating to proper planning and sustainable development and the environment, as provided for under section 37B of the Act.

The prospective applicant referred to a report in 2008 which recommended that the three maternity hospitals in Dublin be co-located with adult hospitals. In 2013 the proposal to relocate the National Maternity Hospital was announced by Government. The benefits of co-locating with an adult hospital are recognised and the aim is to provide a modern healthcare facility for both mothers and babies. It is also proposed to look at future needs of the healthcare facility.

The prospective applicant provided a brief description of the National Maternity Hospital stating that it cares for more than 10,000 women and more than 9,000 babies per year, with its primary goal being the safe delivery and dignity of its patients. It is both a national centre for dealing with complex pre-natal and neo-natal cases and also the lead hospital in the Ireland East region. The existing building is old, overcrowded and not custom built and is therefore not safe or appropriate for its current use; in recent times it was required to move the neo-natal unit due to structural damage to the building. The hospital building is increasingly expensive to manage and requires major upgrading and refurbishment in order to make it fit for purpose. Co-location of the maternity hospital with an adult hospital is vital for safe care of mothers who have complex deliveries and require emergency surgical or medical treatment that can only be provided in an adult hospital. Transfer by ambulance increases the risk to the mother and rapid access to the services of an adult hospital is a key objective.



St. Vincent's Hospital comprises St. Vincent's University Hospital and St. Vincent's Private Hospital located in Elm Park, and St. Michaels Hospital in Dun Laoghaire. While providing adult hospital services, it is also a major academic teaching hospital and is a regional and national centre which specialises in cystic fibrosis care and liver transplants. The proposal to relocate the National Maternity Hospital to St. Vincent's Hospital campus is recognised in the strategic development of the hospital campus. St. Vincent's Hospital already works closely with the National Maternity Hospital with an adult hospital, which removes unnecessary risk to the patient. The benefits of sharing of key services is also identified e.g. pathology, radiology, pharmacy, facilities management, laundry etc. The proposal is fully endorsed by St. Vincent's University Hospital.

The design team was appointed in May 2014 and is progressing the overall development design and engaging with stakeholders. To date, it has had two meetings with Dublin City Council and will have a further meeting early in 2015. It is also intended to engage with local businesses and resident groups. The project team are engaging with user groups in the hospital with regard to internal design.

The prospective applicant set out the anticipated timelines with regard to the proposed development. It hopes to receive a determination from the Board confirming that the proposed development is SID in Quarter 2 of 2015, and anticipates a decision in respect of an application in Quarter 2 of 2016. It intends to commence construction in 2016 with the construction period between 24 and 32 months.

The site of St. Vincent's Hospital is zoned Z15 in the Dublin City Development Plan 2011-2017 which provides for institutional and community uses. The proposed development complies with such zoning and the policies of the development plan which broadly support clusters of excellence. The prospective applicant referred to the history of development on the site, identifying three significant developments in particular – the Nutley Wing, an 8 storey with plant level building which provides ward accommodation; St. Vincent's Private Hospital, an 8 storey plus plant building, and a clinical block of 5 storeys over basement which currently provides the main hospital entrance.

Strategic planning considerations that have been identified include National and Development Plan policies, alternative sites, appropriate assessment screening, the existing masterplan for the St Vincent's Hospital campus, and scheme benefits. Site specific planning considerations include impacts on residential amenity, height and



massing of buildings, impact on traffic and parking, development plan standards, relationship with existing hospital, visual impact, design quality, environmental impacts and sustainability.

The prospective applicant presented the location of the proposed development within the St. Vincent's Hospital campus adjoining the existing 5-storey clinical block. A link is proposed between the theatre floors of new and existing hospitals so that patients can be moved between the maternity hospital and clinical block as necessary. The proposed location is currently occupied by non-intensive uses such as the staff canteen, kitchens, storage, dermatology outpatients department. It is proposed to redevelop the site in phases, starting with the relocation of these existing services.

The prospective applicant presented a section showing the height of the proposed building adjacent to the existing hospital. While the design is at early stages, it is considered likely that the height of the maternity hospital building will be 6 storeys plus plant level. Total floor area will be in excess of 40,000 m<sup>2</sup>. Visual impact is being assessed from north and south of Dublin Bay, and also at points closer to the hospital. Photomontages of the new building at differing heights (5, 6 and 7 storeys) were presented. A full visual impact assessment will be carried out as part of the environmental impact statement (EIS).

With regard to transport matters, the prospective applicant stated that accessibility to the site is an important issue and it is considered that the site is well connected. Access is provided from N11, and from the M50 via the Dundrum interchange and the M11/M50 interchange. Access is also provided from the DART train line via the Sydney Parade Station which is within walking distance of the site. An extension to the existing car park is proposed to facilitate the new hospital development. Traffic assessments are being carried out and will be analysed and consultations will take place with Dublin City Council and the National Transport Authority.

# **Questions for the Board**

The Board's representatives noted the list of questions in the prospective applicant's presentation and addressed each in turn.

 The Board's representatives will meet the Strategic Infrastructure Division of the Board and seek a preliminary view as to whether the proposed development is SID. The Board's representatives will address this matter further at the next pre-application consultation meeting.



2. With regard to further information that may be required, the Board's representatives consider that further details of the masterplan for the St. Vincent's Hospital campus should be provided. In this regard, details of how the proposed development will operate within the campus and how future expansion of both hospitals will be delivered should be provided.

The Board's representatives also requested the submission of information setting out the national and regional role of the maternity hospital.

It is considered that as the pre-application consultation progresses and the environmental studies are commenced, further information may be required. This will be addressed at future meetings.

- 3. It is likely that the Board's representatives will seek to meet with representatives of Dublin City Council in relation to the proposed development. The Board's representatives may also meet with representatives of Dun Laoghaire Rathdown County Council, having regard to the proximity of the site to that local authority's jurisdiction. Any matters discussed will be brought to the attention of the prospective applicant following the meeting(s).
- 4. The Board's representatives advised the prospective applicant to consult with Dun Laoghaire Rathdown County Council, particularly with regard to transportation issues.
- 5. With regard to consultation with other statutory bodies, the Board's representatives referred the prospective applicant to article 213 of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001, as amended, and advised that consultations with relevant prescribed authorities should commence as early as practicable. The prospective applicant was further advised that if the proposed development is considered to constitute SID, the Board will provide the prospective applicant with a list of prescribed bodies to be notified of the application.
- 6. With regard to EIS and emerging issues to be discussed at a later meeting, the Board's representatives advised that, as referred to earlier, the prospective applicant may raise matters for discussion as the pre-application consultation process progresses.



# Issues for Consideration

The Board's representatives referred to a number of matters that should be considered by the prospective applicant:

- Masterplan for St. Vincent's Hospital complex:- The Board raised the issue of the developments now and into the future in the context of a masterplan. With regard to the status of the masterplan, the prospective applicant stated that it was reviewed in 2009 with transport identified as a key issue. It noted that the masterplan requires further updating.
- Alternative sites.
- Traffic and transportation particularly accessibility, trip generation, modal split, and car parking.
- Visual and residential amenity impacts resulting from the height, scale and design of the proposal.
- Construction and demolition impacts:- The Board advised that impacts relating to the on-going functioning of the hospital and traffic issues should be addressed.
- Public consultation:- The prospective applicant was advised to enter into consultations with local businesses and residents groups.
- Impact on established infrastructure:- The prospective applicant confirmed that there are no restriction with regard to drainage or utilities.

### Scoping

The prospective applicant stated that it is unlikely that it will seek a formal scoping opinion from the Board under section 37D of the Act.

### Conclusion

The Board will issue the record of this meeting in due course.



The prospective applicant will furnish a written statement to the Board detailing the role of the National Maternity Hospital in a national and regional context. A map of the Ireland East Region will also be submitted.

The Board's representatives will then meet with the Strategic Infrastructure Division of the Board, following which a further pre-application consultation meeting will be arranged.

Anne Marie O'Connor Assistant Director of Planning 12<sup>th</sup> December 2014