



An  
Bord  
Pleanála

## Inspector's Report PL.06D.247216

---

<b>Development</b>	Permission an information sign of 97cm x 392cm containing 4 no. Business signs.
<b>Location</b>	Carrickmines Manor, Glenamuck, Co. Wicklow.
<b>Planning Authority</b>	Dún Laoghaire Rathdown County Council.
<b>Planning Authority Reg. Ref.</b>	D16A/0435.
<b>Applicants</b>	Carmanor Ltd.
<b>Type of Application</b>	Permission.
<b>Planning Authority Decision</b>	Refuse.
<b>Type of Appeal</b>	First Party.
<b>Appellants</b>	Carmanor Ltd.
<b>Observer(s)</b>	None.
<b>Date of Site Inspection</b>	23rd November 2016.
<b>Inspector</b>	Dáire Mc Devitt.

## **1.0 Site Location and Description**

- 1.1 The site at the entrance to Carrickmines Manor is located on the eastern side of Glenamuck Road (R842) which connects Carrickmines to Kiltarnan on the south side of Dublin. Access to Glenamuck Road is off Exit 15 off the M50. The area is characterised by a mixture of residential and commercial with The Park Shopping Centre to the northwest of the site.
- 1.2 The sign is proposed to the north of the pedestrian entrance to Carrickmines Manor, adjacent to the vehicular entrance. Along this boundary with Glenamuck Road there is a stone wall, a green amenity strip and a foot path. Carrickmines Manor has four commercial units located off this entrance to the development. The signage proposed is to serve these units.
- 1.3 Photographs and Maps in file in pouch.

## **2.0 Proposed Development**

- 2.1. Permission is being sought for 1 information sign (97cm x 392cm) which would contain 4 individual business signs.
- The proposal would be an advertising structure consisting of 2 matching black coated stainless steel upstands and 4 no. matching dull aluminium (light grey) panels to hold the names of the 4 commercial occupiers of Carrickmines Manor.
  - Overall Height: 3.92 metres (first sign will be 2 metres above ground level).
  - Width: 0.715 metres.
  - Contains 5 panels: Top Panel (banner style) and 4 no. panels (35 x 80cm each).
  - Names to be repeated back and front.

- No illumination proposed.

### **3.0 Planning Authority Decision**

#### **3.1. Decision**

Refuse Permission on the following grounds:

*Section 8.2.6.8 (ii) of the County Development Plan 2016-2022 states 'to protect the amenities and attractiveness of the County, no commercial advertising structure will be permitted in the open countryside, on or near a structure of architectural or historical importance, in architectural conservation areas, on public open spaces, in areas of high amenity, within important views, in residential areas, or where they would confuse or distract users of any public road'. The proposed development by reason of its location in a residential area on lands zoned 'A' with a stated objective of the County Development Plan 2016-2022, would set an undesirable precedent for similar sites and would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.*

#### **3.2. Planning Authority Reports**

##### **3.2.1. Planning Report (8<sup>th</sup> August 2016)**

This Report forms the basis of the Planning Authority's decision. The main issues raised are summarised as follows:

- Zoning.
- Amenities and attractiveness of the county.

##### **3.2.2. Other Technical Reports**

- Drainage & Water Services Section (7<sup>th</sup> July 2016), No objection.
- Parks & Landscape Services Department (25<sup>th</sup> July 2016), No objection.

- Transportation Section, (28<sup>th</sup> July 2016) Further Information recommended.

### 3.3. Third Party Observations

One third party submission was received; this can be summarised as follows:

- Object to the proposal for a totem style pole similar to this used in petrol stations and industrial estates.

## 4.0 Planning History

There is extensive planning history associated with the site and overall scheme known as 'Carrickmines Manor.'

**D02A/1061(PL.06D.203058)**. This is the original 2003 permission for the Carrickmines Manor development that comprised of 332 residential units (5 storey block over basement) and a crèche.

**D06A/0740**, Permission granted in August 2006 for revisions to D02A/1061 replacement of crèche and residential with a Mixed use development.

**D07A/1654 (PL.06D.228131)** Permission refused in September 2008 for internal modification comprising of change of use of part basement parking to retail on grounds relating to traffic hazard and congestion.

**D06A/0355** Permission granted in June 2006 for the construction of an ESB substation and switch room building.

**D05A/1631** Permission granted in June 2006 for revisions to D02A/1061 consisting of the replacement of a number of apartments with houses.

## 5.0 Policy Context

### 5.1. Dún Laoghaire-Rathdown County Development Plan 2016-2022

**Land use Zoning: 'A'** *To protect and/or improve residential amenity.*

#### **Section 8.2.6.8(ii) Signage**

*To protect the amenities and attractiveness of the County, no commercial advertising structure will be permitted in the open countryside, on or near a structure of architectural or historical importance, in architectural conservation areas, on public open spaces, in areas of high amenity, within important views, in residential areas, or where they would confuse or distract users of any public road. ...*

...Advertising signs, where permitted should be simple in design and sympathetic to the surroundings and features of the building on which they will be displayed.

#### **Section 8.2.6.8 (v) Free Standing Advertisement Displays**

*Public information and advertising panels are permissible in situations such as pedestrian precincts of shopping centres, or other areas of commercial activity along major traffic routes. They can sometimes be effective when grouped in a unified composite, which avoids an impression of clutter, subject to the location and amount of panels. The amount of advertising permitted on public information panels will be restricted and shall not constitute not more than 50% of the total area.*

*All advertisement displays shall also be considered under the criteria set out in Section 8.2.6.9 Street Furniture Strategy.*

#### **Section 8.2.6.9 Street Furniture Strategy**

The main points can be summarised as:

- Need to reduce visual clutter.
- All new street furniture should have a clear function.

- Co-location of street furniture and signage.
- Use of high quality materials.
- All street elements shall be located so as to provide clear, accurate and timely guidance for road users, pedestrians and cyclist and should not interfere with sightlines.

## **5.2. Natural Heritage Designations**

None of relevance.

## **6.0 The Appeal**

### **6.1. Grounds of Appeal**

The grounds of appeal are summarised as follows:

- Sign would be sited on the margin of the residential zoned lands in an area characterised by a public road, amenity strip and footpath and not housing.
- Development would not be contrary to Section 8.2.6.8 (ii).
- Signage is required for 4 no. commercial/professional uses and therefore is considered vital.
- Proposal for 1 shared sign between 4 businesses would reduce visual clutter.
- Interdepartmental reports from Dún Laoghaire Rathdown County Council have no objection to the proposal.
- Third party objected to a totem style advertisement structure, this was not proposed.
- Proposal does not contravene land use objectives or policies as set out in the Development Plan.
- The location of the proposed sign, coupled with the location of the businesses in Carrickmines Manor relative to the public realm combine such that the

proposed development will not seriously injure the amenities of the area or of property in the vicinity, will not be prejudicial to public health, will not set an undesirable precedent and will be acceptable in terms of traffic safety and convenience and is therefore in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

## **6.2. Planning Authority Response**

Refers to the original Planner's Report on file.

## **6.3. Observations**

None.

## **7.0 Assessment**

The main issues in this appeal are those raised in the grounds of appeal and I am satisfied that no other substantive issues arise. The issue of appropriate assessment also needs to be addressed. The issues can be dealt with under the following headings:

- Principle of the development.
- Visual Impact.
- Appropriate Assessment.

### **7.1 Principle of the development**

- 7.1.2. In accordance with the zoning of the site as "A" (to protect and/or improve residential amenity), signage is not listed under Table 8.3.2 as 'permitted in principle' or 'open for consideration'. Nonetheless, the provisions of the Dún Laoghaire-Rathdown Development Plan, in particular, Section 8.2.6.8 (v), states that "*Public information and advertising panels are permissible in situations such as pedestrian precincts of shopping centres, or other areas of commercial activity along major traffic routes. They can sometimes be effective when grouped in a unified composite, which avoids an impression of clutter, subject to the location and amount of panels*". Therefore, signage is permitted

but subject to the caveat that signage can be effective when grouped in a unified composite, which avoids an impression of clutter, subject to the location and amount of panels.

7.1.2 The basis for the decision of the Planning Authority to refuse permission is that the signage proposed is inappropriate in an area that is primarily residential in character. It is accepted that the bulk of the surrounding uses are residential. However, regard, in my opinion, also has to be had to the mixed character of the immediate area which includes apartments over commercial structures on the Glenamuck Road at a location where it is a very heavily trafficked regional route. The Park Shopping Centre is located nearby to the north east of the site.

7.1.3 In this context I consider that the proposed sign structure to be acceptable in principle.

## **7.2 Visual Impact**

7.2.1 The proposed sign structure is modest in in scale and design and I do not consider it would be visually obtrusive at this location.

## **7.3 Appropriate Assessment**

7.3.1 Having regard to the nature of the proposed development and the location of the site in a fully serviced built up suburban area, no Appropriate Assessment issues arise and it is not considered that the proposed development would be likely to have a significant effect individually or in combination with other plans or projects on a European site.

## **8.0 Recommendation**

8.1. I recommend that permission be granted subject to conditions.



## 9.0 Reasons and Considerations

Having regard to the nature and relatively small scale of the proposed sign structure, the objectives as set out in the current County Development Plan in relation to advertising structures; and the mixed residential/commercial character of the area in which the site is located, it is considered that the proposed development would not detract from the amenities of the vicinity and would be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

## 10.0 Conditions

1. The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application.

**Reason:** In the interest of Clarity.

2. No additional signs shall be erected on the advertisement structure without a prior grant of permission.

**Reason:** To control the extent of advertising signage on site in the interests of visual amenity.

---

Dáire McDevitt  
Planning Inspector

28th November 2016