



An
Bord
Pleanála

Inspector's Report PL06D.248597

Development	Extension to dwelling, attic and garage conversion.
Location	49 Carysfort Downs, Blackrock, Co. Dublin
Planning Authority	Dun Laoghaire-Rathdown
Planning Authority Reg. Ref.	D17B/0149
Applicant	Yvonne Leonard
Type of Application	Permission
Planning Authority Decision	Grant
Type of Appeal	Third Party
Appellants	Alan and Mairin Kelly
Date of Site Inspection	2/8/17
Inspector	Siobhan Carroll

1.0 Site Location and Description

- 1.1. The appeal site with a stated area of 0.0855 hectares is located at no. 49 Carysfort Downs, Blackrock in south County Dublin. The subject site contains a two-storey detached dwelling with an area of 207 square metres. Carysfort Downs is a mature residential area which is characterised by detached dwellings on large plots. The estate was constructed approximately 30 years ago.
- 1.2. The site is one of four dwellings which have access from the adjoining cul de sac at this location. The subject dwelling features a brick finish with a tiled and hipped roof. There is a garage attached to the side of the house, which is part of the original construction. A conservatory was constructed to the rear of the dwelling adjoining the dining room.
- 1.3. The site is bounded by dwellings to the north and south. The adjacent property to the north no. 50 Carysfort Downs is situated 3.7m from the north-eastern corner of the dwelling at the closest point. The rear gardens of four detached dwellings located along the main spine road of the estate adjoin the southern boundary. No. 45 and No.46 Carysfort Downs are the closest dwellings to the south. They respectively have separation distances of 11.6m and 10.8m from their rear elevations the side elevation of the subject dwelling. The western site boundary adjoins a small area of open space at Pear Tree Field.

2.0 Proposed Development

- 2.1. Permission is sought for extensions to the detached dwelling, including an attic and garage conversion.

3.0 Planning Authority Decision

3.1. Decision

Permission was granted subject to 6 no. conditions.

3.2. Planning Authority Reports

3.2.1. Planning Reports

- It was considered that the proposed extension was relatively modest scale and that there would be no significant overlooking, overbearing or overshadowing impacts from the proposed extensions. Therefore, the proposals were considered acceptable.

3.2.2. Other Technical Reports

- None

3.3. **Third Party Observations**

3.3.1. The Planning Authority received two submissions/observations in relation to the proposed development. The main issues raised are similar to those set out in the third party appeal.

4.0 **Planning History**

- None

5.0 **Policy Context**

5.1. **Development Plan**

The site is governed by the provisions of the Dún Laoghaire – Rathdown County Development Plan 2016-2022.

- The site at 49 Carysfort Downs, Blackrock, Co. Dublin is located on Map 6 of the Dun Laoghaire Rathdown Development Plan and is identified as being Zoned Objective A ‘to protect and/or improve residential amenity’.
- Chapter 8 – Principles of Development
- Section 8.2.3.4(i) refers Extensions to Dwellings

6.0 The Appeal

6.1. Grounds of Appeal

A third party appeal was submitted by Alan and Mairin Kelly on the 30th of May 2017. The main issues raised are as follows;

- The appellants consider that the Planning Authority did not take into account the issues they raised in their observations to the application. In particular, they note alternative design proposals which they suggested.
- They consider the modifications are relatively minor in nature and would serve to protect their residential amenities.
- The appellants raise concern at the proximity of the proposed extensions to the southern side of the dwelling to their property.
- The proposed A-frame roof design is not considered appropriate. A fully hipped roof following the profile of the existing roof is considered more sympathetic to the design character of the property. It would also better serve to protect their residential amenities.
- The appellants request that the proposed rooflights and solar panels be omitted. They suggest that the solar panel could be placed on the south western facing roof plane.
- Condition no. 6 specifies that all external finishes be consistent in terms of material, colour and texture with the existing house. This would provide for the use of brick to the south/southeast gable wall as the appellants had suggested in their observation to the Planning Authority. Condition no. 2 contradicts this requirement as it specifies that a rendered and painted finish be provided. The appellants request that the Board omit that condition.

6.2. Applicant Response

A response to the third party appeal was submitted by Niamh Hogan Architects on behalf of the applicant Yvonne Leonard on the 22nd of June 2017. The main issues raised are as follows;

- The proposed extensions to the detached five bedroomed dwelling are designed to accommodate the growing needs of the owner's young family. There are four children in the family of primary school age.
- The proposed scheme would reduce the ground floor area from 134sq m to 119sq m.
- The proposed first floor extension is above the garage. It is the most cost effective option and will also facilitate access to the new first floor master bedroom.
- All the proposed finishes will harmonise with the existing dwelling and surrounding houses in Carysfort Downs.
- The height of the proposed extension will match the existing property. No windows are proposed to the side elevation of the dwelling at first floor level.
- It is proposed to install solar panels to the south facing roof plane as recommended by project Heating Consultants Joule Ltd. This is the best location for maximising solar efficiency.
- It is proposed to install the rooflights to the south facing roof plane to benefit from the natural solar heat gain. There will be no overlooking from the rooflights as they are located in the void over the master bedroom.
- A number of similar side extensions which have been granted permission in Carysfort Downs are cited Reg. Ref. D14B/0352, Reg. Ref. D17B/0974, Reg. Ref. D13B/0362 and Reg. Ref. D14B/0022.
- The applicant has stated that she is agreeable to having a brick finish to the side gable as requested by the appellants.
- In conclusion, it is considered that the proposed design, layout and scale of the proposed extension is in keeping with the pattern of development in Carysfort Downs.

6.3. Planning Authority Response

- The Planning Authority refer the Board to the Planner's Report and state that they have no further comments regarding the proposed development and subject appeal.

7.0 Assessment

- 7.1. Section 8.2.3.4(i) of the Dun Laoghaire Rathdown Development Plan 2016-2022 refers to extensions to dwellings. There are a number of specific criteria set out in this section of the Plan which relate to first floor rear extensions. It is stated that first floor rear extensions will be considered on their merits and will only be permitted where the Planning Authority is satisfied that there will be no significant negative impacts on surrounding residential or visual amenities. The factors which are taken into consideration in determining proposals for first floor extensions include, overshadowing, overbearing, overlooking, proximity, height and length along mutual boundaries.
- 7.2. The proposed development involves the demolition of the existing conservatory and the construction of a small (4sq m) ground floor rear extension. At ground floor level it is proposed to convert the 21sq m garage to provide a kitchen. A new window is proposed to the front elevation to serve the kitchen. The proposed design matches the existing windows. Two windows are proposed to the side elevation. They will have no undue impact to neighbouring properties. Other minor changes to the ground floor involve internal alterations to the existing floor plan. I consider the proposed extension and alterations at ground floor are relatively minor in nature and therefore would be acceptable.
- 7.3. At first floor, it is proposed to construct an extension over the garage to provide a master bedroom with en-suite bathroom. The circa 30sq m extension will be contained within the footprint of the dwelling. The proposed new first floor window to the front matches the existing first floor windows. To the rear elevation two new windows are proposed to serve the stairwell to the master bedroom and proposed attic bedroom. These windows are west facing and would not directly overlook any neighbouring properties.

- 7.4. The appellants have raised concern regarding the proposed A-frame roof design and the rooflights and solar panels proposed to the south facing roof plane. In terms of proposals for roof alterations/expansions to main roof profiles including changing a hip-end roof to a gable/'A' frame end or 'half-hip' it is advised in Section 8.2.3.4(i) of the Development Plan that such proposals will be assessed having regard to the character and size of the structure, its position on the streetscape and proximity to adjacent structures. Other issues to be consider include existing roof variations on the streetscape and harmony with the rest of the structure, adjacent structures and prominence.
- 7.5. The existing roof is hipped design. The proposal to provide a bedroom in the attic space requires an alteration to the existing roof design. This will result in an increase in the length of the roof ridge from 3.5m to 9.5m. The plans indicated that the first floor extension over the converted garage would feature a gable roof design. In relation to the proposed changes to the roof profile, I note that there is a mix of house designs within Carysfort Downs including variations in roof types. Having regard to the location of the dwelling within a small cul de sac containing four dwellings and the variety in surrounding houses types, I am satisfied that the proposed alterations to the roof design will not impact upon the streetscape character or the visual amenities of the area. Furthermore, having regard to the separation distance of over 11m to the rear of the appellant's dwelling from the proposed side extension, I do not consider that the proposed change in roof profile would unduly impact upon their existing residential amenities.
- 7.6. Three rooflights are proposed to the south facing roof plane. They are high level and will be located in the void area above the master bedroom. Therefore, the proposed rooflights would not cause overlooking. The appellants have requested that the proposed rooflights and the 4 no. solar panels to the south facing roof plane be omitted. I consider these design features will not unduly impact the third party appellants and therefore, it would not be appropriate to omit them from the scheme.
- 7.7. The appellants also refer to the proposed finish to the south facing gable wall. They have requested that a brick finish be provided. Drawing No. P08 indicates a rendered finish and condition no. 2 as attached by the Planning Authority specified that this elevation shall have a rendered and painted finish. In response to the matter the applicant has confirmed that they are amenable to providing a brick finish

to this gable wall if required. Having regard to the existing brick finish to the property, I consider this would be appropriate.

- 7.8. In relation to the matter of appropriate assessment, I consider that having regard to the nature of the proposal an extension to a dwelling and the nature of the receiving environment, namely a suburban and fully serviced location that no appropriate assessment issues arise.

8.0 Recommendation

- 8.1. I have read the submissions on file, visited the site, and had due regard to the provisions of the Development Plan and all other matters arising. In the light of this and the assessment above, I recommend that permission be granted for the reasons and considerations set out below.

9.0 Reasons and Considerations

- 9.1.1. Having regard to the provisions of the current Development Plan for the area, and having regard to the pattern of existing development in the area and the design and scale of the proposed extension, it is considered that, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the proposed development would not seriously injure the residential or visual amenities of the area or of property in the vicinity, and would comply with the provisions of the Development Plan. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

10.0 Conditions

1. The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

2. The external finishes of the proposed extension shall be the same as those of the existing dwelling in respect of colour and texture. Revised drawings indicating a brick finish to the south/south east side elevation of the proposed extension shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of visual amenity.

3. The disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services.

Reason: In the interest of public health.

4. All necessary measures shall be taken by the contractor to prevent the spillage or deposit of clay, rubble or other debris on adjoining roads during the course of the works.

Reason: To protect the amenities of the area.

Siobhan Carroll
Planning Inspector

11th of August 2017