



An
Bord
Pleanála

Inspector's Report PL06.248813

Development

Widening of Existing Pedestrian Gate to create new vehicular entrance onto Wainsfort Road and all associated site works at 93 Wainsfort Road, Terenure, Dublin 6W

Planning Authority

South Dublin Co. Co.

Planning Authority Reg. Ref.

SD17B/0145

Applicant(s)

Sharon Browne

Type of Application

Permission

Planning Authority Decision

REFUSE

Appellant(s)

Sharon Browne

Observer(s)

None

Date of Site Inspection

11th of September 2017

Inspector

Caryn Coogan

1.0 Site Location and Description

The subject site is a two storey dwelling house at 93 Wainsfort Road, Terenure, which is close to a signalled junction of Wainsfort Road and Wainsfort Manor Drive. There is a pedestrian access to the front and rear of the dwelling only. Vehicular parking associated with the dwelling is to the rear of the dwelling with two designated carparking spaces off a cul-de sac from Wainsfort Manor Drive. i.e. within a College Square residential development.

2.0 Proposed Development

The proposed development is to widen the existing pedestrian gate (1.37metre) to create a vehicular entrance (3.5m) to the front curtilage of the dwelling.

3.0 Planning Authority Decision

3.1 Decision

Permission was refused by South Dublin Co. Co.

1. The property already has 2No. parking spaces to the rear of the dwelling as has the neighbouring dwelling No. 95 Wainsfort Road, and this parking is provided with the College Square development. The site boundary excludes the designated parking areas. The provision of two additional spaces would contravene Section 11.4.2 and section 11.4.4 of the county development plan Policy 7 Car parking. The parking was provided under planning permission SD04A/0242 and would be contrary to TM3 Objective 3, TM7 Objective 1,2 and 3 section 6.6.4 as set out in Table 11.24, and would materially contravene the development plan.
2. The proposal would set an undesirable precedent, increase inconvenience to people using the cycle path part of rule 9C a secondary route on the National Transportation Authority's Strategy Cycle Network including reversing movements.

3.2 Planning Authority Reports

The dwelling house already has two car parking spaces. For a dwelling house along a main public transport route to have more than 2 spaces would be contrary to the maximum parking rates set out in Section 11.4.2 and 11.4.4 of the County Development Plan and Policy 7 Car Parking. It will result in an inconvenience to footpath and cycle path users.

3.2 Other Technical Reports

3.3 No report from Roads Department.

3.4 Third Party Submissions

No third party submission.

4.0 Planning History

There is no relevant planning history associated with the subject site.

Parent Permission – SD04A/0242

Construction of 189No. residential units with vehicular access from Wainsfort Manor Drive.

5.0 Policy Context

5.1 Development Plan

South County Dublin Development Plan 2016-2022

The subject site is zoned RES – To protect and/ or improve Residential amenity.

TM3 Objective 3 :

To ensure that all streets and networks are designed to prioritise the movements of pedestrians and cyclists within a safe and comfortable environment for a wide range of ages, abilities and journey types.

TM7 Objective 1:

To carefully consider the number of parking spaces provided to service the needs of new development.

6.0 THE APPEAL

6.1 The Proposed Development

The proposal involves the widening of the pedestrian access within the front curtilage of the dwelling to provide for a vehicular access off Wainsfort Road. The existing parking arrangement is two spaces west of the rear garden area outside of the garden boundary wall. These spaces are effectively public/ visitor parking spaces and are visually and functionally disconnected from the dwelling at No. 93. People visiting the house park on the footpath in front of dwelling and have no idea the parking is to the rear of the dwelling. It is very inconvenient to carry in deliveries or shopping having to cross the rear garden area. There were no objections from neighbours to the proposal, and the planner's report states there will be no visual impact. Wainsfort Road is a residential road with slow moving traffic.

6.2 Consistent with Development Plan

The proposal is consistent with the zoning provisions of the development plan.

6.3 Unsuitability of Existing Parking Arrangements

The existing layout of two space outside of the applicant's property and to the rear of the dwelling is outside of good design principles. The cars parked in this area are only partially visible from the first floor window. The area does not benefit from passive surveillance, and the present arrangement represents a danger to the residents. Good urban design and the existing Planning Guidelines call for domestic parking to be close to the front door. The applicant does not feel safe and does not feel her car is safe parked in existing arrangement.

6.4 Character of the Area/ Precedent

All dwelling houses along Wainsfort Road with the exception of the adjoining No. 95 has a vehicular cross over to facilitate front curtilage parking. The proposed form of parking is intrinsic to the area, and traffic/ walking/ cycling movements exist in harmony with it.

6.5 Road Safety

The proposed development is similar to all of the dwellings along Wainsfort Road, and there is no basis to the decision of increasing inconvenience or posing safety. There is visibility over the front boundary wall for cars exiting the entrance. There would be no need to exit onto the cycle lane until there is clear space to merge onto the public road.

The Road Safety Authority online collision database shows that there have been no incidents with bicycles or pedestrians from 2005-2013 along the stretch of Wainsfort Road in the vicinity of the appeal site. Wainsfort Road is a residential road with slow moving traffic. The current proposal is merely replicating a feature which is part of the character of the area.

6.6 Need for Properties to Adapt over time

The proposal is a logical and conventional solution to an unforeseen design issue. No. 93 Wainsfort Road was initially used as a show house by the developers of 'College Square'. The front driveway was not deemed necessary when the dwelling was originally constructed which is not the current case today. Properties need to be capable of being extended and adapted without detracting from their appearance.

6.1 Planning Authority Response

The planning authority did respond and there was nothing further to add to the planning report on file.

7.0 Assessment

7.1 The applicant proposes to widen the existing pedestrian gate along the front curtilage of the dwelling house at 93 Wainsfort Road, to provide a new vehicular entrance and front curtilage parking. At the present time, as the OS Maps and site layout maps reveal, the carparking associated with the property is located to the rear of the dwelling within the College Square residential development. I noted during my inspection, there is a very short cul de sac serving *exclusively* two dwellings 93 and 95 Wainsfort Road (subject site), and provides a tarmac area accommodating two spaces per dwelling house, a total of 4No. spaces and a turning hammerhead at the end of the cul de sac. Each of the dwellings are accessed via coded gate along

the rear site boundary of each dwelling. The rear boundary consists of the 2metre wall. The spur road is from a large residential development, College Square, which was granted planning permission in 2004, and the subject dwelling formed part of the original planning permission, and according to the appeal submission was a showhouse associated with the scheme.

7.2 The applicant has submitted on appeal following the planning authority's decision to refuse the proposed development that :-

- The existing parking layout is outside of the curtilage of the dwelling
- Contrary to the general residential pattern and layout along Wainsfort Road, whereby the houses have vehicular accesses from their front curtilages
- The existing parking area is public and can be used as visitor parking associated with College Square
- There is no surveillance or security associated with the parking areas, and the applicant is concerned for her safety, and cannot view her car from her property.
- There is no safety issue associated with entering and exiting the proposed access to the front of the dwelling as there will be a low wall to the front, and pedestrians and cyclists will be in clear view before leaving the property.
- The proposal is in keeping with good urban design and residential development standards to have residential parking adjacent to the front door.
- There were no objections to the proposed development.

In my opinion, the permitted layout of College Square and the two dwellings addressing Wainsfort Road was purposely designed with pedestrian access to the front of the two dwellings because of the close proximity of the dwellings to the signalled junction of Wainsfort Road and College Drive. I do not agree that the present carparking areas to the rear of both dwelling do not have the benefit of security and passive surveillance. Some of the dwelling units within College Square are orientated towards the short cul de sac and parking area, and these are three storey units providing a secure and safe environment for the residents of the area. It is my opinion, in the event permission was granted for the vehicular access to the front of the dwelling, a precedent would be created whereby the occupants of No. 95 Wainsfort Road would apply for permission for a similar arrangement, leaving the access road and rear parking area obsolete, and this could lead to antisocial or unwanted activity at this location. It is my opinion, a new vehicular access to the front of the dwelling will create an excessive number of carparking spaces associated with a modest sized family home, and an undesirable precedent for the residents of No. 95 to apply for direct access onto Wainsfort Road at the signalled junction. In my opinion, given the existing layout and parking associated with the property, I believe the new access and new parking area proposed under the planning application is unjustifiable and unwarranted.

The applicant has argued that the existing carparking and access arrangement to the dwelling house is contrary to the general pattern of development along Wainsfort Road. In addition, it is submitted, there is no issue with accidents or incidents to cars accessing/ existing dwellings along the adjoining stretch of Wainsfort Road. Whilst I agree in principle with this argument, the other dwellings along Wainsfort Road predate the signalled junction, the cycle lanes, and College Square development to the rear of the site. The subject site is located at the signalled junction and this is a very busy junction with a variety vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian movements. The proximity to the junction creates a number of irregular challenges than the majority of existing vehicular entrances along Wainsfort Road do not have, for instance,

anticipated stoppage time, views of oncoming traffic and creating confusion at the signalled junction turning into the dwelling off Wainsfort Road from both directions.

7.3 Roads Department Report

The Planning Report on file did not refer to the Roads Department Report on file dated 19th of April 2017, which forms part on the online planning application documents on the South Dublin Co. Co. website and is included in the Appendix of this report. The Roads Report essentially states that an additional two parking spaces to serve the dwelling would result in an overprovision of parking. In addition, the proposed entrance is in close proximity to the signalised junction of Wainsfort Road and College Drive. Vehicles accessing and egressing the proposed driveway would result in conflicting traffic movements at a location where multiple movements occur at present. A refusal is recommended on the basis the additional traffic movements would result in the safety of road users and vulnerable road users. I would concur with the content of the Roads Section report, the subject entrance is located at a busy signalled junction, and the existing road layout/ cycling lane / footpath should be maintained in the interests of road user's safety, there should be no additional vehicular access points permitted in close proximity to the junction in the interests of traffic safety.

7.4 Final Note

This is a mature suburban part of Terenure whereby there is a quality bus route serving the area, and the planning emphasis should not be car dependent trips and car parking, but more sustainable forms of transport. Given that the property already has two car parking spaces designated to serve it, it would be contrary to proper sustainable planning to permit additional parking to serve the dwelling at this location.

8.0 Recommendation

The planning authority's decision to refuse should be upheld by the Board for the following reasons

Reasons and Considerations/ Reasons

1. Having regard to the existing vehicular access layout, parking provision and turning area located to the rear of the subject site to serve the subject dwelling and neighbouring house, which was permitted under the original planning permission for the College Square development to serve the dwelling on the subject site, it is considered the provision of a new vehicular entrance to the front of the dwelling and additional carparking spaces would be an excessive and unnecessary form of development within a suburban area served by a quality public transport system, and would therefore be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.
2. Having regard to the close proximity of the proposed entrance to the signalled junction of Wainsfort Road and College Drive, it is considered that traffic movements generated by the proposed development would result in conflicting traffic movements at a location which is heavily trafficked with multiple movements, and it is considered the proposed development would endanger public safety by reason of a traffic hazard.

Caryn Coogan
Planning Inspector

14th of September 2017