



An
Bord
Pleanála

Inspector's Report ABP-301793-18

Development	Two storey extension (c.290 sq.m.) at St. Monica's GAA Club, Aras Naomh Moncha, Edenmore Park, Donaghmede, Dublin 5
Location	St. Monica's GAA Club, Aras Naomh Moncha, Edenmore Park, Donaghmede, Dublin 5
Planning Authority	Dublin City Council
Planning Authority Reg. Ref.	2524/18
Applicant(s)	St Monica's GAA Club
Type of Application	Permission
Planning Authority Decision	Grant Permission
Type of Appeal	First Party
Appellant(s)	St. Monica's GAA Club
Observer(s)	Sean Haughey TD
Date of Site Inspection	11 th September 2018
Inspector	Una O'Neill

Contents

1.0 Site Location and Description	3
2.0 Proposed Development	3
3.0 Planning Authority Decision	3
3.1. Decision	3
3.2. Planning Authority Reports	4
3.3. Prescribed Bodies	4
3.4. Third Party Observations	4
4.0 Planning History.....	4
5.0 Policy Context.....	5
5.1. Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022	5
5.2. Natural Heritage Designations	5
6.0 The Appeal	5
6.1. Grounds of Appeal	5
6.2. Planning Authority Response	6
6.3. Observations.....	6
6.4. Further Responses.....	6
7.0 Assessment.....	6
8.0 Recommendation.....	7
9.0 Reasons and Considerations.....	8
10.0 Conditions	8

1.0 Site Location and Description

- 1.1. The subject site is located on the northside of Dublin city, east of Coolock village and approximately 7km northeast of the city centre. It is accessed off Edenmore Park Road and is bounded by residential properties to the northeast, southeast, south and west. There is a neighbourhood centre, a number of schools, and a large park 'Edenmore Park', in the immediate vicinity of the site.
- 1.2. The site, which has a stated area of 1505sqm, comprises an existing two storey GAA club house (480sqm), with car parking area to the front and side and a small grassed area to the rear.

2.0 Proposed Development

- 2.1. The proposed development comprises the following:
 - Rear two storey extension, 14.47m deep x 10.93m wide, with an overall height of 6.3m, finished with a flat roof.
 - The ground level is to comprise a new disabled persons toilet, lift and a fitness/exercise room.
 - The first floor is to comprise a new gents toilet, a balcony and a juvenile games room.

The floor area of the new build is stated to be 290 sqm.

3.0 Planning Authority Decision

3.1. Decision

GRANTED, subject to 6 conditions, including the following:

C2: The proposed 1st floor juvenile games room shall be omitted; 1st floor shall contain only westerly opes if required; gym opening hours shall be agreed prior to commencement of operations.

3.2. Planning Authority Reports

3.2.1. Planning Report

The Planning Officer's report generally reflects the decision of the Planning Authority. The following is of note:

- Residential amenity of the dwelling to the east has not been considered.
- The 6.3m high elevation of the extension will dominate the entire plot of no. 31 Edenmore Park, will be visually oppressive, result in overshadowing and obstruct the adjoining 3rd party. It is recommended that the first floor element be omitted from at least past the alignment with no. 32 Edenmore Park's primary rear building line.
- Given the close proximity of the gym to the adjoining residences, a condition should be attached in relation to operation hours of the gym to address potential for noise disturbance.

3.2.2. Other Technical Reports

Engineering Division: No objection subject to condition.

3.3. Prescribed Bodies

None.

3.4. Third Party Observations

None.

4.0 Planning History

None.

5.0 Policy Context

5.1. Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022

- **Zoning objective Z15**, the objective for which is ‘to protect and provide for institutional and community uses.’
- **Section 10.5.8**, Sport Recreation and Play

5.2. Natural Heritage Designations

The site is not located within or adjacent to a Natura 2000 site.

6.0 The Appeal

6.1. Grounds of Appeal

The first party grounds of appeal is summarised as follows:

- St Monica’s GAA club accommodates 18 teams and looks after 200 girls and boys.
- There is a lack of indoor community spaces in the area where young people can meet and socialise in a safe and secure environment. The ground floor fitness/exercise room will be mostly used by senior players and would not really be available or suitable for younger girls and boys. Club facilities are also used by the local community and elderly citizens. The club with this proposal wants to invest in and assert their commitment to the Edenmore area.
- The owner of no. 32 Millwood Park did not object to the proposal, however the club wish to address the concerns raised in the planner’s report in relation to this property.
- A revised design is submitted, whereby the proposed extension, apart from the lift area, will be relocated 4 metres from the boundary with no. 32 Millwood Park. The new building will not visually dominate the adjoining garden and there will be greater exposure to sunlight. The elevation is now proposed to

comprise a brick façade and an option of planting is proposed. Much of the new elevation will be obscured by the existing 2m high blockwork common boundary wall and there will be no windows on this elevation.

6.2. **Planning Authority Response**

None.

6.3. **Observations**

One observation has been received from Sean Haughey TD in support of the development.

6.4. **Further Responses**

None.

7.0 **Assessment**

- 7.1. I consider the relevant issue in determining the current appeal before the Board relates to the design and impact of the two storey extension to this existing GAA club on the residential amenity of the neighbouring properties.

Design and Impact on Neighbouring Amenities

- 7.2. The existing GAA club comprises at ground level four changing rooms, an office, a meeting room, store room and cold room. At first floor level is a bar, toilets and an external balcony attached to the rear elevation. The proposed extension will accommodate a fitness/exercise room at ground level, a toilet and lift. Above this at first floor level is a proposed juvenile games room.
- 7.3. The first party has submitted a revised design, which relocates the proposed extension 4m from the boundary with the neighbouring residential dwelling to the south east. This has been submitted to overcome the planner's concern in relation to the impact of the proposed extension on this property and to negate the need for condition 2(a) of the grant of permission issued by Dublin City Council which omitted the 1st floor juvenile games room from the extension.

- 7.4. I have reviewed the plans submitted and I am of the view that the revised design minimises the impact of the proposed development on the dwelling to the southeast, 32 Millwood Park. The proposal is overall in my opinion acceptable and will not seriously impact on the amenity of neighbouring properties in terms of overlooking, overshadowing or loss of outlook given the separation distance of 4m from the shared boundary and the distance to other boundaries.
- 7.5. I note that a first floor balcony is proposed on the western elevation of the extension. It is not clear what purpose the balcony serves or if it proposed to operate as a smoking area serving the bar. Nonetheless, given the context of this first floor balcony in a residential area and potential for noise nuisance arising from it, it is my view that should the Board be minded to grant permission, that the balcony should be omitted by way of condition.

Appropriate Assessment

- 7.6. Having regard to the minor nature of the development, its location in a serviced urban area, and the separation distance to any European site, no Appropriate Assessment issues arise and it is not considered that the proposed development would be likely to have a significant effect individually or in combination with other plans or projects on a European site.

Environmental Impact Assessment

- 7.7. Having regard to the minor nature and scale of the proposed development and its location in a serviced urban area removed from any sensitive locations or features, there is no real likelihood of significant effects on the environment arising from the proposed development. The need for environmental impact assessment can, therefore, be excluded at preliminary examination and a screening determination is not required.

8.0 Recommendation

- 8.1. It is recommended that permission is granted subject to conditions.

9.0 Reasons and Considerations

- 9.1. Having regard to the Z15 zoning objective, the design, layout and small scale of the development to an existing GAA club, and to the pattern of development in the area, it is considered that subject to compliance with conditions below, the proposal would not seriously injure the amenities of the area or of property in the vicinity. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

10.0 Conditions

1. The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, as amended by the further plans and particulars received by An Bord Pleanála on the 1st day of June, 2018, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development and the development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

2. The proposed development shall be amended as follows:
 - (a) The first floor balcony shall be omitted.

Revised drawings showing compliance with this requirement shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interests of residential amenity.

3. Details of the materials, colours and textures of all the external finishes shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of visual amenity.

4. Water supply and drainage arrangements, including the disposal and attenuation of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services.

Reason: In the interest of public health.

5. Site development and building works shall be carried out only between the hours of 0700 to 1800 Mondays to Fridays inclusive, between 0800 to 1400 hours on Saturdays and not at all on Sundays and public holidays.

Deviation from these times will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances where prior written approval has been received from the planning authority.

Reason: In order to safeguard the residential amenities of property in the vicinity.

6. The site development works and construction works shall be carried out in such a manner as to ensure that the adjoining streets are kept clear of debris, soil and other material and if the need arises for cleaning works to be carried out on the adjoining public roads, the said cleaning works shall be carried out at the developer's expense.

Reason: To ensure that the adjoining roadways are kept in a clean and safe condition during construction works in the interest of orderly development.

Una O'Neill
Senior Planning Inspector

12th September 2018