



An
Bord
Pleanála

Inspector's Report ABP-304943-19

| | |
|-------------------------------------|--|
| Development | Attic Conversion |
| Location | 9 Grange Court, Rathfarnham, Dublin 16. |
| Planning Authority | Dun Laoghaire-Rathdown County Council |
| Planning Authority Reg. Ref. | D19B/0228 |
| Applicant(s) | Deirdre Ryan |
| Type of Application | Permission |
| Planning Authority Decision | Refuse permission. |
| Type of Appeal | First Party |
| Appellant | Deirdre Ryan |
| Observer(s) | None. |
| Date of Site Inspection | 13 th September 2019 |
| Inspector | Paul O'Brien |

1.0 Site Location and Description

- 1.1. No. 9 Grange Court is a two-storey, detached, gable fronted house located on the western side of this residential street. Grange Court is a residential development of similar detached houses located to the north of Grange Road and Marley Park. Surrounding areas are in a similar, established residential use.
- 1.2. The street slopes upwards on a north to south axis. The front building line is not uniform and a number of houses have been extended to the front in the form of projecting bays and front canopies.
- 1.3. The floor area of the house is given as 193 sq m and from the submitted plans it is a four-bedroom unit. The house is provided with generous rear garden space and a separation distance of circa 20 m to the rear boundary fence.

2.0 Proposed Development

- 2.1. The proposed development consists of the conversion of the existing attic space for unspecified residential use. The converted attic will provide for an additional 46 sq m of floor area. The conversion is facilitated through the raising and modification of the existing roof, the provision of dormer windows on the front/ south east and rear/ north west gable elevations and rooflights on the sides/ north east and south west roof profiles.

3.0 Planning Authority Decision

3.1. Decision

The Planning Authority decided to refuse permission for one reason as follows:

The proposed alteration to the existing roof which includes the raising of the roof height and the provision of roof dormer extensions to the front and rear would by virtue of its design, height and bulk appear overly dominant and create a visually dominant element in the streetscape and would, if permitted create a precedent for similarly scaled developments and would be contrary to Section 8.2.3.4 of the Dún Laoghaire-Rathdown County Development Plan 2016 - 2022. The proposed development would be out of character with the neighbouring dwellings, would

seriously injure the visual amenities of the area and would, thereby, be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

3.2. Planning Authority Reports

3.2.1. Planning Reports

The planning report reflects the decision to refuse permission for the proposed development. The Case Officer reported that the submitted elevational drawings were 'unclear and misleading' as heights have not been adequately indicated. In addition, no roof plan has been submitted which would clearly indicate the revisions to this part of the house. The overall modification to the roof and insertion of dormers would result in a house that would dominant the existing streetscape.

3.2.2. Other Technical Reports

Drainage Planning – Municipal Services Department: No objection.

4.0 Planning History

P.A. Ref. D11B/0365 refers to an April 2012 decision to grant permission for a two-storey extension to the side and rear of no. 9 Grange Court, providing for increased floor area at ground and first floor levels and a single-storey garage extension to the northern side of the house.

P.A. Ref. D19B/0392 refers to a current application for alterations to the existing roof of no. 9 Grange Court (subject house) by raising the roof to allow for an attic conversion with dormer extension to rear with associated site works. No decision has been issued on this application to date.

P.A. Ref. D05B/0968 refers to a February 2006 decision to grant permission for a two-storey extension to the front, side and rear and single-storey extension including bay window to the front of no. 6 Grange Court including elevational changes.

5.0 Policy and Context

5.1. Development Plan

- 5.1.1. Under the Dun Laoghaire-Rathdown County Development Plan 2016 – 2022, Grange Court including the subject site is zoned A ‘To protect and/or improve residential amenity’. Residential development is listed within the ‘Permitted in Principle’ category of this zoning objective.
- 5.1.2. Chapter 8 of the Dun Laoghaire-Rathdown County Development Plan 2016 – 2022 refers to ‘Principles of Development’ and the following are relevant to the subject development:

8.2 ‘Development Management’ – with particular reference to section 8.2.3 ‘Residential Development’ and 8.2.3.4 ‘Additional Accommodation in Existing Built up Areas’. The following are relevant to this development:

Roof alterations/expansions to main roof profiles - changing the hip-end roof of a semi-detached house to a gable/‘A’ frame end or ‘half-hip’ for example – will be assessed against a number of criteria including:

- *Careful consideration and special regard to the character and size of the structure, its position on the streetscape and proximity to adjacent structures.*
- *Existing roof variations on the streetscape.*
- *Distance/contrast/visibility of proposed roof end.*
- *Harmony with the rest of the structure, adjacent structures and prominence.*

Dormer extensions to roofs will be considered with regard to impacts on existing character and form, and the privacy of adjacent properties. The design, dimensions and bulk of any roof proposal relative to the overall size of the dwelling and gardens will be the overriding considerations. Dormer extensions shall be set back from the eaves, gables and/or party boundaries.

The proposed quality of materials/finishes for dormers will be considered carefully as this can greatly improve their appearance. The level and type of glazing within a

dormer structure should have regard to existing window treatments and fenestration of the dwelling.

Particular care will be taken in evaluating large, visually dominant dormer window structures, with a balance sought between quality residential amenity and the privacy of adjacent properties. Excessive overlooking of adjacent properties should be avoided unless support by the neighbours affected can be demonstrated.

More innovative design responses will be encouraged, particularly within sites where there may be difficulty adhering to the above guidance and where objectives of habitability and energy conservation are at stake.

5.2. Natural Heritage Designations

None.

6.0 The Appeal

6.1. Grounds of Appeal

The applicant has appealed the decision of the Planning Authority to refuse permission and has engaged the services of Dublin Planning to prepare the appeal and the issues raised include:

- Disagree with the reason for refusal with respect to the impact from the raising of the roof. Similar developments have been permitted in the immediate area and it is considered that the development would not have a negative impact on the visual amenity of the area. A list of revised roof types with supporting photographs have been provided in support of this development.

Note: The applicant has referred to examples outside of the Dun Laoghaire-Rathdown administrative area.

- The proposed design ensures a good level of integration with the existing house and the proposed development will break up the monotony of the existing streetscape.

6.2. **Planning Authority Response**

- The submitted details do not change the opinion of the Planning Authority.

6.3. **Observations**

- None.

7.0 **Assessment**

7.1. The main issues that arise for assessment in relation to the appeal can be addressed under the following headings:

- Design and Impact on the Visual Character of the Area
- Impact on the residential amenity of the area
- Appropriate Assessment Screening

7.2. **Design and Impact on the Visual Character of the Area**

7.2.1. The proposed development would result in the raising of the roof ridgeline by 800 mm, the provision of a dormer window on the front/ south east and rear/ north west roof profiles, the revision of the roof profile from gable front/ rear to hipped roof and for the conversion of the attic space for undefined use. Floor to ceiling heights within the converted attic are indicated to be 2.273 m and therefore are not in compliance with the current Building Regulations for habitable floor area; it is therefore considered that this space is only suitable for storage and non-habitable purposes.

Note: I have measured the increase in height as circa 800mm when taken from the front – southeast and rear-north west elevations of Drawing no. P-01.

7.2.2. I note the photographs submitted in support of this appeal by the applicant, however I consider the impact of the development on its immediate area as the most important consideration in assessing the suitability of this development.

7.2.3. I would consider that the character of the area is defined by a number of factors namely the detached gable fronted houses, the extensive tree planting in the area and the slope of the street upwards on a north to south axis. As already noted, the

front building line is not uniform, and a number of houses on this street have already had extensive alterations carried out to their front elevation.

- 7.2.4. I therefore consider that the raising of the roof ridgeline by 800 mm is acceptable and will not result in an overly dominant alteration to this house. The provision of a dormer window to the front elevation as proposed is not, in my view, a satisfactory design solution in the context of the existing streetscape at this location. The rear dormer and side rooflights will allow for adequate daylight into this space. Similarly, the gable profile to the front of the roof should, in my view be retained as this is a significant feature of the houses on Grange Court. The revisions to the rear roof profile are considered to be visually acceptable and do not negatively impact on the established character of the area.

7.3. Impact on the Residential Amenity of the Area

- 7.3.1. I do not foresee any negative impacts to neighbouring properties from overshadowing leading to a loss of daylight. Similarly, overlooking leading to a loss of privacy is not foreseen. There is a separation distance in excess of 18 m between the first-floor rear windows and the rear boundary to the north west.

7.4. Appropriate Assessment Screening

- 7.4.1. Having regard to the nature and scale of the proposed development and the location of the site in a serviced urban area and the separation distance to the nearest European site, no Appropriate Assessment issues arise, and it is not considered that the development would be likely to give rise to a significant effect individually or in combination with other plans or projects on a European site.

8.0 Recommendation

- 8.1. I recommend that permission be granted subject to conditions.

9.0 Reasons and Considerations

- 9.1.1. Having regard to the provisions of the Dun Laoghaire-Rathdown County Development Plan 2016 – 2022 and the zoning for residential purposes, to the location of the site in an established residential area and to the nature, form, scale and design of the proposed development, it is considered, that subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the proposed development would not seriously injure the residential or visual amenities of the area. The proposed development would therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

10.0 Conditions

| | |
|----|---|
| 1. | <p>The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application on the 3rd of May 2019, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the Planning Authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the Planning Authority prior to commencement of development and the development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.</p> <p>Reason: In the interest of clarity.</p> |
| 2. | <p>The proposed development shall be amended as follows:</p> <p>(a) The dormer to the front/ south east roof profile shall be omitted and a gable front provided instead of a hipped roof. External finishes shall harmonise with existing in terms of materials, colours and texture.</p> <p>(b) The height of the revised roof shall not exceed an additional 800 mm measured from the top of the existing roof ridgeline.</p> <p>Revised drawings showing compliance with these requirements shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing with, the planning authority prior to commencement of development.</p> <p>Reason: In the interests of visual amenity.</p> |
| 3. | <p>Water supply and drainage arrangements, including the disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the planning authority for such works and services.</p> <p>Reason: In the interest of public health and to ensure a proper standard of development.</p> |

| | |
|----|---|
| 4. | <p>Site development and building works shall be carried out only between the hours of 0800 to 1900 Mondays to Fridays inclusive, between 0800 to 1400 hours on Saturdays and not at all on Sundays and public holidays. Deviation from these times will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances where prior written approval has been received from the planning authority.</p> <p>Reason: In order to safeguard the residential amenities of property in the vicinity.</p> |
|----|---|

Paul O'Brien
Planning Inspector

23rd September 2019