



Development	House and double garage with wastewater treatment plant including polishing filter, bored well, construction of new entrance and associated site works. Goldenhill, Manor Kilbride, Blessington, Co. Wicklow
Planning Authority	Wicklow County Council
Planning Authority Reg. Ref.	19/971
Applicant(s)	Nicola Donohoe
Type of Application	Permission
Planning Authority Decision	Grant Permission with conditions.
Type of Appeal	Third Party
Appellant(s)	Lewis & Frances Clohessy
Date of Site Inspection	23 <sup>rd</sup> January 2020
Inspector	Paul O'Brien

# 1.0 Site Location and Description

- 1.1. The subject site with a stated area of 0.75 hectares, comprises an area of land located to the east of a local road (L8375) in Goldenhill, Manor Kilbride, Co. Wicklow. This road connects to the R759 to the north and in turn connects to the N81 approximately 1.5 km to the north of the subject site. The site is almost rectangular in shape widening slightly to the eastern side and is provided on a west to east axis with an additional smaller section extending northwards from the north east corner. This smaller section is only connected to the main area of land by a narrow join of 6/7 m in width.
- 1.2. The ground level of the site is 2 m+ above that of the public road. The site is not developed and is under grass. A steep bank with hedgerow/ trees forms the roadside boundary and which is augmented by wooden fencing. There is no vehicular access to the site from the public road due to the boundary bank. A gate in the boundary appears to be there as part of the fencing rather than as an access point. Trees are located on the northern boundary and a hedgerow is to the east.
- 1.3. As stated, the site is located within Goldenhill, which is a cluster of detached houses focused on the local road and a cul-de-sac which extends to the west of this road. There are some commercial developments in the form of vehicle repairs/ dismantling and agricultural related yards/ buildings within Goldenhill. Surrounding lands are primarily in agricultural use, though such use is limited due to the rolling nature of the lands in this part of Co. Wicklow.

### 2.0 **Proposed Development**

- 2.1. The proposed development consists of:
  - A single-storey detached house with detached double garage located to the north of the house. The house to provide for three bedrooms and a stated floor area of 196 sq m. The garage to have a floor area of 45 sq m.
  - Wastewater treatment system (Oakstown) with ecoFlo Coconut filter and soil polishing filter.
  - Bored well.
  - New entrance onto the public road.

• All associated site works including a hedgerow, which is to be planted to provide the site boundary.

# 3.0 Planning Authority Decision

### 3.1. Decision

The Planning Authority decided to grant permission subject to conditions. The recommended conditions are generally standard. Condition no. 2 restricts the use of the house to the applicant or to those who comply with the Wicklow County Development Plan requirements for a period of seven years from first occupation. Condition no. 4 requires the omission of the projecting bay windows from the front elevation and replaced with symmetrical windows. Conditions no. 5 and 6 require revisions to the roadside boundary and the entrance to the site. Condition no. 12 requires the house to be built into the hillside such that the finished floor level shall not be more than 0.5 m above the existing ground level.

#### 3.2. Planning Authority Reports

#### 3.2.1. Planning Reports

The Planning report reflects the decision to grant permission subject to conditions. The Planning Authority Case Officer noted the history of applications on this site and the proposed method of wastewater treatment will ensure that the development is acceptable, thereby addressing the most recent reason for refusal of permission.

### 3.2.2. Other Technical Reports

**Environmental Health Officer** – Report from EHO stating no objection subject to condition.

**Roads Section** – No objection subject to condition. Note that no letter of consent was submitted with the application allowing the adjacent ditch, which is in third party control, to be cut back to provide adequate sightlines.

**Baltinglass Municipal District Office** – No objection subject to conditions regarding the need to set back the boundary, which may require a letter of consent and no surface water to enter onto the public road.

**Kildare National Road Office (NRO)** – Assessed within the context of the proposed N81 Hollywood to Tallaght, road improvement scheme and as the development lies outside of the preferred route, no adverse impacts are foreseen.

Dublin City Council – No objection subject to conditions.

**Environmental Health Officer**: Note that the site is area of the site at 0.17 hectares is less than the Wicklow County Council Guidelines which require a site of 0.2 hectares, however it is recommended that the proposed wastewater treatment system is acceptable subject to conditions.

#### 3.3. **Objections/ Observations**

A single letter of objection was received from L & F Clohessy, the appellants in this case, raising similar issues to those in the appeal. The main issues in summary include:

- This is a repeat application and there are no material differences from the previous submitted details.
- The objectors reside opposite this site. They note concern regarding the impact from the proposed wastewater treatment system and the concentration of these systems in the immediate area. The density of development has increased over the years.
- The objectors have had problems with pollution to their water supply.
- The proposed development is overbearing and would have a negative impact on the rural character of the area.
- Request that the Local Authority provide a public water and wastewater treatment system for the Goldenhill area.

# 4.0 Planning History

**P.A. Ref. 17/1136/ ABP Ref. PL27.301218** refers to a February 2019 decision to refuse permission for a similar development of a single detached house, double garage, wastewater treatment system, new entrance and associated site works for a single reason as follows:

'The Board is not satisfied that, when taken in conjunction with the location of the proposed development within an area identified as being within a very high risk

category for domestic wastewater treatment systems, the development would not contribute to an unacceptable increase of nitrate levels in the receiving groundwater and result in excessive concentration of development served by wastewater treatment units in the area. Accordingly, it has not been demonstrated that the effluent generated as a result of the development can be adequately treated and safely disposed of on-site without risk to groundwater quality. The proposed development would, therefore, be prejudicial to public health and would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area'.

#### The Board Direction also included the following:

**'Note:** Notwithstanding the location of the proposed development within an identified Rural Cluster according to the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016-2022, the Board considered that the site was located within a rural area under urban influence, and had regard to National Policy Objective 19 of the National Planning Framework issued by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government in February, 2018 which, for rural areas under urban influence, seeks to facilitate the provision of single housing in the countryside based on the core consideration of demonstrable economic or social need to live in a rural area, having regard to the viability of smaller towns and rural settlements, and was not satisfied that the applicant demonstrated compliance with National Policy Objective 19'.

**P.A. Ref. 10/3013** refers to a January 2011 decision to refuse permission for a dwelling with an on-site effluent treatment system and all associated site works. A single reason for refusal was issued and in summary was: the development would be prejudicial to public health due to it adding to the proliferation of treatment systems within the Liffey catchment area; due to the high water table evident on the site and the proposed system did not demonstrate compliance with the EPA code of Practice, 2009.

Permission was granted for a house on the site to the south under **P.A. Ref. 08/580** and on the site to the north under **P.A. Ref. 03/8408**.

## 5.0 Policy and Context

#### 5.1. Development Plan

- 5.1.1. Under the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 2022, the majority of the subject site is located within the Goldenhill Level 9 Rural Cluster. The small area of land to the north east of the site is located within the rural area outside of the designated Rural Cluster. Under 'Role and Function' of a Rural Clusters, it states '...the main purpose of the designation is to direct rural generated housing into clusters rather than the open countryside'. An indicative growth control of 4 units per cluster is provided, though an increase in excess of 5 is considered subject to the form/ capacity able to accommodate more and secondly the total housing growth target for such clusters is not exceeded. Multi-house development is not permitted in the rural clusters.
- 5.1.2. Within Chapter 2 Vision and Core Strategy, an assessment of the rural areas found that there is no evidence of significant population decline in any part of the County and pressure for rural housing around the fringes of major towns is evident. The following is relevant:

'It is therefore concluded that there are effectively no 'structurally weak' areas in the County. Furthermore, when the 'zone of influence' of urban areas is considered (which includes the influence of Dublin as well as major towns in the County, namely the Bray–Greystones cluster, Rathdrum, Wicklow-Rathnew, Arklow, Blessington and Baltinglass), it is evident that the entire County can be considered an area under strong urban influence. This would be consistent with the preliminary analysis carried out as part of the National Spatial Strategy 2002 – 2020'.

5.1.3. In accordance with Objective HD21, an applicant/ purchaser of a new home must

'(a) be a resident for at least 10 years duration in County Wicklow of a settlement / area designated as Level 7-10 in the County settlement hierarchy that is within 10km of the rural cluster in question prior to making of application / purchase of new house.

- (b) demonstrate a proven need for housing, for example:
- first time home owners;

- someone that previously owned a home and is no longer in possession of that home as it had to be disposed following legal separation / divorce, the transfer of a home attached to a farm to a family member or the past sale of a home following emigration'.
- 5.1.4. The Wicklow Landscape Category Map Appendix 5 indicates that the site is located within a Corridor Area and Map 10.13(d) designates the area as within the Western Corridor. Section 4(b) The N81 of the Wicklow County Development Plan states the following:

'This landscape area covers the main access corridor along the west of the County. The boundary of the western corridor generally follows what is considered to be the area upon which the greatest influence is exerted by this secondary access route. This route, for the most part, runs through the more low lying and accessible tracts of land, providing expansive views of the Wicklow Mountain Range, intermittent views of the Blessington lakes south of Blessington with its primary function being the connection between the towns of Blessington and Baltinglass in the west of the County'.

- 5.1.5. 'Appendix 1 Development Design Standards' refers to rural clusters and design should be on the basis of Appendix 2. 'Appendix 2 Design Guidelines for New Homes in Rural Wicklow' is noted and provides extensive guidance on the location, layout and design of houses in rural locations that include rural clusters.
- 5.1.6. Objective WI7 of Chapter 9 Infrastructure, is relevant to this development and states:

Permission will be considered for private wastewater treatment plants for single rural houses where:

- the specific ground conditions have been shown to be suitable for the construction of a treatment plant and any associated percolation area;
- the system will not give rise to unacceptable adverse impacts on ground waters / aquifers and the type of treatment proposed has been drawn up in

accordance with the appropriate groundwater protection response set out in the Wicklow Groundwater Protection Scheme (2003);

- the proposed method of treatment and disposal complies with Wicklow County Council's Policy for Wastewater Treatment & Disposal Systems for Single Houses (PE ≤ 10) and the Environmental Protection Agency "Waste Water Treatment Manuals"; and
- in all cases the protection of ground and surface water quality shall remain the overriding priority and proposals must definitively demonstrate that the proposed development will not have an adverse impact on water quality standards and requirements set out in EU and national legislation and guidance documents.

#### 5.2. National Guidance

- 5.2.1. The Sustainable Rural Housing Guidelines for Planning Authorities (April 2005) is relevant to this proposal as they set out the need for rural housing in appropriate/ sustainable locations.
- 5.2.2. National Planning Framework Project Ireland 2040 recognises the importance of rural Ireland. National Policy Objective 19 is noted as relevant to this development:

Ensure, in providing for the development of rural housing, that a distinction is made between areas under urban influence, i.e. within the commuter catchment of cities and large towns and centres of employment, and elsewhere:

- In rural areas under urban influence, facilitate the provision of single housing in the countryside based on the core consideration of demonstrable economic or social need to live in a rural area and siting and design criteria for rural housing in statutory guidelines and plans, having regard to the viability of smaller towns and rural settlements;
- In rural areas elsewhere, facilitate the provision of single housing in the countryside based on siting and design criteria for rural housing in statutory guidelines and plans, having regard to the viability of smaller towns and rural settlements.

#### 5.3. Natural Heritage Designations

The subject site is not located within any Natural Heritage designated lands. The Poulaphouca Reservoir SPA is located c. 2.7 km to the south of the site. The Wicklow Mountains SAC is located c. 4.6 km to the east of the site.

### 6.0 The Appeal

#### 6.1. Grounds of Appeal

Lewis & Frances Clohessy who reside at 'Ithaca' Goldenhill, to the west of the public road/ appeal site have appealed the decision of Wicklow County Council to grant permission. The main issues raised in summary, include:

- This is a repeat application and there are no material differences from the previous submitted application refused by the Planning Authority and An Bord Pleanála on appeal. The only change is the effluent is to be passed through a soil polishing filter rather than a gravel disposal pad.
- The objectors reside opposite this site. They note concern regarding the impact from the proposed wastewater treatment system and the concentration of these systems in the immediate area. The density of development has increased over the years and they were advised in the past that the number of houses in the area would be limited.
- The objectors have had problems with pollution to their water supply. The proposed development is contrary to Objective W17 of the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 – 2022 which seeks to protect water quality.
- Concern raised in respect of a number of aspects of the Planning Authority planning report.
- The proposed development is overbearing and would have a negative impact on the rural character of the area through the removal of hedgerows and would not be in accordance with National Policy Objective 19 of the National Planning Framework.
- Question the EHO report and the fact that the P-value of the soil on site has gone from 24 to 65 from the previous application to the subject appeal. The drainage adviser has found the value to be 25.

#### 6.2. Applicant Response

The applicant has engaged the services of Vincent JP Farry and Co Ltd – Planning and Development Consultants and who have submitted a detailed response to the appeal. This response includes site location details and consideration of relevant national/ local guidelines as well as legal issues. The following points in particular regarding the appeal are noted:

- The ABP Case Officer reported under P.A. Ref. 17/1136/ ABP Ref. PL27.301218 that the applicant adequately demonstrated compliance with the requirements of the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 – 2022. The PA Case Officer has reached the same conclusion with respect to the subject application/ appeal.
- The house design is generally acceptable and would not be overbearing on the rural setting of the area.
- Vehicular access to the site can be achieved in accordance with the requirements of the Wicklow County Roads Section.
- The site is considered to be suitable for the development of a house to serve a local housing need.
- Details of the applicant's connection to the area are provided and land registry details of land that the applicant's parents own, are referred to. Other family related issues are referred to.
- The proposed wastewater treatment system is suitable for this development and the subject site.
- No technical details provided that demonstrate that there is an over proliferation of houses/ treatment systems in the area.

# 7.0 Assessment

- 7.1. The main issues that arise for consideration in relation to this appeal can be addressed under the following headings:
  - Compliance with Requirements for a Rural House
  - Wastewater Treatment and Water Supply
  - Design and Impact on the Character of the Area

- Impact on Residential Amenity
- Appropriate Assessment Screening

#### 7.2. Compliance with Requirements for a Rural House

- 7.2.1. I have had full regard to the planning history of this site and the documentation submitted in support of the application. Objective HD21 of the current Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 2022 sets out requirements for housing in the rural areas (Level 6 to 10) of the county. Goldenhill is designated as a rural cluster (Level 9) and the requirements are clearly set out and in summary they are:
  - a) Be a resident for at least 10 years in the County, within a level 7 to 10 settlement that is within 10 km of the rural cluster in question.
  - b) Demonstrate a need for housing, either a first time home owner or someone who owned a house but it is now disposed due to legal separation/ divorce, emigration or transfer of a home attached to a farm to another family member.

The criteria are clear. From the submitted documentation, I am satisfied that the applicant is applying on the basis of first time homeowner thereby meeting the requirements of part b) of HD21 with reference to Rural Clusters. I am not convinced that she has sufficiently demonstrated her residency in the area for at least 10 years. I have gone through the submitted documentation and note the following:

- Attendance at St. Brigid's National School whilst resident at Glen Heste, Manor Kilbride from 1985 to 1993. This gives 8 to 9 years. The standard school term is from late August to end of June, but if we count from start of 1985 to end of 1993, that is 9 years.
- Letter from Revenue dated May 2016, only gives her address as Glenheste, Manorkilbride (sic) and that she has not registered for Mortgage Interest Relief over the period of the Revenue records since 2002. This does not state how long she lived in the area.
- Letter of Consent from K & E O'Brien, to cut back vegetation in order to achieve necessary site lines, is not dated or give any details on the applicant's place of residence.

- Later from the applicant dated 23<sup>rd</sup> of November 2017, states she has never owned a dwelling. No address is given.
- Letter from the applicant's father giving consent for her to make an application for planning permission on his land. No details given as to her address. The family address at Glen Heste, Manor Kilbride is on lands that are designated as Level 10 – Open Countryside.
- Letter from the Parish Priest dated 16<sup>th</sup> March 2016, states that she is member of the parish since her birth, attended the local school and received her communion and confirmation at the local church. No details are indicated here as to how long she has lived in the area.
- Letters of support from local residents are noted but provide no official details as to how long she has lived here.
- Letter from Secretary of the Manor Kilbride Dramatic Society dated 26<sup>th</sup> of June 2017 states the applicant is a member of the society. No details are indicated here as to how long she has lived in the area.
- Letter from Co-Ordinator of Protecting Uplands & Rural Environments (PURE) Manor Kilbride dated 26<sup>th</sup> of June 2017 states that the applicant is an active participant of this organisation. No details are indicated here as to how long she has lived in the area.
- Letter from the Secretary of the Cuman Chill Bride CLG (Kilbride GAA Club) dated 23<sup>rd</sup> of February 2016 states that she is the captain of the Ladies Senior Team and that the Donohue family have been great supporters of the Club since its foundation in 1954. No details are indicated here as to how long she has lived in the area.
- Statutory Declaration dated 3<sup>rd</sup> of August 2017. This states that her address is Glen Heste, Manor Kilbride, however it is not stated for how long she has lived in the area.
- 7.2.2. A lot of documentation has been submitted in support of the application, however, I consider that the information provided does not demonstrate that she has lived in the area for 10 years in accordance with the requirements for housing in Rural Clusters as set out in the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 2022. The requirements for a house in such an area are clear and it is up to the applicant to demonstrate

compliance with each application. I accept that the letter from the school demonstrates that she has lived in the area for a period of 8 to 9 years, but she has failed to demonstrate her residency for the required 10 years.

- 7.2.3. The Board in their Direction under ABP Ref. ABP-301218-18 noted that they considered the site to be within an area under urban influence and were not satisfied that the applicant demonstrated compliance with National Policy Objective 19. The Wicklow County Development Plan has also assessed development in the rural areas and concludes 'that the entire County can be considered an area under strong urban influence'. NPF19 seeks to redirect new housing from rural areas to smaller towns and rural settlements. Whilst Goldenhill is a designated rural cluster, the nearby Manor Kilbride is a Level 7 Large Village and is more appropriate for development such as this. No detail is provided as to whether the applicant is in employment and if so, where she works. I do accept that she has a strong local connection to the area but the documentation submitted with the application does not demonstrate a clear 'economic or social need to live in' this rural cluster.
- 7.2.4. The documentation as submitted with an application is the only acceptable way to determine a person's compliance with National and Local Policy. From the available information, I therefore consider that she has not demonstrated compliance with National Policy Objective 19 and permission should be refused.

#### 7.3. Wastewater Treatment and Water Supply

- 7.3.1. It is proposed to install a package wastewater treatment system, secondary treatment (Oakstown BAF system) and finally treatment through an Ecoflo Coconut polishing filter. The discharge is collected and pumped to a soil polishing filter. The treatment system is located approx. 23 m east of the house. Table 6.1 of the 'EPA Code of Practice for Waste Water Treatment and Disposal Systems Serving Single Houses' sets out minimum separation distances and the proposed development is compliant.
- 7.3.2. The site is located in an area identified with a "High" vulnerability classification in the GSI Groundwater maps and is located within area defined "Poor" Aquifer category, representing a Groundwater Protection Response of R1 under the EPA Code of Practice Wastewater Treatment and Disposal Systems Serving Single Houses (2009) (Annex B2). There was no indication of ponding on the day of the site visit.

- 7.3.3. The trial hole had a depth of 2.3 m and the assessment submitted by the applicant indicates that bedrock and the water table were not encountered at this depth. The submitted site characterisation records a T-test value (modified method) of 62.98 min/25mm indicating a slow soakage but which is within acceptable limits and a P-test value of 64.92 min/25mm. The submitted report indicates that three separated trial holes were provided. The report has found that the site is not suitable for treatment by way of a septic tank but is suitable for a secondary treatment system. All required separation distances to houses, structures and other treatment systems are complied with.
- 7.3.4. The previous application/ appeal on this site under P.A. Ref. 17/1136/ ABP Ref. PL27.301218 was refused permission due to concern regarding the ability of the proposed wastewater treatment system to adequately treat generated effluent. The proposed development includes an additional level of wastewater treatment from that previously proposed. I note the Site Characterisation Report by Dr. E. Bolton and that while soakage is low, it is within an acceptable level, T-Value of 63. The P-Value is 65; there has been some confusion in this figure, but I accept the current figures as correct. A report by Dr Bolton on an assessment of the existing groundwater conditions, has found that there is contamination of these waters by septic tank effluent and there are no elevated levels of nitrate in the groundwater. The proposed development is unlikely to give rise to elevated levels of nitrate in the groundwater. The analysis has found that groundwater quality is within the Drinking Water Regulations and Groundwater Quality Standard.
- 7.3.5. In conclusion, from the submitted details and the reports of the EHO and the Dublin City Council Water Services Engineer, the proposed development is unlikely to have a negative impact on the groundwater in the area or on watercourses subject to the provision of the wastewater treatment system as detailed in the application.

#### 7.4. Design and Impact on the Character of the Area

7.4.1. The proposed house will be approximately 4m higher, above the level of the road along the front of the site, however there will a separation distance of 51 m between the house and the roadside edge reducing any visual impact. The proposed single-storey house is to have a roof ridge height of 6 m. It is considered that the location of

the house almost midway along the site is visually acceptable and will not be overbearing on the existing residential units to the west of the site.

7.4.2. I have noted the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 – 2022 includes Appendix 2 – 'Single Rural Houses – Design Guidelines for New Homes in Rural Wicklow'. These guidelines are detailed and provide clear information on suitable house designs for the rural areas of Co. Wicklow. The proposed house does not appear to have had regard to these guidelines and the submitted design is very suburban and not characteristic of rural Wicklow. It may be possible to revise the design by condition and the replacement of the hipped roof with a gable ended roof and omission of the bay windows would improve the design somewhat. The elevation walls to roof plane ratio are not acceptable in terms of the type of house expected in a rural location, though this is possibly due to the attic space design allowing for the submitted plans/ supporting documentation. Similar issues of concern were raised in the previous application/ appeal under P.A. Ref. 17/1136/ ABP Ref. PL27.301218 and no effort has been taken to address these concerns.

#### 7.5. Impact on Residential Amenity

- 7.5.1. The proposed house is considered to be acceptable in terms of adequate room sizes and storage provision. Adequate private amenity space is available to the rear/ side of the proposed house.
- 7.5.2. The proposed development does not impact on any other houses in terms of overlooking leading to a loss of privacy or in terms of overshadowing leading to a loss of daylight. More than adequate separation distances are proposed.

#### 7.6. Appropriate Assessment Screening

7.6.1. Having regard to the nature and scale of the proposed development and the location of the site and the separation distance to the nearest European site, no Appropriate Assessment issues arise, and it is not considered that the development would be likely to give rise to a significant effect individually or in combination with other plans or projects on an European site.

## 8.0 Recommendation

8.1. I recommend that planning permission be refused for the following reasons and considerations as set out below.

### 9.0 **Reasons and Considerations**

- Having regard to the location of the site within an "Area Under Strong Urban 9.1. Influence" as identified in Sustainable Rural Housing Guidelines for Planning Authorities issued by the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government in April 2005 and the National Policy Objectives of the National Planning Framework (February 2018), which seek to manage the growth of areas that are under strong urban influence to avoid over-development and to ensure that the provision of single housing in rural areas under urban influence are provided based upon demonstrable economic or social need to live in a rural area, and in an area where housing is restricted to persons demonstrating local need in accordance with the current Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 - 2022, it is considered that the applicant does not come within the scope of the housing need criteria as set out in the Guidelines, National Policy or the Development Plan for a house at this location. The proposed development, in the absence of any identified locally based need for the house, would contribute to the encroachment of random rural development in the area and would militate against the preservation of the rural environment and the efficient provision of public services and infrastructure. The proposed development would, thus, contravene the objectives of the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 - 2022, would be contrary to the provisions of the Sustainable Rural Housing Guidelines for Planning Authorities and rural policy provisions of the National Planning Framework, and would, therefore, be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.
- 9.2. It is considered that, by reason of the primarily suburban style of house and lack of regard to the Wicklow County Development Plan 2016 2022 with specific reference to Appendix 2 'Single Rural Houses Design Guidelines for New Homes in Rural Wicklow', the proposed house would be visually obtrusive in this rural area. The

proposed house would, therefore, be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Paul O'Brien Planning Inspector

24<sup>th</sup> January 2020