

Inspector's Report ABP-306164-19

Development Location	Provision of a dormer window and two rooflights to the front of the dwelling. 216 Howth Road, Killester, Dublin 3
Planning Authority	Dublin City Council
Planning Authority Reg. Ref.	4096/19
Applicant(s)	Peter Holland
Type of Application	Permission
Planning Authority Decision	Refuse
Type of Appeal	First-Party v Refusal
Appellant(s)	Peter Holland
Observer(s)	None
Date of Site Inspection	15 th March 2020
Inspector	Rachel Kenny

Contents

1.0 Site	e Location and Description
2.0 Pro	posed Development
3.0 Pla	nning Authority Decision3
3.1.	Decision
3.2.	Planning Authority Reports4
3.3.	Prescribed Bodies
3.4.	Third-Party Submissions5
4.0 Pla	nning History5
4.1.	Appeal Site5
4.2.	Surrounding Sites6
5.0 Pol	licy & Context6
5.1.	Development Plan6
5.2.	Environmental Impact Assessment - Preliminary Examination7
6.0 The	e Appeal7
6.1.	Grounds of Appeal7
6.2.	Observations8
7.0 As	sessment8
8.0 Ap	propriate Assessment9
9.0 Re	commendation9
10.0	Reasons and Considerations 10
11.0	Conditions

1.0 Site Location and Description

- 1.1. The appeal site is located on Howth Road immediately North of Killester village centre. It is a simple single-storey semidetached cottage on the West side of the road. The dwelling has been extended at ground floor to the side and rear. There is a dormer on the rear roof plane. The dwelling backs on to the rear garden of No 26 A "The Demesne" to the West.
- 1.2. The dwelling forms part of the large larger Abbeyfield state which was a planned interwar housing scheme for returning servicemen. The entire area is zoned as part of a residential conservation area (RCA).

2.0 **Proposed Development**

The proposed development comprises:

• the provision of a new dormer window and two roof lights to the front of the house.

3.0 Planning Authority Decision

3.1. Decision

3.1.1. The Planning Authority decided to Refuse permission for the following reason

"The subject property is located in a long established Z2 residential conservation area forming part of the Abbeyfield Estate, one of the objectives of which is to protect the visual character and scale of the dwellings within the streetscape. The proposed development of a front roof dormer and two front roof lights would result in a visually incongruous addition to the buildings front roofscape and would render the dwelling inconsistent with its neighbours, out of keeping with the character of the dwelling and inconsistent with the zoning objective to protect and or improve the amenities of the residential conservation area. The proposed development would cause serious injury to the residential amenities of the area and would be contrary to the policies and objectives of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016 - 2022 and to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area."

3.2. Planning Authority Reports

3.2.1. Planning Reports

The report of the Planning Officer (September 2019) reflects the decision of the Planning Authority. The Planning Officer notes the following in their report:

- The report notes that the proposed development is for the provision of a new dormer window and two roof lights to the front of the house
- The report notes the development plan policy with regard to domestic extensions in section 16.10.12 and Appendix 17. It further notes the dwelling is located in a residential conservation area and the land use zoning objective Z2 as set out in section 14.8. 2
- The proposed development includes a front dormer sited at the northern edge of the roof plane 900 mm deep and 2.1m in width. The dormer would have a flat roof and would be zinc clad. In addition, there would be 2 roof lights to the front roof plane to provide light to the bathroom and stairwell the new dormer was lies a new third bedroom as attic level currently in use as a bathroom
- While the dormer is modest in scale it's noted that the dwelling is in a longestablished residential conservation area and it is strongly discouraged to allow new front dormers to these houses with respect to their visual impact on the streetscape. The zoning is in place to protect the historical and streetscape value of the area in terms of the groupings of dwellings, their scale and form and the relationship between the dwellings. For this reason, houses are encouraged to extend to the side to maintain the true form and proportions of the front roof plain and front façade. Extensions on rear dormers are reasonable and have been a satisfactory means of providing additional accommodation without unduly impacting on the streetscape. This approach has been supported and validated by ABP.
- There are isolated examples within the Abbeyfield Estate where front dormers stand out and can be seen to be to the contrary of the visual amenity of the conservation area. The report notes that ABP supported the omission of the front roof lights in the previous application at this property. (see planning history)

- The report concludes that in this instance while the dwelling is on Howth Road rather than the main estate the same concerns stand. Were the dwelling not to be in the Z2 area there would still be some concerns over integration into the streetscape therefore the development is unacceptable.
- The proposed development would be contrary to the visual amenity of the area and the streetscape within this important residential conservation area and so the proposed development would not be considered consistent with the zoning objective and policies and objectives of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016 to 2022. Refusal recommended.

3.2.2. Other Technical Reports

Engineering Department (Drainage Division) - no objection subject to conditions.

3.3. Prescribed Bodies

- Irish Water no response.
- Irish Rail no response.

3.4. Third-Party Submissions

3.4.1. None received.

4.0 **Planning History**

4.1. Appeal Site

4.1.1. **3425/13**

Permission granted for

(1) Single Storey extensions to the ground floor to the side and rear with internal alterations of the existing ground floor accommodation to provide 2 bedrooms and ensuite, WC, utility room, kitchen, dining and living room The existing attic is to be converted and extended to the side and rear to provide 2 bedrooms, a family bathroom and en suite bathroom, new dormer windows to the rear, roof lights to the front, side and rear and over the bedrooms. Demolition of existing chimney. new rendered finish to the front. Demolition of a boiler house to the rear. Widening of vehicle access to the front with new piers and gates onto the Howth Rd. Associated dishing of kerb and all associated works including drainage hard and soft landscaping

Decision appealed to ABP by third party under PLN 242898 but was upheld

4.2. Surrounding Sites

- 4.2.1. The following planning applications relating to neighbouring properties on Maywood Park are referenced by the Planning Authority:
 - No.218 Dublin City Council (DCC) Ref. 2481/15 permission granted for alterations and additions to an existing single storey semi detached bungalow comprising new single storey extension to side and rear. The conversion of existing attic space and extension of same to rear to accommodate 2 new dormer bedrooms one ensuite and new family bathroom at first floor level and the provision of a new velux roof light to the front side and rear elevation together with the widening of the existing vehicular entrance gates onto the Howth road and associated siteworks
 - Front roof lights omitted. Rear roof lights to be standard design

5.0 Policy & Context

5.1. **Development Plan**

- 5.1.1. The appeal site has a zoning objective 'Z2 within the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022, with a stated objective 'to protect, and/or improve the amenities of residential conservation areas.
- 5.1.2. Relevant planning policies and objectives for residential development are set out under Section 5 (Quality Housing) and Section 16 (Development Standards) within Volume 1 of the Development Plan. Appendix 17 (Volume 2) of the Development Plan provides guidance specifically relating to residential extensions.

5.2. Environmental Impact Assessment - Preliminary Examination

5.2.1. Having regard to the existing development on site, the limited nature and scale of the proposed development and the absence of any connectivity to any sensitive location, there is no real likelihood of significant effects on the environment arising from the proposed development. The need for environmental impact assessment can, therefore, be excluded at preliminary examination and a screening determination is not required.

6.0 The Appeal

6.1. Grounds of Appeal

- 6.1.1. A first-party appeal has been lodged following the Planning Authority notification of a decision to refuse planning permission. The following grounds of appeal are raised:
 - The proposed development is in an area zoned Residential Neighbourhoods (Conservation Areas) Zone Z2.
 - the proposed development has been designed to provide its occupants with a high standard a residential amenity in the context of an established urban setting while safeguarding the amenity of adjoining residents.
 - the proposed development in terms of built form and scale is consistent with the character of the area representing an efficient use of zoned serviced land.
 - the proposed development is consistent with the various quantitative standards set out in the Dublin City Development Plan 2016 to 2022.
 - the proposed dormer extension and two no rooflights will not result in any overlooking of adjoining properties.
 - no additional overshadowing will result from the proposed development.
 - the proposed development will not result in No 216 being overbearing to adjoining properties
 - the proposed development will only result in a 1.5 square metre increase in the overall area of the dwelling

- There is precedent for dormer extensions on Howth Rd and of particular relevance are Reg Ref 3593/14 and 32929/19 where dormer extensions were approved and these dormer extensions faced Howth road and Killester road respectively
- 6.1.2. The Planning Authority did not respond to the grounds of appeal.

6.2. **Observations**

6.2.1. None received.

7.0 Assessment

- 7.1. This is a first-party appeal against a refusal for 2 no rooflights and a dormer window to the front elevation of a single storey cottage on Howth road within an RCA.
- 7.2. The planning determined that to allow in particular dormer windows but also roof lights to the front elevation would injure the character and setting of the residential conservation area and it's integrity.
- 7.3. The planning authority further argues that opportunity for extensions exists to the side and rear of such properties in RCAs and that to allow development to the front is not justified in these circumstances.
- 7.4. In response on appeal the appellant argues that the proposed development is modest in scale and does not diminish the integrity of the RCA what is in fact consistent with the character of the area.
- 7.5. The appellant also states that there is no negative impact by way of overlooking or overbearing on adjoining properties and that the proposed development at 1.5 square metres is negligible.
- 7.6. The appellant also cites numerous examples of precedents on the Howth Rd and Killester Rd which have been allowed by Dublin City Council
- 7.7. It is my contention thus the proposed development of two skylights rooflights to the front elevation would not injure the visual amenities of the area and would be in keeping with the character of the area.

- 7.8. The design of the dormer is small scale, contemporary and modest. In my opinion having regard to the receiving environment and streetscape in close proximity to the village of Killester with a wide variety of styles and scales the proposed development will be acceptable in terms of visual amenity.
- 7.9. Furthermore, I consider that this proposed development would not impact on the residential amenities of adjoining properties and would be acceptable in terms of the proper planning and sustainable development of the area
- 7.10. I recommend that the Planning Authority Decision the overturned and permission the granted for the proposed dormer and two rooflights.

8.0 Appropriate Assessment

8.1. Having regard to the minor nature of the proposed development and to the location of the site in a serviced urban area and the separation distance to the nearest European site, no Appropriate Assessment issues arise, and it is not considered that the development would be likely to have a significant effect individually or in combination with other plans or projects on a European site.

9.0 **Recommendation**

9.1. It is recommended that planning permission be granted for the following Reasons and Considerations and subject to the attached conditions.

10.0 Reasons and Considerations.

Having regard to the limited nature and scale of the proposed development, it is considered that the proposed development, would be in accordance with the zoning objectives of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 and would be acceptable in terms of the visual amenities of the area, would not seriously injure the character of the streetscape or the roofscape of the building and would not injure the integrity of the Residential Conservation Area. The proposed development, would therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

11.0 Conditions

1. The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

Rachel Kenny Director of Planning

15th March 2020