



An
Bord
Pleanála

Inspector's Report

ABP-308453-20

Development	Permission for an attic extension to the side of existing dormer room and new windows to the rear with an increase in the dormer roof profile.
Location	72, Rathdown Park, Terenure, Dublin 6W
Planning Authority	Dublin City Council South
Planning Authority Reg. Ref.	WEB1496/20
Applicant(s)	Colin & Melanie Stein
Type of Application	Permission
Planning Authority Decision	Refusal
Type of Appeal	First Party
Appellant(s)	Colin & Melanie Stein
Observer(s)	None
Date of Site Inspection	14 th of December 2020
Inspector	Adrian Ormsby

1.0 Site Location and Description

- 1.1. The appeal site is c. 5.2 km to the south west of Dublin City centre at No. 72, Rathdown Park, Terenure, Dublin 6W. The site has a stated area of 446 sq.m.
- 1.2. The site is located on the south eastern side of Rathdown Park which is an internal estate road located between Rathdown Drive and Rathdown Avenue. The site is c. 200m north west of Bushy Park and the River Dodder.
- 1.3. Rathdown Park is a road characterised by a number of different residential property types, including two storey hipped roofed semi-detached houses, two storey standard pitch roof semi-detached houses, detached two storey houses, semi-detached single storey houses and detached single storey houses. There are also gable fronted houses with first floor accommodation and other non-traditional roof profiles. Many houses have different type of extensions and in particular, one house was noted with a side dormer roof extension.
- 1.4. No. 72 Rathdown Park is a large two storey, semi-detached houses with a hipped roof and high free standing chimney, off the hipped gable. The house is finished mostly in brick to the front elevation with plastered render to the side gable visible from the public road. To the southern side of the house and to its rear there is an attached side garage.
- 1.5. There is a vehicular entrance to the southern side of the house. The front of the house includes a garden, driveway and boundary wall to the public footpath.

2.0 Proposed Development

- 2.1. The proposed development comprises-
 - A roof level attic extension to the rear and side (15.6 sq.m),
 - The extension at roof level is off an existing attic level dormer room
 - The extension provides an additional bedroom, bathroom and store
 - A new window to the rear
 - An increase in dormer roof profile at rear.
 - A total floor area of 33.4 sq.m

3.0 Planning Authority Decision

3.1. Decision

The Planning Authority decided to refuse permission on the 21/09/20 for the following reason-

'Having regard to Section 17.11 of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 and to the pattern of the development in the area, it is considered that the proposed development would have a negative impact on the character and scale of the existing dwelling, does not complement the character of neighbouring properties and would appear visually incongruous on the streetscape. The proposed development would therefore, by itself and by the precedent it would set for other development, seriously injure the visual amenities of the area, be contrary to the provisions of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 and be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.'

4.0 Planning Authority Reports

4.1. Planning Reports

The report of the Planning Officer (21/09/20) reflects the decision of the Planning Authority. The following is noted from the report:

- Given that the roof extension wraps around the hipped roof profile it will be clearly visible from the street.
- The proposed roof extension does not complement to character of the existing dwelling or street and appears visually incongruous in this respect.

4.2. Other Technical Reports

- Drainage Division- No objection subject to condition

4.3. Prescribed Bodies

- None

4.4. Third Party Observations

- None

5.0 Planning History

This site-

- 5564/07- two storey and single storey extension to side, remodelling of the existing main roof profile including dormer extension to rear, Grant, 07/01/08

6.0 Policy Context

6.1. Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022

- 6.1.1. The appeal site has a zoning objective 'Z1 - Sustainable Residential Neighbourhoods' within the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022, with a stated objective *'to protect, provide and improve residential amenities'*.
- 6.1.2. Relevant planning policies and objectives for residential development are set out in Section 16 (Development Standards) within Volume 1 of the Development Plan. Appendix 17 of Volume 2 of the Development Plan provides guidance specifically relating to residential extensions.

Section 16.2.2.3- Extensions and Alterations to Dwellings-

.... alterations and extensions should:.....

- *Retain a significant proportion of the garden space, yard or other enclosure.....*

Furthermore, extensions should:

- *Be clearly subordinate to the existing building in scale and design.....*

Section 16.10.12 Extensions and Alterations to Dwellings:

'Applications for planning permission to extend dwellings will only be granted where the planning authority is satisfied that the proposal will:

- *Not have an adverse impact on the scale and character of the dwelling;*
- *Not adversely affect amenities enjoyed by the occupants of adjacent buildings in terms of privacy, access to daylight and sunlight.'*

Appendix 17 Guidance for Residential Extensions

- Section 17.10 Contemporary Extensions
- Section 17.11 Roof Extensions: *When extending in the roof, the following principles should be observed:*
 - *The design of the dormer should reflect the character of the area, the surrounding buildings and the age and appearance of the existing building.*
 - *Dormer windows should be visually subordinate to the roof slope, enabling a large proportion of the original roof to remain visible.*
 - *Any new window should relate to the shape, size, position and design of the existing doors and windows on the lower floors.*
 - *Roof materials should be covered in materials that match or complement the main building.*
 - *Dormer windows should be set back from the eaves level to minimise their visual impact and reduce the potential for overlooking of adjoining properties.*

6.2. Natural Heritage Designations

- None relevant

7.0 The Appeal

7.1. Grounds of Appeal

The grounds of this first party appeal can be summarised as follows:

- Due to Covid 19 and working from home arrangements there is a need to expand the house.
- There are no objections raised by adjoining property owners to the proposal does not overlook, overshadow, or negate the privacy of adjoining properties.
- The applicants recognise the Planning Authority concerns in relation to the proposal and would have welcomed the opportunity to address them.
- The applicants therefore propose reducing the physical massing of the proposed extension and to allow the original hipped roof profile to remain dominant. Revised drawings have been submitted to reduce the visual impact of the development.
- The dormer extension is reduced by 6 sq.m and the extension is pushed back by 2 m from the front of the house. The front hip line remains dominant.
- The dormer extension will be clad in zinc coated aluminium cladding in order to maintain a contemporary effect to distinguish between new and old.
- The revised proposals balances the need to preserve the existing built form of the neighbourhood and the applicants requirements to extend the home.

7.2. Planning Authority Response

- None received

7.3. Observations

- None

8.0 Assessment

8.1. Main Issues

8.1.1. I consider the main issues in determining this appeal are as follows:-

- Zoning
- Visual Amenity and Character of the Area
- Appropriate Assessment

8.2. Zoning

8.2.1. The subject site is located within an area with a zoning objective 'Z1 - Sustainable Residential Neighbourhoods' within the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022, with a stated objective '*to protect, provide and improve residential amenities*'. The development proposes an attic level dormer extension to an existing house. The development is therefore acceptable in principle.

8.3. Visual Amenity and Character of the Area

8.3.1. The Planning Authority considers the proposed development would have a negative impact on the character and scale of the existing dwelling, does not complement the character of neighbouring properties and would appear visually incongruous on the streetscape.

8.3.2. Having considered the Planning Authority's concerns the applicants have submitted revised proposals reducing the size and scale of the proposed roof extension. The depth of the extension has changed from c. 6.3m to c. 4.3m. It is now set back by 2m and is sited from the main ridge of the existing roof and extends to the rear but sufficiently off the eaves. The applicants state this will lead to a reduction of 6 sq.m in the proposed floor area giving a new proposed floor area of 27.4 sq.m. Accordingly, this assessment is based on the revised proposal submitted with the appeal.

8.3.3. No. 72 Rathdown Park is a large and deep site. The house on this site benefits from a deep roof plan, a high ridge line, a deep back garden and a c. 3m set back from its

south western boundary. The house is semi-detached and shares symmetry with its paired house and other houses in the immediate vicinity. Notwithstanding this, Rathdown Park is a long linear internal estate road where there are c. 55 houses of varying designs, heights, roof profiles and other features on both sides of the road.

- 8.3.4. In general, it can be problematic from a visual amenity perspective to extend the attic/roof space of a hipped roof. In this regard I appreciate the Planning Authority had concerns in relation to the original proposal. They have however not commented on the revised proposal submitted with the appeal.
- 8.3.5. The revised roof extension is now set back centrally in the roof to the main ridge level. As such I am satisfied the proposal will be visually subordinate to the main roof slope and enables the original front roof profile and part of the side roof profile to remain visible from public areas. It will be finished in zinc/aluminium cladding which in my opinion makes a positive contemporary contribution to the streetscape and the character of the area.
- 8.3.6. The proposed dormer extension when viewed from the rear will be larger than the existing dormer roof window which it proposes to extend and replace. Having regard to the contemporary design of the extension, and the overall size of the site I am satisfied it has the capacity to accommodate the proposed dormer extension without having an adverse negative visual impact on adjoining properties.
- 8.3.7. The proposed development includes a window to the side gable. This window is to a bathroom and will be obscure glazing. As such I have no concerns in relation to adverse impacts on privacy.
- 8.3.8. Overall, and in the context of the varying pattern of residential development on Rathdown Park, I consider the proposed development as revised in the appeal would make a positive, contemporary visual contribution to the character and scale of the existing dwelling, would not be out of character with neighbouring properties and would not appear visually incongruous on the streetscape as a whole.

8.4. **Appropriate Assessment**

- 8.4.1. Having regard to the minor nature and scale of the proposed development and the distance from the nearest European site, no Appropriate Assessment issues arise,

and it is not considered that the development would be likely to have a significant effect, individually, or in combination with other plans or projects, on a European site.

9.0 Recommendation

9.1. I recommend a grant of permission subject to the following condition.

10.0 Reasons and Considerations

10.1.1. Having regard to the minor nature, design and scale of the proposed development, it is considered that the proposal, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, would not seriously injure the visual and residential amenities of properties in the area. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the zoning objective of the Dublin City Council Development Plan and the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

11.0 Conditions

1. The development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application and by the further plans and particulars received by An Bord Pleanála on the 19th day of October 2020, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

2. Water supply and drainage arrangements, including the disposal of surface water, shall comply with the requirements of the Planning Authority for such works and services.

Reason: In the interest of public health.

3. Site development and building works shall be carried out only between the hours of 0800 to 1900 Mondays to Fridays inclusive, between 0800 to 1400 hours on Saturdays and not at all on Sundays and public holidays. Deviation

from these times will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances where prior written approval has been received from the planning authority.

Reason: In order to safeguard the residential amenities of property in the vicinity.

4. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

Reason: It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission.

Adrian Ormsby
Planning Inspector

18th December 2020