



An
Bord
Pleanála

Inspector's Report

ABP-309259-21

Development

Proposed Coumnagappul Wind Farm consisting of up to 11 turbines.

Location

In the townlands of Coumnagappul, Carrigbrack, Knockavanniamountain, Barricreemountain Upper and Glennaneanemountain, Skeehans, Lagg, Co. Waterford.

Prospective Applicant

Coumnagappul Wind Farm Limited.

Planning Authority

Waterford County Council

Type of Application

Pre-Application Consultation under s.37B of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended

Inspector

Sarah Lynch

1.0 Pre-Application Consultation

1.1. The Board received a request on 19th January 2021 from EMPower to enter into pre-application consultation under Section 37B of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, in relation to proposed development of up to 11 turbines, three borrow pits and substation, and all associated development in the townlands of Coumnagappul, Carrigbrack, Knockavanniamountain, Barricreemountain Upper and Glennaneanemountain, Skeehans, Lagg, County Waterford. In the interest of clarity, the Board should note that the applicant's name has changed to Coumnagappul Wind Farm Limited. Confirmation of this name change was received by the Board on the 21st April 2021. The number of turbines has also reduced to 10 and the location of the proposed turbines has altered in response to survey findings.

2.0 Site Location and Description

- 2.1. The site is located within the jurisdiction of Waterford County Council, approximately 13.6km north of Dungarvan and c. 13km south of Clonmel, Co. Tipperary within the townlands of Coumnagappul, Carrigbrack, Knockavanniamountain, Barricreemountain Upper and Glennaneanemountain, Skeehans and Lagg. Access will be off the local road L5113 (Reanadampaun Commons Road). The proposed development will be located within the natural horseshoe valley to the west of the Comeragh Mountains.
- 2.2. There are a number of other existing windfarms in the area at Woodhouse wind farm is c.19km southwest. Beallough Wind Farm and Ballycurreen Wind Farm are >20km.

3.0 Planning History

- **Waterford County Council ref: 211029** – Retention permission granted for an existing lattice type meteorological mast, 80m in height and associated instruments the nature of proposed use of the structure is to measure local climatic conditions.
- A number of residential permissions have been granted to the south of the development.

4.0 Applicant's Case

4.1. The prospective applicant's case can be summarised as follows:

- The proposed development will have a generating capacity of between 60 and 72MW (power ratings are flexible and will be set to comply with noise emission thresholds) and as such falls within the threshold of the 7th Schedule for Strategic Infrastructure Development.
- The development would be of strategic economic or social importance to the state due to significant economic contribution to the region and to the country as a whole. The development has the potential to generate a large quantity of electricity to contribute to Ireland's energy targets and significantly reduce carbon emissions from electricity generation and reduce the Country's reliance on imported fossil fuels.
- The development would contribute substantially to the fulfilment of objectives in the National Planning Framework, specifically Strategic Outcome no. 8 and policy objective no. 55.
- The proposal is in accordance with the Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy for the Southern Regional Assembly by way of its ability to contribute to a low carbon environment and enable the Country to grow and develop in a sustainable manner. A number of policies listed within the RSES support this type of development.
- The development would not have a significant effect on more than one planning authority as it is situated entirely within County Waterford.
- The prospective applicant concludes that the proposed development is within the 7th schedule and satisfies two of the three criterion set out in Section 37A(2) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended.

5.0 Consultations

5.1. Three pre-application meetings were held with the prospective applicant on the 22/04/2021, 25/05/2022 and 18/11/2022. Minutes are attached to the file. A presentation was made to the Board's representatives at all meetings, which are also attached to the file. The principal matters arising related to the need for the proposal,

alternatives considered and the issues pertaining to the development in terms of local planning policy, community engagement, potential environmental impacts and the requirement for up-to-date surveys to adequately inform the NIS and EIAR. Consideration of pinch points along the delivery route along with the consideration of Natura 2000 sites located in excess of 15km from the proposed development site.

- 5.2. The applicant within the second meeting stated that the grid connection would likely form part of the application. A discussion was held in relation to hydrological monitoring of enhancement areas and the assessment of the proposed power output range within the EIAR.

6.0 Legislative Provisions

- 6.1. Section 2(1) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended ('the Act'), defines 'strategic infrastructure' as including, *inter alia*:

'(a) any proposed development in respect of which a notice has been served under section 37B(4)(a)',

- 6.2. Section 37A of the Act states that:

"(1) An application for permission for any development specified in the Seventh Schedule (inserted by the Planning and Development (Strategic Infrastructure) Act 2006) shall, if the following condition is satisfied, be made to the Board under section 37E and not to a planning authority.

(2) That condition is that, following consultations under section 37B, the Board serves on the prospective applicant a notice in writing under that section stating that, in the opinion of the Board, the proposed development would, if carried out, fall within one or more of the following paragraphs, namely—

- (a) the development would be of strategic economic or social importance to the State or the region in which it would be situate,
- (b) the development would contribute substantially to the fulfilment of any of the objectives in the National Planning Framework or in any regional spatial and economic strategy in force in respect of the area or areas in which it would be situate,

(c) the development would have a significant effect on the area of more than one planning authority.”

6.3. The current SID thresholds are set out within the 7th Schedule of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The relevant threshold for the proposed project is *‘An installation for the harnessing of wind power for energy production (a wind farm) with more than 25 turbines or having a total output greater than 50 megawatts’*.

6.4. **Environmental Impact Assessment**

6.5. Schedule 5 of the Planning and Development Regulations, 2001 (as amended) transposes Annex I and II of the EIA Directive and sets out prescribed classes of development, for which an environmental impact assessment is required. The following classes are noted:

Part 2 Class 3 (i)

‘Installations for the harnessing of wind power for energy production (wind farms) with more than 5 turbines or having a total output greater than 5 megawatts’.

6.6. **Appropriate Assessment**

6.7. **Designated Sites in proximity to site**

The nearest Natura 2000 sites are as follows:

- Comeragh Mountains SAC 1.7km
- Lower River Suir SAC – 6.6km
- Blackwater River (Cork/Waterford) SAC – 6.6km
- Nier Valley Woodlands SAC – 5km
- Dungarvan Harbour SPA – 13.9km
- Mid-Waterford Coast SPA – 16.9km

The prospective applicant has stated that an NIS has been prepared for the proposed development and will accompany any future application.

7.0 Planning Policy

7.1. The recast Renewable Energy Directive 2018/2001/EU, as amended

- 7.2. The European Green Deal (EGD) establishes the objective of becoming climate neutral in 2050 in a manner that contributes to the European economy, growth and jobs. This objective requires a greenhouse gas emissions reduction of 55% by 2030 as confirmed by the European Council in December 2020. This in turn requires significantly higher shares of renewable energy sources in an integrated energy system. The current EU target of at least 32% renewable energy by 2030, set in the Renewable Energy Directive (REDII), is not sufficient and needs to be increased to 38-40%, according to the Climate Target Plan (CTP). At the same time, new accompanying measures in different sectors in line with the Energy System Integration, the Hydrogen, the Offshore Renewable Energy and the Biodiversity Strategies are required to achieve this increased target.
- 7.3. The overall objectives of the revision of REDII are to achieve an increase in the use of energy from renewable sources by 2030, to foster better energy system integration and to contribute to climate and environmental objectives including the protection of biodiversity, thereby addressing the intergenerational concerns associated with global warming and biodiversity loss.

8th Environment action programme to 2030

This is an EU Action Programme which aims to guide the EU into a resource efficient, green and competitive low-carbon economy.

7.4. National Policy

Ireland's Transition to a Low Carbon Energy Future, 2015-2030

This White Paper on energy policy (Department of Communications, Energy and Natural Resources – Dec 2015) provides a complete energy policy update for Ireland. It sets out a vision to reduce ghg emissions of between 80% and 95% by 2050, compared to 1990 levels, falling to zero or below by 2100. The policy document recognises that the 2020 target of 40% renewables energy is likely to require a total of 3,500-4,000 MW of onshore renewables generation capacity, compared to the 2,500 MW available at the end of December 2014.

7.5. **Strategy for Renewable Energy, 2012 – 2020**

This Strategy reiterates the Government's position that 'the development and deployment of Ireland's abundant indigenous renewable energy resources, both onshore and offshore, clearly stands on its own merits in terms of the contribution to the economy, to the growth and jobs agenda, to environmental sustainability and to diversity of energy supply'. Strategic Goal 1 of the Strategy is to 'progressively more renewable electricity from onshore and offshore wind power for the domestic and export markets'.

The Strategy states that further strategic deployment of onshore wind projects will develop a base of indigenous and foreign companies and create employment in the short-term in wind farm construction, possible turbine component manufacturing and servicing, the opportunity to capture international supply chain opportunities and the manufacture of niche onshore renewable energy generating equipment.

The Climate Action Plan 2023

7.6. The Climate Action Plan 2023 (CAP23) is the second annual update to Ireland's Climate Action 2019. This plan is the first to be prepared under the Climate Action and Low Carbon Development (Amendment) Act 2021, and following the introduction, in 2022, of economy-wide carbon budgets and sectoral emissions ceilings.

7.7. The plan implements the carbon budgets and sectoral emissions ceilings and sets out a roadmap for taking decisive action to halve our emissions by 2030 and reach net zero no later than 2050, as committed to in the Programme for Government. Climate Action Plan 2023 sets out how Ireland can accelerate the actions that are required to respond to the climate crisis, putting climate solutions at the centre of Ireland's social and economic development.

7.8. **Project Ireland 2040 – National Planning Framework**

The National Planning Framework (NPF) is the Government's high-level strategic plan shaping the future growth and development of Ireland to the year 2040. Chapter 3 of the Framework addresses 'effective regional development' and includes the following policy priorities for the Eastern and Midland region:

- 'Harnessing the potential of the region in renewable energy terms across the technological spectrum from wind and solar to biomass and, where applicable,

wave energy, focusing in particular on the extensive tracts of publicly-owned peat extraction areas, in order to enable a managed transition of the local economies of such areas in gaining the economic benefits of greener energy’.

Under the heading ‘Planning and Investment to Support Rural Job Creation’, the following is stated within the NPF with regards to ‘Energy Production’:

- ‘Rural areas have significantly contributed to the energy needs of the country and will continue to do so, having a strong role to play in securing a sustainable renewable energy supply. In planning Ireland’s future energy landscape and in transitioning to a low-carbon economy, the ability to diversify and adapt to new energy technologies is essential. Innovative and novel renewable solutions have been delivered in rural areas over the last number of years, particularly from solar, wind and biomass energy sources’.
- ‘In relation to peatlands, some of Ireland’s cutaway bogs are suitable to facilitate the generation of energy, most notably wind/biomass’.

National Policy Objective 55 seeks to ‘promote renewable energy generation at appropriate locations within the built and natural environment to meet objectives towards a low carbon economy by 2050’. The pretext to this Objective states that ‘development of the Wind Energy Guidelines and the Renewable Electricity Development Plan will also facilitate informed decision making in relation to onshore renewable energy infrastructure’. National Strategic Outcome 8 relating to the ‘Transition to Sustainable Energy’ states that:

‘New energy systems and transmission grids will be necessary for a more distributed, more renewables focused energy generation system, harnessing both the considerable on-shore and off-shore potential from energy sources such as wind, wave and solar and connecting the richest sources of that energy’.

8.0 Assessment

8.1. Strategic Infrastructure

- 8.2. The proposed development will comprise 10 turbines with a combined generating capacity of between 60 and 72MW and will include an underground 110kV grid

connection from the proposed windfarm site to a substation in Dungarvan. The current SID thresholds are set out within the 7th Schedule of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The relevant threshold for the proposed project is *'An installation for the harnessing of wind power for energy production (a wind farm) with more than 25 turbines or having a total output greater than 50 megawatts'*. Having regard to the combined generating capacity of the proposed development, I am satisfied that the development accords with Section 37A(1) of the Act.

8.3. Accordingly under Section 37A(2), the proposed development must fall within one or more of the following conditions:

(a) the development would be of strategic economic or social importance to the State or the region in which it would be situate,

8.4. The prospective applicant's case is that the proposal satisfies the conditions under 37A(2)(a) of the Act due to the scale of project which would generate more than 50MW.

8.5. The development would be of strategic economic or social importance to the state due to significant economic contribution to the region and to the country as a whole. The development has the potential to have a significant impact in meeting the State's renewable energy targets, it will meet the objectives of The Climate Action Plan 2023 and it will do so in a sustainable way through the provision of 10 no. turbines. It is contended that the proposed development will assist in meeting national renewable energy targets and will also result in significant reductions in carbon emissions from electricity generation and reduce the country's reliance on fossil fuels.

8.6. Having regard to the national and regional policy context and the details of the subject proposal outlined above, I am satisfied that the development would be of strategic economic importance to the State and the Region and would therefore comply with the condition set out in section 37A(2)(a) of the Act.

(b) the development would contribute substantially to the fulfilment of any of the objectives in the National Planning Framework or in any regional spatial and economic strategy in force in respect of the area or areas in which it would be situate,

8.6.1. The prospective applicant states that the proposed development would contribute to the objectives of the NPF and the provisions of the Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy (RSES) for the Southern Regional Assembly. Having reviewed the NPF, I

note the following relevant National Policy Objectives (NPOs) which aim to reduce our carbon footprint and promote renewable energy:

- NPO 54: Reduce our carbon footprint by integrating climate change action into the planning system in support of national targets for climate policy mitigation and adaptation objectives, as well as targets for greenhouse gas emissions reductions;
- NPO 55: Promote renewable energy use and generation at appropriate locations within the built and natural environment to meet national objectives towards achieving a low carbon economy by 2050.

8.7. At Regional level I note that the RSES for the Southern Region recognises the need to shift its reliance on using fossil fuels and natural gas as its main energy source to a more diverse range of low and zero-carbon sources and acknowledges that generating electricity from renewable sources requires onshore wind, bioenergy, solar and offshore energy.

8.8. The Strategy supports an increase in the amount of new renewable energy sources in the Region which includes the use of wind energy.

8.9. Having regard to the above, I am satisfied that the development would meet relevant national policy objectives of the NPF and would serve to fulfil the relevant regional policy objectives of the RSES for the Southern Regional Assembly. The development would therefore satisfy the requirement set out in section 37A(2)(b) of the Act.

(c) the development would have a significant effect on the area of more than one planning authority.”

8.10. The site is fully contained within the area of one planning authority, Waterford County Council. As stated within the prospective applicant’s submission there are no other Planning Authority areas under the definition of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, within proximity to the development site. I am therefore satisfied that the proposed development will not have a significant effect on the area of more than one planning authority.

8.11. Accordingly, I am therefore of the opinion that the proposal would not come within the scope of this requirement to be considered as complying with section 37A(2)(c) of the Act.

8.12. Prescribed Bodies

- 8.13. In view of the scale, nature and location of the proposed development, as described in this report, it is recommended that the prospective applicant should consult with the prescribed bodies listed in the attached Appendix in respect of any future application for approval.

9.0 Conclusion

- 9.1. Based on the foregoing assessment, it can be concluded that the proposed development would exceed the threshold set out in the Seventh Schedule of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended and therefore satisfies Section 37A(1) of the Act. It can also be concluded that the development is of strategic importance by reference to the requirements of Section 37A(2)(a) and Section 37A(2)(b) of the Act. Therefore, in overall conclusion, the proposed development constitutes strategic infrastructure.

9.2. Environmental Impact Assessment

- 9.3. The development falls within the thresholds of Schedule 5 of the Planning and Development Regulations, 2001 for the purpose of EIA, the applicant has indicated that an EIAR will be submitted with the application which is considered to be appropriate.

9.4. Appropriate Assessment

- 9.5. The proposed development is proximate to a number of European Sites including Comeragh Mountains SAC, Lower River Suir SAC, Blackwater River (Cork/Waterford) SAC, Nier Valley Woodlands SAC, Dungarvan Harbour SPA, Mid-Waterford Coast SPA. The applicant has indicated that it is their intention to include an NIS with the application which is considered to be appropriate.

10.0 Recommendation

- 10.1. I recommend that the Board serve a notice on the prospective applicant, pursuant to Section 37(B)(4) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, stating that it is of the opinion that the proposed development constitutes a strategic infrastructure

development within the meaning of Section 37A of the Act for the reasons and considerations set out below.

11.0 Reasons and Considerations

- 11.1. Having regard to the size, scale and location of the proposed windfarm and related development, and to the policy context, it is considered that the proposed development comprising the development of a 10 turbine windfarm, 110kV substation and grid connection with associated infrastructure and an overall output of between 60 and 72 MW in the townlands of Coumnagappul, Carrigbrack, Knockavanniamountain, Barricreemountain Upper and Glennaneanemountain, Skeehans and Lagg Co. Waterford, constitutes development that falls within the definition of energy infrastructure in the Seventh Schedule of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, thereby satisfying the requirements set out in Section 37A(1) of the Act.
- 11.2. The proposed development is also considered to be of strategic importance by reference to the requirements of Section 37A(2)(a) and 37A(2)(b) of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. An application for permission for the proposed development must therefore be made directly to An Bord Pleanála under Section 37E of the Act.



Sarah Lynch
Senior Planning Inspector

21/12/2022

Appendix 1

The following is a list of prescribed bodies considered relevant for the purposes of Section 37E (3) (c) of the Act.

- Minister for Housing, Local Government and Heritage
- Minister for Culture, Heritage and the Gaeltacht (Development Applications Unit)
- Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine
- Minister for Communications, Climate Action and Environment
- Minister for Transport, Tourism and Sport
- Waterford County Council
- Irish Water
- Inland Fisheries Ireland
- Transport Infrastructure Ireland
- Environmental Protection Agency
- The Heritage Council
- An Taisce
- An Chomhairle Ealaíon
- Fáilte Ireland
- Irish Aviation Authority
- Department of Defense
- Office of Public Works

Further notifications should also be made, where deemed appropriate.

Note : The prospective applicant should be advised to submit a standalone document (which may form part of the EIAR) with the planning application, which outlines the mitigation measures, in the interest of convenience and ease of reference.

