



An
Bord
Pleanála

**S. 6(7) of Planning and
Development (Housing) and
Residential Tenancies Act 2016**

**Inspector's Report on
Recommended Opinion
ABP-312005-21**

Strategic Housing Development

Demolition of an existing structures, construction of 1,284 no. residential units (334 no. houses, 950 no. apartments), creche and associated site works.

Location

Barberstown, Barnhill and Passifyoucan, Barnhill, Clonsilla, Dublin 15.

Planning Authority

Fingal County Council

Prospective Applicant

Alanna Homes and Alcove Ireland Four Limited.

Date of Consultation Meeting

23/03/2022

Date of Site Inspection

16/03/2022

Inspector

Conor McGrath

Contents

1.0	Introduction	3
2.0	Site Location and Description	3
3.0	Proposed Strategic Housing Development.....	4
4.0	Relevant Planning History	5
5.0	Section 247 Consultation(s) with Planning Authority	7
6.0	Planning Policy	8
7.0	Submissions Received	15
8.0	Forming the Opinion	16
9.0	Conclusion and Recommendation	25
10.0	Recommended Opinion.....	26

1.0 Introduction

Having regard to the consultation that has taken place in relation to the proposed development and also having regard to the submissions from the planning authority, the purpose of this report is to form a recommended opinion as to whether the documentation submitted with the consultation request under section 5(5) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016 - (i) constitutes a reasonable basis for an application under section 4, or (ii) requires further consideration and amendment in order to constitute a reasonable basis for an application under section 4.

2.0 Site Location and Description

The subject lands comprise a stated area of 29.42 ha located in Barnhill, Clonsilla approx. 3.5km southwest of Blanchardstown town centre. The lands are bounded to the west by the R149 Clonee-Lucan Road and to the south and southeast by Barberstown Lane South. The Dunboyne to Clonsilla Rail Line, and Hansfield train station, bound the lands to the north, there are agricultural lands to the northeast. Barberstown Lane North runs east-west through the northern part of the site, which provides access to a number of one-off houses and a now vacant commercial / agricultural site. These residential properties, along with one residential property fronting the R149, lie outside the red line boundary of the subject site. The northwestern part of the lands is traversed by overhead lines and there are two pylons located within the site. The R149 Clonee-Lucan Road crosses over the railway line immediately northwest of the site and is elevated above the site at this location. Lands to the north of the train line comprise part of Hansfield SDZ, which is currently being built-out. Barberstown Lane North and South converge on the eastern boundary of the site, just west of Pakenham Bridge on the Royal Canal. To the east of the canal is the Barberstown level crossing over the Maynooth / Galway train line.

3.0 Proposed Strategic Housing Development

The proposed development comprises the demolition of the existing vacant commercial / farmyard complex and construction of 1,284 no. residential units, creche, village centre, railway plaza providing access to Hansfield train station, a reserved site for a primary school, a public park of approx. 5.4 ha and a series of pocket parks throughout the development. The development is set out in ten no. character area / neighbourhoods.

Access to the site will be via two roundabouts from Barberstown Lane South which is to be upgraded as part of the proposed (and approved Part 8) Ongar-Barnhill Distributor Road running north-south through the western part of the lands.

Barberstown Lane North will be modified to comprise a primarily cycle/pedestrian access route, with local access to existing residential properties.

Key development parameters include:

Site Area	29.42 ha
Dwelling units	1,284 no. 950 (74%) apartments& duplex 335 (26%) detached, semi-detached and terraced houses
Density	62 / ha net Density in different character areas ranges from 84 units / ha to 28 / ha units
Dual aspect	Not stated
Other uses:	Creche – 900-sq.m. (230 no. spaces) The Hub - 826-sq.m. Retail - 210-sq.m. Bakery - 270-sq.m. Primary school site reserved
Car parking	1,519 no. spaces
Bicycle parking	3,265 no. spaces

	Houses	Apts	Total	
1-bed		176 (14%)	176	14%
2-bed		623 (48.5%)	623	48.5%
3-bed	307 (24%)	151 (12%)	458	35.5%
4-bed	27 (2%)		27	2%
	334 (26%)	950 (74%)	1284	

4.0 Relevant Planning History

PA ref. F07A/0118: Permission granted for a foul sewage pumping station and adjoining underground storage tanks on the southern part of the lands.

Part 8, 2007 – Ongar-Barnhill Access Road. The approved road traverses the western part of the lands crossing the railway line in a north-south direction. The scheme includes the upgrade of Barberstown Road South including two roundabouts which are to provide access into the subject lands.

There is an extensive planning history on the lands to the north of the railway line, which are subject to the Hansfield SDZ.

ABP-306988-20: Section 5 pre-application consultation in respect of 1,155 no. residential units (355 no. houses, 800 no. apartments), creche and associated site works on these lands. The Board determined that the documents required further consideration and amendment to constitute a reasonable basis for an application. It was identified that the following issues needed to be addressed:

1. Further consideration/justification of the documents as they relate to the overall layout of development particularly in relation to the 12 criteria set out in the Urban Design 2009, DMURS, and compliance with the Barnhill Local Area Plan 2019. Specifically, further consideration/justification in relation to:
 - a) Certainty in relation to the design, funding and timing of delivery of the Ongar-Barnhill Road.
 - b) Urban Interface with Ongar-Barnhill Road and how the road relates to the application lands in terms of levels, pedestrian/cyclist access and crossing

points, urban edge from buildings addressing the road, and boundary treatment.

- c) Detailed design of the pedestrian plaza connection to Hansfield Train Station, addressing accessibility from adjoining streets, interface with adjoining buildings, design and material finishes.
- d) Density of the development and impact on delivery of a quality public realm and rationale for height strategy proposed.

Furthermore, it was identified that the following specific information should be submitted with any application for permission:

1. Detailed design of apartment blocks and housing, village centre and urban plaza.
2. A report addressing the layout with regard to the design of streets, positioning of the built form relative to the streets and Ongar-Barnhill Road, design of car parking, design and delivery of public open space, SUDS strategy, and flood risk assessment in accordance with the LAP, Urban Design Manual and DMURS.
3. Detailed drawings, cross-sections, elevations and additional CGIs, including from the canal bridge, the proposed Ongar-Barnhill Road, and north of the train line.
4. Details of the proposed materials and finishes.
5. A detailed schedule of accommodation.
6. A building life cycle report.
7. A map indicating the net development area.
8. Detailed phasing plans.
9. Daylight/sunlight analysis.
10. Microclimate wind study.
11. Noise Impact Assessment.
12. Response to issues raised in the CE Report.
13. Material Contravention Statement, where appropriate.

5.0 Section 247 Consultation(s) with Planning Authority

Application documentation refers to a pre-planning consultation meeting with the planning authority on 05/10/2021. Matters discussed at this meeting are recorded as including the following:

- Phasing and alignment with the Barnhill LAP.
- Detail of school capacity.
- Urban design and provision of active frontage to roads.
- Provision of publicly accessible open space to the northern boundary.
- Privacy and overlooking.
- Dwelling design.
- Daylight and sunlight assessment.
- Retention of hedgerows.
- Dominance of surface car parking.
- Landscaping and design of public open space.
- Surface water drainage design.
- Road access and design.
- Footpath and cycle connections along the R149.
- Car dominant quality of the urban realm.
- Access to future school.
- Connectivity into adjoining zoned lands.
- Cycle parking provision.
- Quality of the connections to the Hansfield railway station.
- Distribution and delivery of childcare facilities.

The planning authority also reference a previous meeting on 27th January 2020, wherein the main items for discussion included:

- The general lack of detail provided for review.
- Dependency on the delivery of infrastructure, particularly roads infrastructure.
- Connectivity to the train station.
- Provision for the school site.
- Phasing of development.

- SUDS strategy.
- Hedgerows.

6.0 Planning Policy

6.1. National and Regional Planning Policy

6.1.1. Project Ireland 2040 - National Planning Framework

National Strategic Outcome 1 is identified as Compact Growth, recognising the need to deliver a greater proportion of residential development within existing built-up areas. Activating these strategic areas and achieving effective density and consolidation, rather than sprawl of urban development, is a top priority.

Objective 3A seeks the delivery of at least 40% of all new housing in existing built-up areas of cities, towns and villages on infill and/or brownfield sites.

Objective 11 favours development within existing cities, towns and villages, subject to appropriate planning standards and achieving targeted growth

Objective 13 provides that, in urban areas, planning and related standards will be based on performance criteria that seek to achieve well-designed high-quality outcomes in order to achieve targeted growth.

Objective 33 prioritises the provision of new homes at locations that can support sustainable development and at an appropriate scale of provision relative to location.

6.1.2. Rebuilding Ireland – Action Plan for Housing and Homelessness (2016)

The overarching aim of the Plan is to increase the delivery of housing across all tenures, to help individuals and families meet their housing needs. The Plan identifies a target to double the number of residential dwellings delivered annually by the construction sector and to provide 47,000 social housing units in the period up to 2021. The plan identifies five pillars for action.

Pillar 2 - Accelerate Social Housing

Pillar 3: Build More Homes, seeks to increase the output of private housing to meet demand at affordable prices. The key action is to double housing output over the Plan period.

6.1.3. **Housing for All - A New Housing Plan for Ireland (Sept 2021)**

The stated aim is to provide access to a home to purchase or rent at an affordable price, built to a high standard and in the right place, offering a high quality of life. The plan identifies the need for construction of an average of 33,000 homes per annum nationally until 2030 to meet the targets outlined in the National Planning Framework. Four overarching objectives are identified:

- Supporting Homeownership and Increasing Affordability.
- Eradicating Homelessness, Increasing Social Housing Delivery and Supporting Social Inclusion.
- Increasing New Housing Supply; and
- Addressing Vacancy and Efficient Use of Existing Stock.

The Pathway to Increasing New Housing Supply includes a focus on the adequate supply of serviced zoned lands to meet housing need, at required densities.

6.1.4. **Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy for the Eastern and Midland Region (2019)**

The Strategy supports the implementation of Project Ireland 2040 and the National Planning Framework (NPF).

RPO 3.2 promotes compact urban growth, targets at least 50% of all new homes to be built, to be within or contiguous to the existing built-up area of Dublin city and suburbs and a target of at least 30% for other urban areas.

RPO 3.3 requires local authorities to provide for increased densities as set out in the 'Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas', 'Sustainable Urban Housing; Design Standards for new Apartments Guidelines' and the 'Urban Development and Building Heights Guidelines for Planning Authorities'.

The site lies within the Dublin Metropolitan Area. The aim of the Dublin MASP is to deliver strategic development areas to ensure a steady supply of serviced development lands to support sustainable growth. Section 5.3 identifies guiding principles for development of the MASP area including:

Compact sustainable growth and accelerated housing delivery – To promote sustainable consolidated growth of the Metropolitan Area, including brownfield and infill development, to achieve a target to 50% of all new homes within or contiguous to the built-up area of Dublin City and suburbs, and at least 30% in other settlements. To support a steady supply of sites and to accelerate housing supply in order to achieve higher densities in urban built up areas, supported by improved services and public transport.

6.2. S.28 Ministerial Guidelines

Having considered the nature of the proposal, the receiving environment, the documentation on file, including the report of the Chief Executive, and observers' submissions, I am of the opinion, that the directly relevant section 28 Ministerial Guidelines are:

- Sustainable Urban Housing: Design Standards for New Apartments, Guidelines for Planning Authorities.
- Urban Development and Building heights, Guidelines for Planning Authorities.
- Guidelines for Planning Authorities on Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas (2009), (including the associated 'Urban Design Manual').
- Circular Letter: NRUP 02/2021 in respect of Residential Densities in Towns and Villages, as set out in Guidelines for Planning Authorities on Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas (2009)
- Regulation of Commercial Institutional Investment in Housing, Guidelines for Planning Authorities (May 2021)
- Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS).
- National Cycle Manual.
- The Planning System and Flood Risk Management Guidelines for Planning Authorities (including the associated 'Technical Appendices').
- Childcare Facilities – Guidelines for Planning Authorities.
- Guidelines for Planning Authorities and An Bord Pleanála on carrying out Environmental Impact Assessment.

6.3. Local Planning Policy

6.3.1. Fingal Development Plan 2017-2023

The subject lands are zoned Objective **RA - Residential Area**: Provide for new residential communities subject to the provision of the necessary social and physical infrastructure

Zoning Objective Vision: Ensure the provision of high quality new residential environments with good layout and design, with adequate public transport and cycle links and within walking distance of community facilities. Provide an appropriate mix of house sizes, types and tenures in order to meet household needs and to promote balanced communities.

- **Objective SS12** Promote the Metropolitan Consolidation Towns of Swords and Blanchardstown as Fingal's primary growth centres for residential development in line with the County's Settlement Hierarchy.
- **Objective Blanchardstown 18** - Prepare and/or implement the following Local Area Plans and Masterplans during the lifetime of this Plan:

.....Barnhill Local Area Plan (see Map Sheet 13, LAP 13.A)

- Construction of houses on these lands will be dependent on delivery of the proposed new road and bridge over the railway;
- Ensure the provision of pedestrian access between Barberstown / Barnhill and the Hansfield SDZ by means of a new pedestrian bridge integrated with adjoining development including the proposed Hansfield rail station;
- Adoption of the Local Area Plan shall be dependent on the rail station at Hansfield being open, accessible and serviced by train.

Objective BLANCHARDSTOWN 18: Prepare and/or implement the following Local Area Plans and Masterplans during the lifetime of this Plan (including Barnhill Local Area Plan).

Objective MT41: Seek to implement the Road Improvement Schemes indicated in Table 7.1 within the Plan period, subject to assessment against the criteria set out in Section 5.8.3 of the NTA Transport Strategy for the GDA.

Table 7.1 includes:

- N3-N4 Link Ongar to Barnhill
- N3–N4 Barnhill to Leixlip Interchange

There is an indicative road proposal traversing the land in a north-south direction linking the Ongar Road with the Lucan-Clonee Road (R149).

Local Objective 125 - Ensure the provision of pedestrian access between Barberstown/Barnhill and the Hansfield SDZ by means of a new pedestrian bridge integrated with adjoining development including the Hansfield rail station.

Protected structures:

- 711 – Pakenham Bridge – Late 18th Century single-arched stone road bridge over the Royal Canal east of the lands.
- 712 – Barnhill Bridge – Mid 19th Century stone road bridge with single arch over former Dublin –Little Pace Railway Line. This is located on the R149 to the north-west of the lands.
- 944a - Royal Canal Late 18th Century man-made canal, including the tow paths, the canal channel with its stone and earth banks, and the canal locks (10th, 11th and 12th Lock).

6.3.2. **Barnhill Local Area Plan 2019**

The Barnhill LAP area comprises 45.64 hectares of residentially zoned land. The Ongar-Barnhill Distributor Road is to serve the area.

A railway plaza/public realm area is required adjoining Hansfield train station to enable pedestrian access to the station from the LAP lands.

The strategy seeks to accommodate higher density development adjoining the railway line and Hansfield train station, medium density across the centre of the lands and a lower density on a western part of the lands.

Lands are reserved for a future primary school, subject to the requirements of the Department of Education.

The following objectives within the LAP are noted:

- **S11** Deliver between circa 950-1150 new dwellings and associated amenity and educational facilities, to meet existing and future housing needs and to create a sustainable and socially inclusive mixed-use community.
- **RN1** Ensure delivery of the appropriate road infrastructure in line with the phasing of the LAP and infrastructure needs.
- **RN2** Apply a Section 48(2)(c) development contribution scheme as may be required, to deliver the infrastructure necessary to secure development.
- **RN4** Ensure routes within the LAP are designed to function as urban streets rather than traffic distributors to accommodate multi-modal movements, create a sense of place and contribute to the public realm and overall permeability.
- **MT2** Ensure the provision of new road infrastructure as required to serve the Plan lands prior to the delivery of any new residential development.
- **GI1** Require all planning applications to be accompanied and informed by a Green Infrastructure Masterplan for the entire LAP lands.
- **POSR9** Consider accepting the plaza/public realm area beside the rail station as Class2 Public Open Space subject to a sufficiently high-quality finish and design.
- **DHM1** Promote a sustainable mix of housing types, sizes and tenures to reflect the diversity of needs in an expanding community set in a high-quality, well-designed environment.
- **DHM2** Support the development of between 900- 1,150 residential units or greater on the lands.
- **BH1** Building height will primarily range between 4-6 storeys (or greater subject to high quality design and visual impact) along the rail line and canal and between 2-3 storeys elsewhere on the LAP lands.
- **BH2** Accept local landmark and feature building elements over the stated building heights at key locations, where they contribute to the visual amenity, civic importance, quality design and legibility of the area. The locations are to be agreed with the Planning Authority and subject to relevant government guidelines.

The LAP identifies four development areas for which individual planning applications should be submitted. The phasing of future development should be clearly indicated as part of the planning application. Should a larger planning application be lodged (SHD) it shall clearly outline proposed phasing within each development area.

Development Area 1: Railway Edge

- A green route shall run along the length of the rail line, east-west, offering designated and safe pedestrian and cycle routes. The main internal avenue within the LAP lands commences at Hansfield Train Station at the small civic space and runs in a curved south-westerly direction to link in with a proposed local centre in Development Area 2. The plan provides for 467 no. units at a density of 84 per ha+/-

DA02 Ensure that the layout, design and delivery of the access route to the train station and the surrounding built form of the civic plaza is an integral part of any initial planning application whether in this Development Area or otherwise.

Development Area 2: Centre –

- The density of development will be generally in the range 35-50 units/hectare, though there may be opportunity for a higher density arrangement. This area is to contain a local neighbourhood centre, school, and a public park alongside lands identified as being within a flood zone. Critical in establishing a sense of community and identity will be an appropriately proportioned civic space forming a 'village square' enclosed by buildings that accommodate ground floor active frontages and defined by a fine urban grain. A new centre will provide a range of uses and will offer a focal point for living, shopping and access to local services and facilities.

Development Area 3: West –

- Proximate to the greenbelt with County Meath. Building height and form and the quality of design are important given their potential prominence at the interface of the urban edge with the rural hinterland. Access will be from the Clonee to Lucan Road (R149). Lands will be isolated by the new Ongar to Barnhill Road, which will bridge over the railway line. Underpass of this road for pedestrians/cyclists will be facilitated. An opportunity exists to locate a higher building here or position

a landmark building as an entrance detail. The density of development will be generally circa 24 units/ hectare with the possible exception of the area to the north.

Development Area 4: Royal Canal –

(This area is located outside the subject lands).

Section 9.0 identifies key principles of phasing, with development extending outwards from the railway station.

Phase 1 includes all the 'RA' zoned land to the north of Barberstown Lane North and east of the new Ongar – Barnhill Road and includes the development of this road. This includes areas adjacent to the existing centrally located residential areas.

Phase 2 includes all remaining land east of the Ongar-Barnhill Road and is the location for the primary school reservation, local centre, café/interpretative centre and the majority of own door housing. The requirement for the school may not coincide with residential development. The school site reservation will remain unless confirmation is received from the DES that it is no longer needed.

Phase 3 relates to all lands to the west of the Ongar-Barnhill Road, primarily consisting of low-density residential housing.

- **P2** All planning applications shall clearly set out a phasing programme as part of the application and this shall include a clear understanding of how each phase is to be completed including infrastructural requirements prior to the commencement of the next phase of development.

Table 3 sets out the enabling infrastructure required for each development area.

- **GP01** Ensure that the Urban Design Guidelines for this LAP which aim to support the vision for Barnhill are adhered to in the roll out of development in the area.

7.0 Submissions Received

Irish Water: A Confirmation of Feasibility has been issued to the applicant.

A new connection to the existing wastewater network is feasible subject to a network extension including a crossing of the railway line to the north, to connect to the existing 375mm Irish Water sewer on the Ongar Road. The applicant must connect via a rising main through third party lands and into third party infrastructure. It is the applicants' responsibility to obtain appropriate permissions for this extension including the rail crossing. A full capacity report and a condition report is required of third-party infrastructure. The location of pump station should be demonstrated to be the most suitable to service the LAP lands.

Upgrades are required to connect to water supply network and the developer will be required to contribute to relevant costs. Surveys will be required to determine the exact location of an existing watermain within the confines of the site. A diversion of an Irish Water asset will be subject to entering into an agreement with Irish Water.

8.0 Forming the Opinion

Pursuant to section 6(7) of the Act of 2016, regard is had in the forming of the opinion to the documentation submitted by the prospective applicant; the planning authority submission and the discussions which took place during the tripartite consultation meeting.

8.1. Documentation Submitted

The prospective applicant has submitted information pursuant to section 5(5)(a) of the Planning & Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016 and Article 285 of the Planning and Development (Strategic Housing Development) Regulations 2017. The documentation submitted with this pre-application consultation request is set out in Appendix 1 to this report. I have considered all of the documentation submitted by the prospective applicant, relating to this case.

In accordance with section 5(5)(b) of the Act of 2016, the documentation includes a statement that, in the prospective applicant's opinion, the proposal is consistent with both the relevant objectives of the development plan or local area plan concerned, and the relevant guidelines issued by the Minister under section 28 of the Act of

2000. The Statement of Consistency under S.5(5) considers the following policy documents:

- Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework (2018);
- Eastern & Midland Regional Assembly: Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy 2019-2031
- Rebuilding Ireland: Action Plan for Housing and Homelessness (2016);
- Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas (Cities, Towns & Villages) (May 2009).
- Urban Design Manual – A Best Practice Guide (UDM) 2009.
- Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS) 2013.
- Urban Development and Building Height Guidelines, 2018;
- Sustainable Urban Housing: Design Standards for New Apartments – Guidelines for Planning Authorities, (December 2020).
- The Planning System and Flood Risk Management, - Guidelines for Planning Authorities, November 2009.
- Childcare Facilities Guidelines, June 2001.
- Fingal Development Plan 2017 – 2023
- Barnhill Local Area Plan, 2019

The statement adopts a tabular form to identify relevant policies and describe how the proposed development is considered to be consistent therewith.

A Material Contravention Statement in accordance with section 5(6) is submitted in relation to the possible material contravention of the County Development Plan and LAP in respect of the following matters:

- The car parking standards of the Fingal County Development Plan 2017.
- The Height Strategy set out in the Barnhill LAP 2019.
- The unit number and density provisions of the Barnhill LAP
- Housing Mix provisions of Barnhill LAP

8.2.Planning Authority Submission

A submission was received from Fingal County Council in accordance with Section 6(4)(b) of the 2016 Act. The submission includes:

- A statement of the planning authority's opinion.
- Details of pre-planning consultation meetings.
- Details of relevant planning history.
- Copies of consultee reports.
- Relevant provisions of the County Development Plan and Barnhill LAP.

The report containing the opinion of the planning authority makes the following points:

- The principle of development is acceptable in terms of planning policy.
- The successful development of these lands is a prerequisite if the objectives of the Barnhill LAP are to be achieved.
- The application site is subject to the 'RA' zoning, and the proposed uses are appropriate to and permitted within this zone.
- The development does not comply with the Barnhill Local Area Plan (LAP) in a number of respects.
 - The phasing strategy includes lands in LAP Development Area 3 in Phase 1, and part of LAP Development Area 2 (including the commercial centre and public open space) in Phase 3
 - This would deliver an excessive amount of housing with no significant open space. The partial development of Development Area 3, to the west of the distributor road is piecemeal in nature and is unacceptable.
 - A Green Infrastructure Masterplan under Objective GI is required.
 - The unit mix does not accord with the LAP requirements.
 - Inadequate Educational Needs Assessment contrary to objective E3.
- Not all relevant issues are addressed in the Material Contravention Statement.
- The design and layout of the proposed development is unacceptable for the following reasons:
 - Insufficient building frontage to roads within the scheme and the Barnhill distributor road.
 - Dominance of surface car parking and poor quality of courtyard parking.
 - Overlooking of private amenity space from balconies and unclear whether adequate separation is provided between opposing windows.

- Single aspect north facing apartments.
- Compliance with development plan standards and the provisions of the Apartment guidelines is unclear.
- Impact on existing residential amenity.
- The design response to the site context is limited.
- Proposed palette of materials warrants review.
- Public open space calculation includes marginal areas and areas of minimal amenity value.
- Areas of private open space backing onto public open space.
- A full daylight and sunlight assessment should be provided.
- Lack of connectivity to adjoining residential zoned land.
- Lack of detail regarding levels across the site. This is particularly required to fully assess the pedestrian/cycle access to Hansfield railway station.
- Clarity is required regarding connectivity to and over the railway, including its design, accessibility and delivery, and Iarnród Éireann approval for works.
- Further detail of the ramped access to the station is required to ensure safety and surveillance.
- The urban form and massing should be reconsidered. The 11-storey element and massing of the building fronting onto Station Plaza, is excessive and an inappropriate design response to the existing context.
- Review the underpass pedestrian link from the village centre to Hansfield Station.
- Separating the 3-storey and 12-storey block would allow the taller block to sit independently as a key feature and provide a stronger visual link to the Station route and the pedestrian route.
- The LAP requires delivery of the Ongar-Barnhill Road prior to or as part of the first planning application on the lands.
- The detailed design for this road is being finalised for the tender and discussions with Irish Rail for a bridge agreement over the railway line have concluded.
- It expected to go to tender in Q2/Q3 of 2022. The expected construction period is approximately 20 to 24 months.
- Delivery of the necessary infrastructure may be enabled, at least in part, through a Section 48 development contribution scheme or special contribution.

- The social infrastructure audit should not consider facilities permitted but not yet constructed. It does not consider the capacity or gaps in the level of provision.
- The level of assessment of childcare facilities is not adequate.
- Detailed landscape proposals are required, illustrating ground levels and a clear delineation between communal, private and public spaces.
- The impact of flooding on the use and availability of open space should be considered. A special contribution may be required in respect of any shortfall in provision.
- The road network would be dominated by car parking. A lower rate of parking for 3 / 4-bed houses would be acceptable in this regard.
- Further consideration of traffic calming, and road alignment is required, with greater permeability in the road layout.
- An extinguishment of public right of way will be required on Barberstown Lane North. All statutory processes should be concluded prior to construction.
- Connectivity to development to the west of the proposed Ongar-Barnhill Road should be considered.
- The Transportation report identifies aspects requiring further detail including:
 - The design of the pedestrian and cyclist connections and facilities.
 - Proposed width of the Primary Road.
 - Seating and cycle parking facilities, particular in the vicinity of the train station.
 - Passive surveillance and public lighting and the transitions to and from the new road networks to mitigate against conflicts.
 - Treatment of Barberstown Lane North including access to existing houses.
 - Design of podium and basement parking areas.
 - A swept path analysis of the most onerous parking spaces.
- The proposal to reduce car parking standards is acceptable but must be supported by a detailed assessment of modal split and car ownership.
- The allocation of parking between uses should be identified and clarified.
- The village centre is dominated by parking. Creche and school parking and set-down areas require further design.
- Clarification on the quantum and design of cycle parking is required.

- The transport modelling assessment, the assumptions and assessment scenarios, appear reasonable. Further discussion is required in relation to the modelling process and additional scenarios to be assessed.
- The Developers will be required to work with bus transport providers and the National Transport Authority to improve bus services in the area.
- Road design should facilitate the roll out of additional services.
- An Archaeological Impact Assessment should be undertaken.
- The pumping station should be delivered in the first phase of development and regard should be had to objectives WW1 to WW5 of the LAP.
- The surface water drainage strategy is largely acceptable.
- A monitoring programme for the effectiveness of SUDS measures should be undertaken, to be agreed with the Council.
- The level of flood risk is acceptable.
- The Arboricultural Impact Statement; Method Statement and associated Tree Protection Plan lack detail. Regard should be had to the works proposed as part of the SUDS strategy.
- Part V proposals should include significantly more houses.
- A noise assessment should consider traffic from Barnhill distributor road and address potential additional noise arising from proposed Dart+ West scheme.
- A complete set of detailed road engineering drawings is required.
- Further taking in charge details are required.
- Details road safety audits are required.
- The proposed cycleway should continue east to the end of the landholding.

Concerns arise in relation to the following:

- The design and layout of the scheme.
- Many studies are not available or do not have sufficient detail.
- The layout, quantum and phasing of public open space.
- Lack of integration with the existing residential properties and with Hansfield Station. Suitable access to the station is critical.
- Compliance with the policies and objectives of the Fingal Development Plan and the Barnhill Local Area Plan 2019 has not been demonstrated.

8.3. The Consultation Meeting

A Section 5 Consultation meeting was held on 23/03/2022, commencing at 10am, via Microsoft Teams. Representatives of the prospective applicant, the planning authority and An Bord Pleanála were in attendance. An agenda was issued by An Bord Pleanála prior to the meeting and the main topics raised for discussion at the tripartite meeting were as follows:

1. Development Principle – including compliance with land use zoning objectives.
2. Phasing of development, including update on the status of the Ongar – Barnhill Distributor Road.
3. Transportation and Access, including road network improvements and access to and across the railway.
4. Community and Local Services, including scope of the local centre and provision of childcare facilities.
5. Design and Layout, including height strategy.
6. Drainage
7. Any Other Matters

Both the prospective applicant and the planning authority were given an opportunity to comment and respond to the issues raised by the representatives of ABP. Those comments and responses are recorded in the ‘Record of Meeting ABP-312005-21’ which is on file. I have fully considered the responses and comments of the prospective applicant and planning authority in preparing the Recommended Opinion hereunder.

In relation to the Development Principle – including compliance with land use zoning objectives, An Bord Pleanála sought clarification and further elaboration of the documents and justification for the proposed development in respect of the following:

- The relevant zoning objectives relating to these lands having regard to the provisions of the Barnhill LAP 2019 and the Fingal County Development Plan 2017-2023.

In relation to the Phasing of development, including update on the status of the Ongar – Barnhill Distributor Road, An Bord Pleanála sought clarification and further elaboration of the documents and justification for the proposed development in respect of the following:

- The status of the approved Ongar – Barnhill Distributor Road including the availability of funding for such development and timescale for delivery.
- Whether the proposed development involves any amendments to the approved design of this road.
- The proposed phasing of development having regard to the provisions of the Barnhill LAP and the need to provide appropriate road, drainage and social infrastructure with residential development.
- The life of any permission likely to be sought by the prospective applicants.

In relation to Transportation and Access, including road network improvements and access to and across the railway, An Bord Pleanála sought clarification and further elaboration of the documents and justification for the proposed development in respect of the following:

- The extent of works proposed to Barberstown Lane South as part of the approved Part 8 Scheme.
- The treatment of this road to the east of the approved road scheme, and the interaction of the proposed development with the existing road.
- The capacity of the existing road network to the east of the site to accommodate additional traffic volumes arising from the proposed development.
- The nature and extent of road upgrade proposals to the east of the site, including works proposed under DART+ West.
- The dependency of the development on the extinguishment of public rights of way, which is a reserved function.
- The design proposals for access to Hansfield Station and across the railway line Hansfield SDZ lands to the north.

- The nature of existing and proposed public transport services in this area and the achievement of the proposed modal split.

In relation to Community and Local Services, including the scope of the local centre and provision of childcare facilities, An Bord Pleanála sought clarification and further elaboration of the documents and justification for the proposed development in respect of the following:

- The extent of retail and community service provision proposed within the development to meet the needs of this new community, having regard to the provisions of the LAP in this regard.
- The approach to the provision of childcare facilities within the development.
- The level of engagement with the Dept. of Education in relation to the provision of a school on the lands.

In relation to Design and Layout, including height strategy, An Bord Pleanála sought clarification and further elaboration of the documents and justification for the proposed development in respect of the following:

- The overall development strategy, including the rationale for the location of taller blocks and the basis for departing from the building height strategy set out in the LAP.
- The relationship between building height and public open spaces within the development.
- The justification for the material contravention of the building height provisions of the LAP under S.37(2)(b).
- Elaboration on the design approach for the Link Road West neighbourhood.

In relation to Drainage, An Bord Pleanála sought clarification and further elaboration of the documents and justification for the proposed development in respect of the following:

- The routing of wastewater drainage connections north under the railway and any necessary consents in respect of such works.

In relation to Any Other Business, the prospective applicant outlined the design approach in respect of public open space and proposed SUDS measures. The planning authority noted that a green infrastructure plan is required, and that further detail regarding the definition of public open space and the protection and retention of trees and hedgerows is required.

9.0 Conclusion and Recommendation

I have examined all of the information and submissions before me including the documentation submitted by the prospective applicant, the submissions of the planning authority and the discussions which took place at the tripartite meeting. I have had regard to both national policy, including s.28 Ministerial Guidelines, and local policy, via the statutory plans for the area.

Based on the entirety of the information before me, it would appear that the proposed development falls within the definition of Strategic Housing Development, as set out in section 3 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016.

Having regard to all of the above, I recommend that further consideration and/or possible amendment of the documents submitted are required at application stage in respect of the following elements, details of which are set out in the Recommended Opinion below.

1. The dependency of the development on the delivery of the proposed Ongar-Barnhill Road.
2. The creation of a strong urban edge and streetscape to the Ongar-Barnhill Road and to Barberstown Lane South, and on key routes within the development.
3. The nature and scale of provision for retail and community services proposed for this new community.

4. The development strategy in respect of the height and scale of buildings within the proposed development.
5. Connectivity to the train station and across the railway to lands at Hansfield to the north.

Having regard to the above, I recommend that the Board serve a notice on the prospective applicant, pursuant to Section 6(7)(b) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, stating that it is of the opinion that the documentation submitted with the consultation request under section 5(5) of the Act **requires further consideration and amendment** in order to constitute a reasonable basis for an application under section 4 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016.

I also recommend that the prospective applicant be notified, pursuant to article 285(5)(b) of the 2017 Regulations, that specified information (as outlined hereunder) be submitted with any application for permission that may follow. I believe the specified information will assist the Board at application stage in its decision-making process. I am recommending that a number of prescribed bodies (as listed hereunder) be notified by the prospective applicant of the making of the application.

10.0 Recommended Opinion

An Bord Pleanála refers to your request pursuant to section 5 of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016. Section 6(7)(a) of the Act provides that the Board shall form an opinion as to whether the documents submitted with the consultation request (i) constitute a reasonable basis for an application under section 4 of the Act, or (ii) require further consideration and amendment in order to constitute a reasonable basis for an application under section 4.

Following consideration of the issues raised during the consultation process, and having regard to the opinion of the planning authority, An Bord Pleanála is of the opinion that the documentation submitted **requires further consideration and**

amendment to constitute a reasonable basis for an application for strategic housing development to An Bord Pleanála.

In the opinion of An Bord Pleanála, the following issues need to be addressed in the documents submitted to which section 5(5) of the Act of 2016 relates that could result in them constituting a reasonable basis for an application for strategic housing development:

1. Further consideration of the documents and justification for the proposed development having regard to the dependency of the development on the delivery of the proposed Ongar-Barnhill Road. The application should identify the timetable for completion of such infrastructure and responsibility for the funding and completion of works in this regard. The provision of such infrastructure should be clearly identified as part of the phasing strategy for the development of these lands.
2. Further consideration and elaboration of the documents with regard to the creation of a strong urban edge and streetscape to the Ongar-Barnhill Road and to Barberstown Lane South, and on key routes within the development. Application documentation should demonstrate how proposed building design and streetscape assist in place making and wayfinding as well as creating a contemporary urban development with a variety of character areas marked by changes in densities, housing typologies, and heights as well as changes to material finishes and designs. Regard should be had to the provisions of DMURS (section 2.2.1) with regard to the creation of a sense of place.
3. Further consideration and elaboration of the documents as they relate to the development strategy for the lands and the height and scale of development proposed.

In this regard a detailed design statement / rationale for each neighbourhood or character area should be submitted having regard to the provisions of the Barnhill LAP 2019, as well as the criteria set out in Section 3.2 of the Urban Development and Building Height, Guidelines for Planning Authorities' 2018. Such rationale should, in particular, address the design of taller buildings and the differing character of individual neighbourhoods, particularly those at a remove from key

public transport and local service nodes, and the transition between taller buildings and their surroundings. The application should demonstrate how a high quality of architectural design and finish to such taller blocks is achieved within the development.

The strategy should consider key views into the development including those from the east at Pakenham Bridge, as well as key internal vistas, such as views east and west along the proposed village centre / main street.

4. Further clarification and elaboration of the documents, and justification for the proposed development, having regard to the mix of uses and level of local and community service provision proposed on the lands.

The Barnhill LAP 2019, envisages the development of a sustainable community at Barnhill comprising new homes, community, leisure and educational facilities based around an identifiable and accessible local centre. The LAP notes that a vibrant local centre is to provide for a range of services to cater for the shopping, recreational, educational, medical and other needs of the community. It further notes that the centre should be large enough to accommodate a foodstore and a range of supporting shops and retail services.

Having regard to the significant scale of development envisaged for these lands, and the limited extent of retail and community service provision proposed, clarification / justification is required as to how the development will meet the needs of this new community and address the reasonable objectives the Local Area Plan in this regard. The application should set out a clear vision for the creation of a serviced, sustainable community and neighbourhood in this regard.

5. Further clarification and elaboration of the documents as they relate to the proposed pedestrian connection to Hansfield train station. In this regard, specific and detailed design proposals should clearly demonstrate how the development will deliver a high-quality public realm and accessibility for the public both to the station and across the railway to lands in Hansfield to the north. Evidence of the consent of the railway authorities to proposals in this regard should accompany the application.

The issues raised above may require amendment to the documents and/or design proposals submitted.

Pursuant to article 285(5)(b) of the Planning and Development (Strategic Housing Development) Regulations 2017, the prospective applicant is hereby notified that, in addition to the requirements as specified in articles 297 and 298 of the Planning and Development (Strategic Housing Development) Regulations 2017, the following specific information should be submitted with any application for permission:

1. Detailed proposals for the phased development of these lands. Such phasing proposals should clearly identify the road and public transport, open space, water, drainage, and social infrastructure to be delivered with each phase of residential development.
2. The application should clearly identify the life of any permission sought and provide a clear rationale and justification for such period.
3. A detailed landscape and visual impact assessment.
4. The design statement in respect of the Link Road West neighbourhood should demonstrate that a high quality of residential amenity for proposed dwelling units can be delivered having regard to their position between two elevated roads and the adjoining railway to the north.
5. Detailed plan and section drawings should clearly identify existing and proposed ground levels across the site including existing and proposed road embankments.
6. The relationship between proposed buildings, and between the proposed development and existing adjoining properties should be clearly described in appropriately detailed section drawings. The potential for impacts on adjoining residential amenity by reason of overlooking and overshadowing should be clearly assessed and described.
7. A report that specifically addresses the proposed materials and finishes across the entire scheme including specific detail of finishes, landscaping and paving, pathways, entrances and boundary treatments. Particular regard should be had to the requirement to provide high quality, durable and sustainable finishes which have regard to the context of the site. A rationale for the extensive use of cement

render finishes to buildings across parts of the development should be clearly set-out.

8. Details of the proposed boundary treatment to the adjoining railway, including details of any noise attenuation measures to be incorporated therein. Regard should be had to the requirements of Irish Rail in this regard.
9. A comprehensive daylight and sunlight assessment examining the proposed dwelling units and amenity / open spaces, as well as potential impacts on daylight and sunlight to adjoining properties. In preparing such assessment regard should be had to the provisions of section 3.2 of the Urban Development and Building Heights Guidelines for Planning Authorities (2018) and to the approach outlined in guides like the BRE 'Site Layout Planning for Daylight and Sunlight' (2nd edition) or BS 8206-2: 2008 – 'Lighting for Buildings – Part 2: Code of Practice for Daylighting'.

The assessment should provide a comprehensive view of the performance of the development in respect of daylight provision. Where any alternative, compensatory design solutions in respect of daylight are proposed, these should be clearly identified and justified, and their effect appropriately described and / or quantified.

10. An analysis of wind microclimate and pedestrian comfort at ground level with reference to pedestrian occupation and usability of new public spaces. The analysis should address the safety and comfort of residential amenity spaces, including communal spaces and private upper floor balconies. Any required mitigation or other design measures arising from such assessment should be clearly described and assessed in the study. This may necessitate a review of the design of proposed balconies, and whether projecting or integrated balconies are more appropriate in terms of achieving satisfactory levels of residential amenity.
11. A detailed Housing Quality Assessment demonstrating compliance with relevant development standards.
12. Consideration should be given to a more direct connection from the western end of the proposed greenway (Barberstown Lane North) to the pedestrian and cycle infrastructure to be provided on the new Ongar-Barnhill Road.

13. Detailed proposals for the provision of childcare facilities sufficient to meet the projected demand arising from this extensive development. Such proposals should include detail with regard to access and cycle and car parking arrangements. Where a single facility is proposed to serve the overall development, the application should undertake a review of the viability and practicality of such scale of facility. The provision of childcare facilities should also be addressed as part of the phasing details under item no. 1 above.
14. In respect of transportation, the application should be accompanied by the following:
- i. A report addressing the matters raised in the report of the Fingal County Council Transportation Planning Section.
 - ii. A detailed Traffic and Transportation Impact assessment. The assessment should clearly describe the scenarios assessed and the traffic distribution considered therein. All assumptions should be clearly stated. The assessment should have regard to existing constraints on the road network to the east of the site, including the capacity of Pakenham Bridge and Barberstown level crossing, and any phased improvements to the road network in the area.
 - iii. A Quality Audit in accordance with Advice Note 4 of DMURS, including a road safety audit.
 - iv. A Travel Plan / Mobility Management Plan, which should clearly identify targets for modal split and consider the availability of bus and rail services, and any required improvements to such services, to achieve these targets. The application should describe any engagement which has taken place with the NTA / bus providers in relation to this development.
 - v. A detailed description of car and cycle parking provision across the development, including the allocation of spaces. The quantum and design of cycle parking should accord with the provisions of the Apartment Design Guidelines and with the provisions of the National Cycle Manual and DMURS. This should include a level of commuter cycle parking adjoining Hansfield train station.

15. Clarification with regard to proposed pedestrian and cycle routes on the western side of the proposed Barnhill-Ongar Road at Parkside, as indicated in the submitted Design Statement.
16. A detailed noise impact assessment, having particular regard to the impact of the operation of the adjoining railway on residential amenities. Regard should be had to the frequency and timing of train movements and likely future increases in such frequency. Detail of the design and location of any recommended mitigation measures in this regard should be clearly described in application documentation.
17. A report addressing the matters raised in the report of the Fingal County Council Water Services Department dated 06/12/2021. The report should also include evidence of consent / of the right to access the existing service culvert under the adjoining railway.
18. A report addressing the matters raised in the report of the Fingal County Council Parks and Green Infrastructure Division dated 20/12/2021.
19. A Detailed Construction Management Plan and Construction Traffic Management Plan. Such plans should have regard to the phasing of development described under item no. 1 above, including the means of access to each phase of development.
20. The application should address the dependency of the development upon the extinguishment of any public right of way on Barberstown Lane North, which is the subject of a separate approval process. This may require possible amendment to the documents and / or design proposals submitted.

Pursuant to article 285(5)(a) of the Planning and Development (Strategic Housing Development) Regulations 2017, the prospective applicant is informed that the following authorities should be notified in the event of the making of an application arising from this notification in accordance with section 8(1)(b) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016:

1. Irish Water
2. Transport Infrastructure Ireland

3. National Transport Authority
4. Irish Rail
5. Commission for Railway Regulation
6. Waterways Ireland
7. Minister of Housing, Local Government and Heritage
8. Heritage Council
9. An Taisce
10. Department of Education and Skills
11. Coras Iompair Eireann
12. Fingal Childcare Committee
13. Meath County Council
14. Kildare County Council

PLEASE NOTE:

Under section 6(9) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, neither the holding of a consultation under section 6, nor the forming of an opinion under that section, shall prejudice the performance by the Board, or the planning authority or authorities in whose area the proposed strategic housing development would be situated, of any other of their respective functions under the Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2016 or any other enactment and cannot be relied upon in the formal planning process or in legal proceedings.

Conor McGrath
Senior Planning Inspector

30/03/2022

Appendix 1 Documentation accompanying the S.5 request.

- Cover Letter, including:
 - a. Appendix 1: Minutes of Section 247 Meeting with Fingal County Council
 - b. Appendix 2: Schedule of Accommodation and Areas
 - c. Appendix 3: Letter of Feasibility – Irish Water
- Completed Section 5 Pre-Application Consultation Request Form
- Letters of Consent:
- Response to ABP Opinion on Previous SHD Proposal
- Statement of Consistency
- Material Contravention Statement.
- Section 5.5iii Environmental Impacts Report
- Natura Impact Statement
- Planning & Architectural Design Statement.
- Site Location Map
- Architectural Drawings prepared by:
 - Delphi Architects, incl
 - Village Centre
 - Station Plaza
 - Railway Quarter
 - Link Road East
 - Link Road West
 - C+W O'Brien Architects, incl.
 - Barnhill Stream
 - Barnhill Cross
 - Barnhill Crescent
 - Station Quarter South
 - CDP Architecture, incl
 - Parkside
- Preliminary Part V Proposal

- Landscape Concept Report.
- Arboricultural Impact Assessment Report, incl. Tree Protection Plan
- Flood Study
- SUDS Strategy Report and drawings.
- Engineering Report: Barnhill Pumping Station – Sizing and Design Methodology,
- Preliminary Engineering Report, Barnhill LAP Development
- Engineering Drawings
- Drawings of Proposed Ongar - Barnhill Road Scheme
- Public Lighting Drawings & Reports
- ESB Infrastructure Layout
- Construction and Environmental Management Plan
- Traffic and Transport Assessment Methodology
- Microclimate Assessment Methodology
- Daylight & Sunlight Methodology Report
- Approach to Noise Assessment
- Preliminary Childcare Assessment
- Preliminary School Report
- Social Infrastructure Audit.