

# Inspector's Report ABP-318156-23

**Development** Retention of a slatted loose shed with

an underground effluent tank and

permission to construct a slatted loose shed with an underground effluent tank, roofed manure stead area and

all associated site works.

**Location** Gortshane, Newport, Co. Tipperary

Planning Authority Tipperary County Council

Planning Authority Reg. Ref. 2360580

Applicant(s) Kieran Ryan.

Type of Application Permission.

Planning Authority Decision Grant

Type of Appeal Third Party

Appellant(s) Peter Sweetman on behalf of Wild

Ireland Defence.

Observer(s) None.

**Date of Site Inspection** 11<sup>th</sup> October 2024

**Inspector** Peter Nelson

# **Contents**

1.0 Sit	e Location and Description	3
2.0 Pro	pposed Development	3
3.0 Pla	anning Authority Decision	3
3.1.	Decision	3
3.2.	Planning Authority Reports	3
3.3.	Prescribed Bodies	4
3.4.	Third Party Observations	4
4.0 Pla	anning History	4
5.0 Po	licy Context	5
5.1.	Development Plan	5
5.2.	Natural Heritage Designations	6
5.3.	EIA Screening	6
6.0 Th	e Appeal	7
6.1.	Grounds of Appeal	7
6.2.	Applicant Response	7
6.3.	Planning Authority Response	7
6.4.	Observations	7
7.0 As	sessment	7
8.0 A.A	A. Screening	8
9.0 Re	commendation1	6
10.0	Reasons and Consideration1	6
11.0	Conditions1	6
Annend	dix 1 – Form 1: FIA Pre-Screening	

# 1.0 Site Location and Description

- 1.1. The site is located in Gortshane, approximately 3.5km north of Newport Town and c.1.6km southeast of the M7 motorway. The site comprises of an existing established agricultural farm complex. Access to the site is via a local road. Agricultural lands bound the site to the east, west and south of the site. An existing dwelling is directly north of the site, and agricultural lands are beyond. There is a watercourse to the east of the site.
- 1.2. The farmyard complex consists of three loose sheds and a silage slab. An existing slatted shed on site is the subject of the rention element of this application.

# 2.0 **Proposed Development**

- 2.1. Permission is sought to retain a slatted loose shed with an underground effluent tank. This shed has a stated floor area of 276m² and a height of 6.65m.
- 2.2. Permission is also sought to construct a slatted loose shed with an underground effluent tank. The proposed shed has a stated floor area of 590m<sup>2</sup> and a height of 9.115m.
- 2.3. A roofed manure stead area is also proposed. The sheds are to the south of the existing dwelling house and are in a farmyard complex.

# 3.0 Planning Authority Decision

#### 3.1. **Decision**

Tipperary County Council granted permission on the 21<sup>st</sup> September 2023 subject to 5no. standard conditions.

#### 3.2. Planning Authority Reports

#### 3.2.1. Planning Reports

The main points of the planner's report signed on the 15<sup>th</sup> December 2023 can be summarised as follows:

The proposed development is acceptable in principle under the area's

designation as an Area Under Urban Influence.

• The proposals do not negatively impact the surrounding landscape.

An EIA is not required.

• The proposed development has been screened for AA, and it has been

determined that an AA is not required.

• The proposed development has been assessed in relation to the Water

Framework Directive, and no potential impacts on water status have been

envisaged due to the proposed development.

3.2.2. Other Technical Reports

None

3.3. **Prescribed Bodies** 

None

3.4. **Third Party Observations** 

One observation was received from Peter Sweetman. The issues raised can be

summarised as follows:

• The development is eligible for extension as the parent application was not

subject to an Appropriate Assessment.

Note case law Kelly v ABP and People Over Wind & Peter Sweetman v Coillte

Teroanta.

• The development must be assessed for complaince with the requirements of

the Water Framework Directive.

• The development is within 2km of the Lower River Shannon SAC, so an

Appropriate Assessment is required.

4.0 **Planning History** 

P.A. Ref: 06510648

Permission was granted on the 12<sup>th</sup> July 2006 for a new farm building consisting of a cattle shed, underground slatted slurry storage tanks and ancillary works.

# 5.0 Policy Context

## 5.1. **Development Plan**

The Tipperary County Development Plan, 2022-2028, is the operational plan for the area. This plan came into effect on the 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2022.

## **Strategic Objectives**

**SO-6** To support a sustainable, diverse and resilient rural economy, whilst integrating the sustainable management of land and natural resources.

#### **Policies**

- **8-4** Facilitate the development of alternative farm enterprises, whilst balancing the need for a proposed rural-based activity with the need to protect, promote and enhance the viability and environmental quality of the existing rural economy and agricultural land.
- **10-3** Support and facilitate the development of a sustainable and economically efficient agricultural and food sector and bioeconomy, balanced with the importance of maintaining and protecting the natural services of the environment, including landscape, water quality and biodiversity.
- **11-1** In assessing proposals for new development to balance the need for new development with the protection and enhancement of the natural environment and human health. In line with the provisions of Article 6(3) and Article 6 (4) of the Habitats Directive, no plans, programmes, etc. or projects giving rise to significant cumulative, direct, indirect or secondary impacts on European sites arising from their size or scale, land take, proximity, resource requirements, emissions (disposal to land, water or air), transportation requirements, duration of construction, operation, decommissioning or from any other effects shall be permitted on the basis of this Plan (either individually or in combination with other plans, programmes, etc. or projects59).

#### **National Policy**

- Climate Action Plan 2023 (as updated)
- Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework (2018) and National Development Plan 2021-2030
- Department of Rural and Community Development's Our Rural Future: Rural Development Policy 2021-2025
- Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine's Food Vision 2030
- Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine's Ag Climatise A Roadmap towards Climate Neutrality
- Nitrates Action Programme (NAP) 2022-2025

#### **Regional Policy**

Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy for the Southern Region

#### **Other Guidance**

 European Commission's 'Farming for Natura 2000, Guidance on how to support Natura 2000 farming systems to achieve conservation objectives, based on Member States good practice experiences (2018)

#### 5.2. Natural Heritage Designations

The subject site is not located within any designated site. The nearest designated sites are the Slievefelim to Silvermines Mountains Special Protection Area (Site Code 004165), which is c.2km southeast of the site and the Lower River Shannon Special Area of Conservation (Site Code 002165) which is c.3.7km northwest of the site.

# 5.3. **EIA Screening**

The proposed development is not a class for the purposes of EIA as per the classes of development set out in Schedule 5 of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001, as amended. No mandatory requirement for EIA therefore arises and there is

also no requirement for a preliminary examination or screening assessment. Refer to Appendix 1.

# 6.0 The Appeal

## 6.1. Grounds of Appeal

A third party appeal was lodged to the Board on 4<sup>th</sup> October 2023, opposing the Planning Authority's (PA) decision. The grounds of appeal can be summarised as follows:

- The planning authority has failed to assess the development in accordance with the law.
- In screening the development for AA the planner determined that there may
  be an effect on the conservation objectives of a European Site and that the
  planner is relying on best practice.
- The development application contains retention; had the planner wished to assess the development, he would have questioned the retention measures which he is relying on.

# 6.2. Applicant Response

None

#### 6.3. Planning Authority Response

None

#### 6.4. Observations

None

#### 7.0 Assessment

7.1. Having regard to the established nature of the existing farmyard, the scale and height of the proposed and retained developments and their location within the

curtilage of the existing farmyard, I am satisfied that the development will not result in an adverse impact on the visual or scenic amenity of the area. Therefore, I consider the development to be in accordance with the Strategic Objective SO-6 and Policy 8-4, 10-3 of the Tipperary County Development Plan 2022-2028. Therefore, I am satisfied with the principle of development.

7.2. Having examined the application details and all other documentation on file, after an inspection of the site, and having regard to relevant local, regional and national policies and guidance, I consider that the main issue on this appeal relates to potential impacts on European Sites.

# 8.0 A.A. Screening

- 8.1. Compliance with Article 6(3) of the Habitats Directive.
- 8.1.1. The requirements of Article 6(3) as related to screening the need for appropriate assessment of a project under part XAB, section 177U of the Planning and Development Act 2000 (as amended) are considered fully in this section.

#### 8.2. <u>Background on the Application</u>

- 8.2.1. I note that the PA undertook a detailed screening for AA and concluded that given due consideration to the location, nature and size of the proposed development, either alone or in combination with other plans and projects, the development does not have the potential for significant effects on the qualifying interest of the Lower River SAC and therefore an appropriate assessment is not required.
- 8.2.2. The Appellant notes that the Planning Authority Screening report states that the landspread of slurry onto lands owned/rented has the potential to impact water quality. The Appellant believes that as there is potential for impact and reliance on best practice, this would require an Appropriate Assessment.
- 8.2.3. The Appellant also states that as the application contains an element for retention, if the planner had wished to assess the development, he would have questioned the retention measures on which he relied.
- 8.2.4. I note that in the Planning Authorities screening, no mitigation measures were necessary to conclude that likely significant effects can be ruled out.

- 8.2.5. The site is not located within any European Site. The subject site is c.2km northwest of the Slievefelim to Silvermines Mountains Special Protection Area (Site Code 004165) and 3.7km southeast of the Lower River Shannon Special Area of Conservation (Site Code 002165).
- 8.2.6. Permission is sought to retain a slatted loose shed with an underground effluent tank. This shed has a stated floor area of 276m² and a height of 6.65m.
- 8.2.7. Permission is also sought to construct a slatted loose shed with an underground effluent tank. The proposed shed has a stated floor area of 590m² and a height of 9.115m. A roofed manure stead area is also proposed. The sheds are to the south of the existing dwelling house and are in a farmyard complex.
- 8.2.8. Taking account of the characteristics of the proposed development in terms of its location and the scale of works, the following issues are considered for examination in terms of implications for likely significant effects on the qualifying interests (QI) of the European sites:
  - Construction-related habitat and species disturbance and fragmentation as a result of construction-related surface water pollution. (Effect A)
  - Operational-related habitat and species disturbance and fragmentation as a result of surface water pollution. (Effect B)
- 8.2.9. Where an ecological pathway exists, these indirect impacts could negatively alter the quality of the existing environment, negatively affecting qualifying interest species and habitats dependent on high water quality that require maintenance of natural vegetation composition.

#### 8.3. <u>European Sites</u>

A summary of European Sites at risk from impacts of the proposed project is presented in Table 1 below.

Table 1: European Sites at Risk from Impacts of the proposed project.

Effect Mechanism	Impact Pathway/Zone	European Site	Qualifying Interest features at risk.
	of Influence		
Deterioration of	Drainage	Lower River	All freshwater species
water quality due	channel	Shannon Special	dependent on high
to surface water		Area of	water quality:
pollution during		Conservation	Sea Lamprey
construction		(Site Code 002165)	Petromyzon marinus
Deterioration of		002100)	1096 Brook
water quality due to surface water			Lamprey Lampetra
pollution during			planeri
operation			1099 River
			Lamprey Lampetra
			fluviatile
			1106 Atlantic Salmon
			Salmo salar

## 8.4. The Lower River Shannon SAC (Site Code 002165)

8.4.1. This extensive site stretches along the Shannon Valley from Killaloe in Co. Clare to Loop Head/ Kerry Head, a distance of some 120 km. The site thus encompasses the Shannon, Feale, Mulkear and Fergus estuaries, the freshwater lower reaches of the River Shannon (between Killaloe and Limerick), the freshwater stretches of much of the Feale and Mulkear catchments and the marine area between Loop Head and Kerry Head. Rivers within the sub-catchment of the Feale include the Galey, Smearlagh, Oolagh, Allaughaun, Owveg, Clydagh, Caher, Breanagh and Glenacarney. Rivers within the sub-catchment of the Mulkear include the

- Killeenagarriff, Annagh, Newport, the Dead River, the Bilboa, Glashacloonaraveela, Gortnageragh and Cahernahallia. The watercourse adjacent to the site feeds into the Mulkear River.
- 8.4.2. Freshwater rivers have been included in the site, most notably the Feale and Mulkear catchments, the Shannon from Killaloe to Limerick (along with some of its tributaries, including a short stretch of the Kilmastulla River), the Fergus up as far as Ennis, and the Cloon River. These systems are very different in character: the Shannon is broad, generally slow flowing and naturally eutrophic; the Fergus is smaller and alkaline, while the narrow, fast-flowing Cloon is acid in nature. The Feale and Mulkear catchments exhibit all the aspects of a river from source to mouth. Semi-natural habitats, such as wet grassland, wet woodland and marsh, occur by the rivers, but improved grassland is the most common habitat type.
- 8.4.3. The Qualifying Interests for The Lower River Shannon SAC are as follows:
  - Sandbanks which are slightly covered by sea water all the time [1110]
  - Estuaries [1130]
  - Mudflats and sandflats not covered by seawater at low tide [1140]
  - Coastal lagoons [1150]
  - Large shallow inlets and bays [1160]
  - Reefs [1170]
  - Perennial vegetation of stony banks [1220]
  - Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and Baltic coasts [1230]
  - Salicornia and other annuals colonising mud and sand [1310]
  - Atlantic salt meadows (Glauco-Puccinellietalia maritimae) [1330]
  - Mediterranean salt meadows (Juncetalia maritimi) [1410]
  - Water courses of plain to montane levels with the Ranunculion fluitantis and Callitricho-Batrachion vegetation [3260]
  - Molinia meadows on calcareous, peaty or clayey-silt-laden soils (Molinion caeruleae) [6410]
  - Alluvial forests with Alnus glutinosa and Fraxinus excelsior (Alno-Padion, Alnion incanae, Salicion albae) [91E0]
  - Margaritifera margaritifera (Freshwater Pearl Mussel) [1029]

- Petromyzon marinus (Sea Lamprey) [1095]
- Lampetra planeri (Brook Lamprey) [1096]
- Lampetra fluviatilis (River Lamprey) [1099]
- Salmo salar (Salmon) [1106]
- Tursiops truncatus (Common Bottlenose Dolphin) [1349]
- Lutra lutra (Otter) [1355]

Having regard to the SAC Conservation Objectives and the National Parks and Wildlife Service related publications, to the location of the site relative to the SAC and the location of its Qualifying Interest and to the nature of the likely significant effects arising from the development, I consider, aside from the Sea Lamprey, Brook Lamprey, River Lamprey and Atlantic Salmon the remaining QIs can be screened out at this stage.

- 8.5. <u>Slievefelim to Silvermines Mountains Special Protection Area (Site Code 004165)</u>
- 8.6.
- 8.6.1. The Slievefelim to Silvermines Mountains SPA is an extensive upland site located in Counties Tipperary and Limerick. Much of the site is over 200 m in altitude and rises to 694 m at Keeper Hill. Other peaks included in the site are Slieve Felim, Knockstanna, Knockappul, Mother Mountain, Knockteige, Cooneen Hill and Silvermine Mountain. The site is underlain mainly by sandstones of Silurian age. Several important rivers rise within the site, including the Mulkear, Bilboa and Clare. The site consists of a variety of upland habitats, though approximately half is afforested.
- 8.6.2. The site is a Special Protection Area (SPA) under the E.U. Birds Directive of special conservation interest for Hen Harrier.
- 8.6.3. Given the distance from the subject site to the SPA and the agricultural nature surrounding the site, it is considered that the Hen Harrier is not at risk from the development to be retained and the proposed development.

# 8.7. <u>Identification of likely significant effects</u>

Table 2: Could the project undermine the conservation objectives 'alone'

European Site and qualifying feature	Conservation objective	Could the conservation objectives be undermined (Y/N)?	
		Effect A	Effect B
Lower River	https://www.npws.ie/protected-		
Shannon SAC	sites/sac/002165		
(Site Code 002165)			
1095 Sea Lamprey Petromyzon marinus	To restore the favourable conservation condition of Sea	N	N
1 etromyzon mannus	Lamprey.		
	Distribution:		
	Greater than 75% of main stem		
	length of rivers accessible from		
	estuary		
1096 Brook Lamprey	To restore the favourable	N	N
Lampetra planeri	conservation condition of Brook		
	Lamprey.		
	Distribution:		
	Access to all water courses down		
	to first-order streams		
1099 River Lamprey	To maintain the favourable	N	N
Lampetra fluviatile	conservation condition of River		
	Lamprey.		
	Distribution:		
	Access to all water courses down		
	to first-order streams		

To restore the favourable	N	N
conservation condition of Salmon		
Distribution:		
100% of river channels down to		
second order accessible from		
estuary		
	conservation condition of Salmon Distribution: 100% of river channels down to second order accessible from	conservation condition of Salmon  Distribution:  100% of river channels down to second order accessible from

- 8.10.1. A watercourse is located along the site's boundary which connects downstream to the River Mulkear. I note that the proposed development seeks to dispose of roof water via a gutter system to stone soakaways. All soiled water within the yard is to be disposed of via the underground slurry tanks. The construction phase will result in short-term construction-related emissions typical of an agricultural development. Having regard to the above, I am satisfied that the development would not likely result in a direct or indirect effect on the conservation objectives of the European Site in terms of species or habitat fragmentation or disturbance. Furthermore, I am satisfied that the development would not likely result in any ex-situ effects on any species, considering the established use of the site and the distance to European Sites.
- 8.10.2. I conclude that the proposed development would have no likely significant effect 'alone' on any qualifying features of the Lower River Shannon SAC (Site Code 002165).

#### 8.11. <u>In combination with other Plans or Projects</u>

- 8.11.1. I note that the Appellant makes reference to the Planning Authorities AA Screening Report and claims that the planner determined that there may be an effect due to the landspreading of slurry. I note that the planning authority considered that the impact on water quality would not be significant.
- 8.11.2. I note that the application of fertilisers is regulated under the European Union (Good Agricultural Practice for Protection of Waters) Regulations, as amended. The regulations contain specific measures to protect surface waters and groundwater from nutrient pollution arising from agricultural sources. I note that an Appropriate

Assessment was completed as part of Ireland's fifth Nitrates Action Programme (NAP) 2022-2025, which is given effect by the European Communities (Good Agricultural Practice for Protection of Waters) Regulations 2022, and concluded that the programme would not adversely affect the integrity of any European Site. Notwithstanding this, the Board should note that the carrying out of landspreading does not form part of this application.

8.11.3. I conclude that the proposed development would have no likely significant effect in combination with other plans and projects on the qualifying features of any European sites. No further assessment is required for the project.

#### 8.12. <u>Mitigation Measures.</u>

8.12.1. The Board should note that I have not taken into account any measures intended to reduce or avoid any harmful effect on the Lower River Shannon SAC or any other European Site. Condition no.3 of the Planning Authority's notification to grant relates to compliance with the Good Agricultural Practice regulations. I consider this to be a standard requirement for such development and is not a measure designed to mitigate any potential effect on the SAC.

#### 8.13. Screening Determination

I conclude that the proposed development would not have a likely significant effect on any European Site, either alone or in combination with other plans or projects. It is, therefore, determined that Appropriate Assessment (stage 2) [under Section 177V of the Planning and Development Act 2000] is not required.

#### This conclusion is based on

- The limited zone of influence of potential impacts, restricted to the immediate vicinity of the proposed development.
- Standard pollution controls that would be employed regardless of proximity to a European site and effectiveness of same,
- Distance from European Sites,
- Impacts predicted would not affect the conservation objectives.

No measures intended to avoid or reduce harmful effects on European sites were taken into account in reaching this conclusion.

#### 9.0 Recommendation

9.1. I recommend that permission is granted for the following reasons and considerations.

#### 10.0 Reasons and Consideration

10.1. Having regard to the nature and scale of the proposed development within an established agricultural farmyard, it is considered that, subject to compliance with the conditions set out below, the proposed development would not seriously injure the visual amenity of the area and would be acceptable in terms of public health and environmental sustainability. The proposed development would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

#### 11.0 Conditions

1. The development shall be retained and completed in accordance with the plans and particulars lodged with the application, except as may otherwise be required in order to comply with the following conditions. Where such conditions require details to be agreed with the planning authority, the developer shall agree such details in writing with the planning authority prior to commencement of development and the development shall be carried out and completed in accordance with the agreed particulars.

Reason: In the interest of clarity.

2. The buildings shall be used for agricultural/horticultural storage and associated purposes only. The building shall not be used for human habitation or any commercial purpose other than a purpose incidental to farming/horticulture, whether or not such use might otherwise constitute

exempted development.

Reason: In the interest of orderly development and the amenities of the area.

3. The finishes of the proposed development shall match the existing farm complex buildings.

Reason: In the interest of visual amenity

4. The proposed development shall be designed, cited, constructed and operated in accordance with the requirements as outlined in the European Union (Good Agricultural Practice for Protection of Waters) (Amendment) Regulations, 2022, as amended.

The applicant shall provide for the relevant (location dependent) storage requirements as outlined in schedule 3 of the aforementioned regulations. The landspreading of soiled waters and slurry shall be carried out in strict accordance with the requirements as outlined in the aforementioned regulations. Prior to the commencement of the development details showing how the applicant intends to comply with this requirement shall be submitted to and agreed in writing with the Planning Authority.

NOTE: Where 20% or more of the holding lies within one or more counties of higher storage requirement as specified the holding shall be deemed for the purposes of the European Union (Good Agricultural Practice for the protection of waters) (Amendment) Regulations 2022, as amended, to lie wholly within the county in relation to which the longest storage period is specified.

Reason: In order to avoid pollution and to protect residential amenity.

5. All uncontaminated roof water from buildings and clean yard water shall be separately collected and discharged in a sealed system to existing drains, watercourses or to appropriately sized soakaways. Uncontaminated waters shall not be allowed to discharge to soiled water and/or slurry tanks or to the public road.

Reason: In order to ensure that the capacity of soiled water tanks are reserved for their specific purposes.

6. The developer shall pay to the planning authority a financial contribution in respect of public infrastructure and facilities benefiting development in the area of the planning authority that is provided or intended to be provided by or on behalf of the authority in accordance with the terms of the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended. The contribution shall be paid prior to commencement of development or in such phased payments as the planning authority may facilitate and shall be subject to any applicable indexation provisions of the Scheme at the time of payment. Details of the application of the terms of the Scheme shall be agreed between the planning authority and the developer or, in default of such agreement, the matter shall be referred to An Bord Pleanála to determine the proper application of the terms of the Scheme.

Reason: It is a requirement of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, that a condition requiring a contribution in accordance with the Development Contribution Scheme made under section 48 of the Act be applied to the permission.

I confirm that this report represents my professional planning assessment, judgement and opinion on the matter assigned to me and that no person has influenced or sought to influence, directly or indirectly, the exercise of my professional judgement in an improper or inappropriate way.

Peter Nelson Senior Planning Inspector

17 October 2024

# Appendix 1 - Form 1

# **EIA Pre-Screening**

[EIAR not submitted]

An Bord Pleanála Case Reference			318156			
Proposed Development Summary		relopment	Retention of a slatted loose shed with an underground effluent tank and permission to construct a slatted loose shed with an underground effluent tank, roofed manure stead area and all associated site works.			
Development Address			Gortshane, Newport, Co	. Tipperary		
	•	•	velopment come within the definition of a			Х
	nvolvin	g constructi	es of EIA? on works, demolition, or interventions in the		No	
Plan	2. Is the proposed development of a class specified in Part 1 or Part 2, Schedule 5, Planning and Development Regulations 2001 (as amended) and does it equal or exceed any relevant quantity, area or limit where specified for that class?					
Yes						landatory required
No	Х				Proce	eed to Q.3
3. Is the proposed development of a class specified in Part 2, Schedule 5, Planning and Development Regulations 2001 (as amended) but does not equal or exceed a relevant quantity, area or other limit specified [sub-threshold development]?						
			Threshold	Comment	С	conclusion
				(if relevant)		
No	X		N/A		Prelir	IAR or ninary nination red
Yes					Proce	eed to Q.4

4. Has Schedule 7A information been submitted?			
No	Preliminary Examination required		
Yes	Screening Determination required		

Inspector: I	Date:
--------------	-------