

Submission No.		287		
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter		Tanat Limited		
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
RE: SUBMISSION ON THE METROLINK ON BEHALF OF TANAT LIMITED REGARDING A SITE BOUND BY GEORGE'S QUAY TO THE NORTH, TARA STREET TO THE WEST AND POOLBEG STREET TO THE SOUTH.				
1	Introduction	3	<p>Our client, Tanat Limited, welcomes the opportunity to make a submission on the Railway Order for the MetroLink line.</p> <p>Our client has a number of observations and concerns in relation to the Railway Order. This submission is broken down under the following headings:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Site Location and Context 2. Planning History of the Site 3. Engineering Considerations <p>The following is enclosed with this submission:</p> <p>Technical Note prepared by CS Consulting Engineers Observation fee of €50</p>	Thank you for the submission. We have reviewed the submission and provided detailed responses for the issues and concerns raised below.
2	Planning History of the Site	5	<p>The below gives a brief outlined of the most relevant recent planning permissions on site:</p> <p>DCC Req. Ref.: 3794/18 / ABP-302980-18 Planning permission was granted on the 2nd April 2019 by An Bord Pleanala following a 1 st party appeal for a development consisting of a 22 no. storey landmark hotel and office building with a rooftop restaurant over 2 no. levels of basement accommodation. The development included for an upgrade to the public concourse serving Tara Street Station. The maximum height of the building is permitted at 88m. The development accommodates hotel use from 1 st to 4th floor with office accommodation from 5th to 20th floor.</p> <p>DCC Req. Ref.: 4054/19 Planning permission was granted on the 7th January 2020 by Dublin City Council to provide for the internal reconfiguration of the permitted development to provide for 1 no. additional floor increase the development to 23 no. storeys. There is no change to the overall height of the permitted development as a result of the internal reconfiguration. There is an increase of 1,435 sq.m, as a result of the development.</p> <p>DCC Req. Ref.: 4365/20 / ABP-308481 -20 Planning permission was granted on the 12th March 2021 by An Bord Pleanala following a 1 st party appeal for a development which consisted of the change of use from hotel to office accommodation at 1 st to 4th floor. The development also included for the change of use at ground floor level from hotel/restaurant foyer to restaurant/cafe/retail foyer and the change of use from hotel/office to retail/cafe/restaurant at 5 the floor level.</p>	Thank you for this information. As part of the Chapter 30: Cumulative impacts of interaction between other projects and MetroLink, the development as referenced in planning applications 3794/18 & 4054/19 was assessed alongside the proposed Project during the Construction & Operational Phases. Please also refer to EIAR Appendix A30.1 Stage 1 & 2, Appendix A30.2 Stage 2 & 3 Cumulative Impact Assessment Table(s). In relation to DCC Req. Ref.: 4365/20 and subsequent ABP-308481 -20 appeal, this was captured in the data gathering exercise but it was not brought through to assessment as the works are change of use and therefore minor in nature.

Submission No.	287
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter	Tanat Limited

Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
-----------------	---------------------	-----------------	------------------------------	---------------------

RE: SUBMISSION ON THE METROLINK ON BEHALF OF TANAT LIMITED REGARDING A SITE BOUND BY GEORGE’S QUAY TO THE NORTH, TARA STREET TO THE WEST AND POOLBEG STREET TO THE SOUTH.

3	Engineering Considerations (paragraph 1)	6	A note has been prepared by CS Consulting and is included as Appendix 1 of this submission. The Railway Order applies for a vertical deviation of 5 metres, however, the existing formation level of the basement is at -11.15m and the crown of the tunnel is at - 17.4m, leaving a 6.3m gap between the tunnel and the basement of the building. Whilst it is understood a deviation may be required due to detailed design or conditions encountered, the result of such a deviation in relation to the subject property is potential minimal distances of construction from substructure and increased impacts arising in relation to noise, vibration and associated building damage. The note from CS Consulting states:	<p>The design includes for a limit of deviation which is required to allow for unforeseen obstructions and construction tolerances which may necessitate a change to the alignment. In the highly unlikely event that this were to occur, any resulting environmental impacts will comply with the limits set by the enforceable Railway Order.</p> <p>TII has carried out a comprehensive set of ground investigations in accordance with relevant guidelines and best practice. It has a high confidence that MetroLink can be constructed along the proposed alignment without requiring vertical or horizontal adjustment. However, in order to guard against rare and undetectable subterranean conditions that might interfere with construction, the Railway Order provides for limits of deviation (as have other railway authorisation since at least the 1840s). The impacts of potential changes within the Limits of Deviation are considered in the Wider Effects Report (Appendix A5.19).</p> <p>Cumulative impacts assessed for this property are outline within Appendix A30.2 Stage 2 &3 Cumulative Impact Assessment Table.</p> <p>As the detail design progresses and in advance of construction commencement the main works contractor appointed by TII to deliver the Project will produce a Construction Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) for review and approval by Dublin City Council.</p> <p>An outline of the CEMP is provided in Appendix 5.1 of the EIAR and has been prepared to provide a framework for the management and mitigation of all Environmental impacts from the Project during the construction phase.</p> <p>A key part of the Outline CEMP is the proposed approach to noise and vibration monitoring during the construction phase, detailed within section 6.2 and Table 6.2. The CEMP will contain the Construction Noise and Vibration Management Plan (CNVMP), which requires that the contractor undertakes a full monitoring and auditing programme of the works which will be agreed with Dublin City Council prior to the commencement of the construction phase</p>
4	Engineering Considerations (paragraph 2)	6	“As there is only a 6.3 metre dimension from the crown of the tunnel and the formation level of our concrete raft foundation, the above section 6.(d) ii. would not be acceptable, in which we would request that writing confirmation is needs to be provided by our client before on any deviations from the current -17.4 metre level below existing ground as indicated on the current sections.	Please refer to repose item number (3) first paragraph above.
5	Engineering Considerations (paragraph 3)	6	Also, we seek writing confirmation from the NTA and TII that the MetroLink will not impede our ability to construct or maintain/operate our building/basement in the future.”	As has been discussed and documented between TII and Tanat, the two projects are compatible and hence the basement can be built, operated and maintained.
6	Engineering Considerations (paragraph 4)	6	Our client also seeks confirmation that there will be no vent shafts located on the subject site which would impact its future development. The note by CS Consulting states: “Your proposed building has a reinforced concrete raft foundation supported on the underlying rock which will ensure the load spread of the rock strata to minimise local future loading on the underground tunnel. We would request that this proposal is acceptable and can be catered for in the future. Please confirm that no vent shafts or the likes to service the underground tunnels are to be located on our site as this would be problematic both now and for future development.”	There are no vent shafts or other MetroLink assets are planned to be constructed on your site.

Submission No.		287		
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter		Tanat Limited		
RE: SUBMISSION ON THE METROLINK ON BEHALF OF TANAT LIMITED REGARDING A SITE BOUND BY GEORGE'S QUAY TO THE NORTH, TARA STREET TO THE WEST AND POOLBEG STREET TO THE SOUTH.				
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
7	Engineering Considerations (paragraph 5)	6	Lastly, our client is requesting confirmation from TII and the NTA that they are satisfied the MetroLink tunnel and associated works will not impede our clients ability to construct the permitted 23 storey office scheme on the site or any other future permission, and is entirely compatible with same.	<p>TII confirm that the 23 storey scheme can be constructed prior to MetroLink-</p> <p>ALG/MT: Suggest deletion of the above and inclusion of the following text:</p> <p>TII will be required to make submissions in relation to planning applications for proposed future developments on or adjacent to MetroLink and there will necessarily be some engineering constraints (such as permissible loadings) required. However MetroLink is committed to engaging with known development proposals and new development proposals as they emerge with the intent of facilitating such developments as they emerge to the maximum extent consistent with the safe operation of the proposed Project.</p> <p>Again in common with other existing rail and tunnel projects, following grant of the Railway Order and development of detailed design, TII will produce "Guidance Note for Developers" that will be the subject of bye-laws following the grant of Railway Order and which is designed to facilitate future adjacent or over-site development while protecting the integrity and safety of the MetroLink works and operations. It is inappropriate and unworkable to produce this policy at this stage because it would have to be in broad terms that deal not only with the current RO proposal and any contingencies that might arise from the Board seeking revised designs or new conditionality as part of the RO application process.</p> <p>Therefore at this stage TII is dealing with known development proposals on a case by case basis, TII will work with parties in the future to assist with the wider development of sites over and above stations and tunnels. In this context TII has successfully engaged with a number of developers over the last two years to accommodate development over and in proximity to the alignment and there have been no material restrictions on development subject to the implementation of agreed design and mitigation measures and it is not anticipated that MetroLink will have a material impact on the development potential of sites above and in proximity to the alignment in future.</p>
7	Concluding Comments	6	<p>Our client welcomes the submission of the Railway Order and the sustainable transport benefits which would be delivered. Our client acknowledges that a scheme of this scale will result in significant impacts however these should be carefully managed to minimise the effects on the surrounding landholdings.</p> <p>Our client reserves the right to elaborate further on these issues as necessary should the Board decide to hold an oral hearing or require any clarification and would welcome any responses from the applicant. Our client also reserves the right to ensure that the development potential above and below ground of the lands in question are not compromised by the MetroLink proposal.</p> <p>We trust this submission will be taken into consideration in assessing the proposals.</p>	An overview of the Oral Hearing process is provided in the EIAR Chapter 8.9.2. The Board has confirmed an Oral Hearing will take place.
8	APPENDIX 1: NOTE PREPARED BY CS CONSULTING GROUP (paragraph 2)	11	Our proposed building has a reinforced concrete raft foundation supported on the underlying rock which will ensure the load spread of the rock strata to minimise local future loading on the underground tunnel. Please confirm that no vent shafts or the likes to service the underground tunnels are to be located on our site as this would be problematic both now and for future development. Vibration limits due to the construction of the MetroLink tunnel or any construction activities adjacent to our site need to be agreed prior to commencement of construction, along with a movement monitoring protocol to be put in place to monitor the vertical movement of our building during at after construction of the Metrolink tunnel and adjacent works.	<p>Please refer to Item 7. Furthermore, Chapter 14 of the EIAR discusses vibration threshold levels during construction and operation of the railway in Section 14.2.1.2 in terms of both potential for structural damage and human response. The threshold levels used in the assessment presented in the EIAR are based on human response, which are much lower levels than those relevant to building damage.</p> <p>With regard to structural or settlement monitoring, TII will procure its contractors to develop Instrumentation and Monitoring Plans in tandem with Monitoring Action Plans. These plans will help assure that the risks associated with tunnelling and station excavations impacting third party property are appropriately managed and controlled. TII will provide details of any monitoring proposed by the contractor at detailed design and agree the methodology to instal to your property. TII will provide advance notice of any attendance that the monitoring contractor may require.</p>
9	APPENDIX 1: NOTE PREPARED BY CS CONSULTING GROUP (paragraph 3)	11	We have had previous engagements with MetroLink regarding our proposed building and formation level of our raft slab foundation in which the National Transport Authority (NTA) and the Transport Infrastructure Ireland (TII) are satisfied that the proposed development will not impede their ability to construct the MetroLink tunnel and associated works in the future. Note these discussions are refer to in attached correspondence	Thank you for the information. It has been noted and agreed by the project team.

Submission No.			287	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Tanat Limited	
RE: SUBMISSION ON THE METROLINK ON BEHALF OF TANAT LIMITED REGARDING A SITE BOUND BY GEORGE'S QUAY TO THE NORTH, TARA STREET TO THE WEST AND POOLBEG STREET TO THE SOUTH.				
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
10	CS Consulting Letter to NTA	14	<p>In relation to the above mentioned application for the applicant, Tanat Ltd. we write to you on behalf of our client to ask if you/NTA can provide a letter for our inclusion in our planning application submission stating that our development will not impact the delivery of the MetroLink.</p> <p>A Pre-planning meeting was held on the 18th July 2018 at the NTA offices along with the TII and DCC present to discuss the proposed application in relation to the planned alignment and station location for the MetroLink. Further correspondence took place between ourselves/CS Consulting, TII and the MetroLink Design Engineers.</p> <p>In our discussions the main principal items were discussed and agreed</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Metrolink Station Access location. - See attached drawing TII drawing with MetroLink Station Access located South of Poolbeg street and therefore no impact on our basement or ground floor layout. Appendix A 2. Foundation levels and Secant pile depths in relation to top of MetroLink Tunnel - See attached email correspondence from TH with a number of queries and CS Consulting response addressing each point. Appendix B Further request from TII (Aidan Foley email on the 07/08/2018) with regards to the proximity of the proposed secant pile wall from the external face of the MetroLink Tunnel. See attached our response letter. Appendix C <p>Also see attached our drawings indicating basement levels, ground floor and the pedestrian circulation through our site. Appendix D</p> <p>Therefore, as note above we ask if you/NTA can provide a letter for our inclusion in our planning application submission stating that our development will not impact the delivery of the MetroLink.</p>	<p>NTA have provided a consent letter to the planning application (ref. 3794/18) on 20th August 2018. Following amendments to the previous application and reports provided by Byrne Looby, NTA have issued another consent letter on 27th August 2020 and requested continued liaison with the NTA and TII.</p> <p>No Response Required</p>