



**Appendix E**  
MCA Tables –  
Kilmore Road Junction  
to Killester Avenue

## Appendix E: MCA Table - Kilmore Road Junction to Killester Avenue

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	PRO Proposal	Option 1	Option 2
Economy (Cost Assessment and Transport Economic Indicators)	Capital Cost	Total - €0.4M Cost per KM - €2.7M Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Cost - €0.32 M Private Land Costs - €0.08M	Total - €0.3M Cost per KM - €2.0M Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Cost - €0.27M Private Land Costs - €0.03M	Total - €0.3M Cost per KM - €2.0M Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Cost - €0.27M Private Land Costs - €0.03M
	Rank			
	Journey-time reliability and Consistency	Continuous southbound bus and orthbound bus lanes.. Cycle lanes provided in both directions.	Continuous Northbound bus lanes.Cycle lanes provided in both directions.  Signal Controlled Priority for Southbound buses that would be located at Danieli Road would control all inbound traffic. This would significantly increase the delay to all inbound traffic including traffic from Kilmore Road.	Continuous southbound bus lanes.Cycle lanes provided in both directions.  Signal Controlled Priority for northbound buses that would be located at ilmre Road. would control all inbound traffic. This could potentially increase the delay to outbound traffic and traffic from Kilmore Road.
Rank				
Integration	Land Use Integration	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	Rank			
	Total residential and employment (10 Mins)	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	Rank			
	Public Transport Integration	Options considered equal under this criterion	Significantl the delay to Bus traffic including Bus traffic from Kilmore Road.	Potentially increased delay to outbound Bus traffic and Bus traffic from Kilmore Road.
	Rank			
	Traffic Network Integration	No traffic diversions as part of this option	Significantl the delay to all inbound traffic including traffic from Kilmore Road.	Potentially increased delay to outbound traffic and traffic from Kilmore Road.
Rank				
Accessibility & Social Inclusion	Cyclists and pedestrian Integration	Cycle lanes provided in both directions for whole length	Cyclists in both directions diverted around Haverty/Carleton Rd or share the bus lanes	Northbound cycle lane provided, southbound cyclists share the bus lane or divert via Hegarty Road , 2 crossing movements.
	Rank			
	High Volume Trip Attractors (Education, Health, Commercial,	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
Rank				
Safety	Deprived Geographic Areas	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	Rank			
Archaeology, Architectural and Cultural Heritage	Road Safety	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	Rank			
	Zone of Archaeological Potential (ZAP)	Does not transverse ZAP	Does not transverse ZAP	Does not transverse ZAP
		Record of Monument and Places (RMP)	No RMP located in area	No RMP located in area
		Archaeological Conservation Areas	Not a rchaeological Conservation Area.	Not a rchaeological Conservation Area.
		Summary	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	Rank			
	Flora and Fauna	EU Sites	There are no European or Nationally designated Sites of Conservation of Importance downstream of this route option in Dublin Bay.	There are no European or Nationally designated Sites of Conservation of Importance downstream of this route option in Dublin Bay.
		Ecological Land Take	Land take will be greatest along this scheme and will include loss of garden frontage including planted trees and other planted recreational features.	Land-take will result in the loss of garden frontage resulting in impacts on flora and fauna. Although, a lower number of private gardens would be impacted than PRO Proposal.
		Areas of high ecological values	The route option would impinge on garden frontage which is of low ecological potential or connectivity for foraging and breeding birds or foraging bats with low impacts to flora and fauna.	The route option would impinge on garden frontage which is of low ecological potential or connectivity for foraging and breeding birds or foraging bats with low impacts to flora and fauna.
		Riparian environment	There are no watercourses through this stretch of the Malahide Road.	There are no watercourses through this stretch of the Malahide Road.

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	PRO Proposal	Option 1	Option 2	
Environment	Invasive Species	Records for a number of medium impact invasive alien species have been obtained from the National Biodiversity Database. Three-cornered Garlic, Buddleja and Traveller's Joy are noted to occur along this scheme.	Records for a number of medium impact invasive alien species have been obtained from the National Biodiversity Database. Three-cornered Garlic, Buddleja and Traveller's Joy are noted to occur along this scheme.	Records for a number of medium impact invasive alien species have been obtained from the National Biodiversity Database. Three-cornered Garlic, Buddleja and Traveller's Joy are noted to occur along this scheme.	
	Protected Species	Records for a number of protected species have been obtained from the National Biodiversity	Records for a number of protected species have been obtained from the National Biodiversity	Records for a number of protected species have been obtained from the National Biodiversity	
	Summary	Minor impacts to flora and fauna are expected along this scheme.	Minor impacts to flora and fauna are expected along this scheme, however Lower than PRO Proposal.	Minor impacts to flora and fauna are expected along this scheme, however Lower than PRO Proposal.	
	<b>Rank</b>				
	Soils and Geology	Groundwater Vulnerability	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Bedrock Geology	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Bedrock Aquifer	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Geological Heritage Site	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Industrial Emissions Directive (IED)/Integrated Pollution Control (IPC) facilities (potential)	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Soils	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Landtake and geology	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Summary	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	<b>Rank</b>				
	Hydrology	Fluvial Areas of flood risk (AEP 10%)	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Fluvial Areas of flood risk (AEP 1%)	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Flood Management Plans	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		OPW National Flood Hazards Map	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		Pluvial Flood Risk (AEP 10%)	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
		CFRAMS	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	Summary	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	
	<b>Rank</b>				
	Landscape and Visual	Tree Protection/Preservation:	Low/Medium Impact: Removal of small trees/hedges from private land required. Removal of 2 large trees	Tree Protection/Preservation: Low Impact: Removal of small trees/hedges from private land required	Tree Protection/Preservation: Low Impact: Removal of small trees/hedges from private land required. Removal of 2 large trees
		Visual Impact on Properties:	Potential Medium Impact - Impact to some properties on Malahide Road Impact on Streetscape/Townscape: Med Impact to Malahide Road	Visual Impact on Properties: Potential Low Impact - Minor impact to some properties on Malahide Road Impact on Streetscape/Townscape: Low Impact to Malahide Road	Visual Impact on Properties: Potential Low/Medium Impact - Minor impact to some properties on Malahide Road Impact on Streetscape/Townscape: Low/Medium Impact to Malahide Road
	<b>Rank</b>				
	Qualitative noise assessment	There will be some instances where the proposed scheme will result in traffic being relocated closer to sensitive receptors due to road widening. Should traffic be moved closer to sensitive receptors (or traffic volumes increase), there may be an increase in noise.	There will be some instances where the proposed scheme will result in traffic being relocated closer to sensitive receptors due to road widening. Should traffic be moved closer to sensitive receptors (or traffic volumes increase), there may be an increase in noise.	There will be some instances where the proposed scheme will result in traffic being relocated closer to sensitive receptors due to road widening on the eastern side, bus lanes on both sides of the roads would increase noise at sensitive receptors compared to option 2. Should traffic be moved closer to sensitive receptors (or traffic volumes increase), there may be an increase in noise.	

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	PRO Proposal	Option 1	Option 2
Noise & Vibration	Geodriectory (Building types)	A review of An Post Geodirectory data indicated that Building use along the Malahide Road is predominately residential. There is some commercial building use at the northern end of the scheme between the junction of Copeland Avenue and Charlemont Road. The southern end of Malahide Road between the junction of Crescent Place and Marino Crescent is predominately commercial and with some both residential & commercial use.  Building use along the section at Fairview Park is predominately commercial, while building use along Annesley Bridge Road is predominately residential.	A review of An Post Geodirectory data indicated that Building use along the Malahide Road is predominately residential. There is some commercial building use at the northern end of the scheme between the junction of Copeland Avenue and Charlemont Road. The southern end of Malahide Road between the junction of Crescent Place and Marino Crescent is predominately commercial and with some both residential & commercial use.  Building use along the section at Fairview Park is predominately commercial, while building use along Annesley Bridge Road is predominately residential.	A review of An Post Geodirectory data indicated that Building use along the Malahide Road is predominately residential. There is some commercial building use at the northern end of the scheme between the junction of Copeland Avenue and Charlemont Road. The southern end of Malahide Road between the junction of Crescent Place and Marino Crescent is predominately commercial and with some both residential & commercial use.  Building use along the section at Fairview Park is predominately commercial, while building use along Annesley Bridge Road is predominately residential.
	Sensitive Receptors	There is one Creche (25 Malahide Rd), 2 educational establishments (Mario College, St. Joseph's CBS Secondary School) and 1 place of worship (Fairview hall), and 1 area of high amenity (Fairview Park) along the scheme option that meets the EPA definition of a noise sensitive location.	There is one Creche (25 Malahide Rd), 2 educational establishments (Mario College, St. Joseph's CBS Secondary School) and 1 place of worship (Fairview hall), and 1 area of high amenity (Fairview Park) along the scheme option that meets the EPA definition of a noise sensitive location.	There is one Creche (25 Malahide Rd), 2 educational establishments (Mario College, St. Joseph's CBS Secondary School) and 1 place of worship (Fairview hall), and 1 area of high amenity (Fairview Park) along the scheme option that meets the EPA definition of a noise sensitive location.
	Land take	There will be some instances of private land acquisition along the Malahide Road. In addition, there will be some instances of public land acquisition along the Malahide Road and along the R105 at Fairview Park	There will be some instances of private land acquisition along the Malahide Road. In addition, there will be some instances of public land acquisition along the Malahide Road and along the R105 at Fairview Park	There will be some instances of private land acquisition along the Malahide Road. In addition, there will be some instances of public land acquisition along the Malahide Road and along the R105 at Fairview Park
	Summary	The route option has the potential for both positive and negative impacts to the existing noise environment. There are no major issues that have the potential to give rise to significant impacts.	The route option has the potential for both positive and negative impacts to the existing noise environment. There are no major issues that have the potential to give rise to significant impacts.	The route option has the potential for both positive and negative impacts to the existing noise environment. There are no major issues that have the potential to give rise to significant impacts.
	Rank			
Air Quality	Qualitative noise assessment	There will be some instances where the proposed scheme will result in traffic being relocated closer to sensitive receptors due to road widening.  Should traffic be moved closer to sensitive receptors (or traffic volumes increase), there may be an increase in pollutant concentrations.	There will be some instances where the proposed scheme will result in traffic being relocated closer to sensitive receptors due to road widening however Lower than PRO Proposal.  Should traffic be moved closer to sensitive receptors (or traffic volumes increase), there may be an increase in pollutant concentrations however Lower than PRO Proposal.	There will be some instances where the proposed scheme will result in traffic being relocated closer to sensitive receptors due to road widening however Lower than PRO Proposal.  Should traffic be moved closer to sensitive receptors (or traffic volumes increase), there may be an increase in pollutant concentrations however Lower than PRO Proposal.
	Geodriectory (Building types)	Building use along the section of Malahide Road is predominately residential.	Building use along the section of Malahide Road is predominately residential.	Building use along the section of Malahide Road is predominately residential.
	Sensitive Receptors	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion	Options considered equal under this criterion
	Land take	Lantake will be required from	There will be some instances of private land acquisition along the Malahide Road. In addition, there will be some instances of public land acquisition along the Malahide Road and along the R105 at Fairview Park	There will be some instances of private land acquisition along the Malahide Road. In addition, there will be some instances of public land acquisition along the Malahide Road and along the R105 at Fairview Park
	Summary	The route option has the potential for both positive and negative impacts to air quality. There are no major issues that have the potential to give rise to significant impacts.	The route option has the potential for both positive and negative impacts to air quality. There are no major issues that have the potential to give rise to significant impacts.	The route option has the potential for both positive and negative impacts to air quality. There are no major issues that have the potential to give rise to significant impacts.
Rank				

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	PRO Proposal	Option 1	Option 2
	Land Use and Built Environment	<p>Land acquisition will be required from 8 Properties Private parking within front gardens may also be removed with no alternative on-street parking available along both sides of Malahide Road. Positive impacts will include the provision of north and southbound cycle lanes.</p> <p>Overall changes to land-use including land-acquisition are expected along this scheme</p>	<p>Land acquisition will be required from 7 Properties Private parking within front gardens may also be removed with no alternative on-street parking available along both sides of Malahide Road however the impact will be lower than the PRO Proposal. Positive impacts will include the provision of north and southbound cycle lanes.</p> <p>Overall changes to land-use including land-acquisition are expected along this scheme however the impact will be lower than the PRO Proposal</p>	<p>Land acquisition will be required from 7 Properties Private parking within front gardens may also be removed with no alternative on-street parking available along both sides of Malahide Road however the impact will be lower than the PRO Proposal. Positive impacts will include the provision of north and southbound cycle lanes.</p> <p>Overall changes to land-use including land-acquisition are expected along this scheme however the impact will be lower than the PRO Proposal</p>
	<i>Rank</i>			



**Údarás Náisiúnta Iompair**  
National Transport Authority

National Transport Authority  
Dún Scéine  
Harcourt Lane  
Dublin 2  
D02 WT20



**Project Ireland 2040**  
*Building Ireland's Future*