



Appendix D3

Detailed Multi-Criteria
Analyses of Route
Options in Section 3

Appendix D3 – Section 3 Multi-Criteria Assessment Tables

Table 6.4 – Evaluation of Options for Cycling Facilities in Section 3: Clanbrassil Street & New Street South

Assessment Criterion	Assessment Sub-Criterion	Option A	Option B
		Quiet Street Cycle Route through Portobello	Cycle Tracks on Clanbrassil Street & New Street
Economy (Cost Assessment and Transport Economic Indicators)	Capital Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Existing quiet street route requiring some infrastructural intervention such as a boardwalk linking Grove Road to Kingsland Parade.	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Modifications required to kerb lines to accommodate segregated cycling facilities.
		Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a
	Rank		
	Journey Time Reliability (Bus)	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
Economy			
Integration	Policy Integration	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Transport Network Integration	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Cycling Integration	Cyclists will be required to share the some of the route with low traffic. Will require cyclists to cross major junctions to access the route. Longer route leading cyclists away from the main route towards the City Centre	Direct and shortest route for all cyclists. May require cyclists to cross major junctions to access.
	Rank		
	Traffic Network Integration	Local traffic closure required at Heytesbury Road to divert traffic volumes away from the quiet streets.	No change to existing
Rank			
Integration			
Accessibility and Social Inclusion	Key Trip Attractors (Education / Health / Commercial / Employment)	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Deprived Geographic Areas	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
Accessibility & Social Inclusion			
Safety	Road Safety	Cyclists will be required to share narrow streets with low traffic, increasing the potential for difficult avoidance maneuvers by vehicles due the diversion of a potentially significant volume of cyclists	Fully segregated facilities mitigating the potential for any vehicular interactions with the cyclists
	Rank		
Safety			
Environment	Archaeology & Cultural Heritage	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Flora & Fauna / Biodiversity	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Soils & Geology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Hydrology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Landscape & Visual	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Air & Noise	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank		
	Land Use and the Built Environment	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
Rank			
Environment			
Preference Rank		2	1

Table 6.5 – Evaluation of Options for Widening of Emmett Bridge in Section 3 - Clanbrassil Street & New Street South

Assessment Criterion	Assessment Sub-Criterion	Option A Western Footbridge	Option B Bridge Widening	Option C Two Footbridges
Economy (Cost Assessment and Transport Economic Indicators)	Capital Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Some capital cost required in the construction of the independent bridge	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Substantial capital costs required to widen the existing bridge. Would require significant traffic management measures and road closers to facilitate construction.	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Some capital cost required in the construction of two independent bridges
		Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a
	Rank			
	Journey Time Reliability (Bus)	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
Economy				
Integration	Policy Integration	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Transport Network Integration	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Cycling Integration	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Traffic Network Integration	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
Rank				
Integration				
Accessibility and Social Inclusion	Key Trip Attractors (Education / Health / Commercial / Employment)	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Deprived Geographic Areas	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
Rank				
Accessibility & Social Inclusion				
Safety	Road Safety	The provision of a bridge on the western side of the bridge will provide significantly improved facilities for cyclists. However, to accommodate a separate bus lane on the existing bridge the footpath widths will be narrowed.	Widening the bridge will provide significantly improved facilities for cyclists and will not require negatively impacting the existing footpath provision.	Providing two independent bridges either side of the existing bridge will provide significantly improved facilities for cyclists and pedestrians.
	Rank			
Safety				
Environment	Archaeology & Cultural Heritage	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Flora & Fauna / Biodiversity	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Soils & Geology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Hydrology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank			
	Landscape & Visual	Potential visual impact for existing bridge on west side only however the proposed structure will be designed with a slender deck to minimise the impact on the visibility of the historic bridge	Widening the bridge will impact the historic canal harbour and channel by increasing the footprint of the bridge.	Potential visual impact for existing bridge on both sides of the bridge however the proposed structure will be designed with a slender deck to minimise the impact on the visibility of the historic bridge
	Rank			
Air & Noise	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	
Rank				

Assessment Criterion	Assessment Sub-Criterion	Option A Western Footbridge	Option B Bridge Widening	Option C Two Footbridges
	Land Use and the Built Environment	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>			
Environment				
	Preference Rank	2	3	1